**The Impact of the arts in health care on patients and service users: A critical review**

**Abstract**

This review provides an updated evaluation of the emerging body of literature on the value of the arts in healthcare settings. Internationally there is growing interest in the use of the arts in the health care context supported by the number of research studies reported in the nursing and medical literature. There is evidence that arts interventions have positive effects on psychological and physiological outcomes on patients in a hospital environment. A critical review of the literature between 2011 and 2016was undertaken. The following databases were searched: MedLine, CINAHL, AMED, Web of Science and ASSIA. Searches included words from three categories: cultural activities; outcomes and healthcare settings. Initial searches identified 131 potentially relevant articles. Following screening and review by the research team a total of 69 studies were included in the final review. The majority of studies examined the effect of music listening on patients/service users (76.8%). These studies were primarily quantitative focusing on the measurable effects of music listening in a surgical context. Overall, the studies in the review support the growing evidence base on the value of the arts in a variety of healthcare settings for patients/service users. The review findings suggest that now is the time for different voices and art forms to be considered and represented in the research on arts in health care. Further research is also required to strengthen the existing evidence base.

**Keywords:**

Arts and health, health care, well-being, cultural activities, art interventions,

What is known about this topic

* There is a growing recognition of the value of the arts in improving well-being, health and health care.
* Evidence of the positive effects of music interventions on both psychological and physiological outcomes for patients in health care environments.
* Literature concerning participation in the arts in healthcare settings is complex and wide ranging, with terms often used interchangeably and inconsistently.

What this paper adds

* Further evidence that strongly attests to the positive impact of arts activities in health care.
* The evidence base remains narrow in relation to methodological approach and health care setting.
* Proposes that different voices, art forms and methodologies are considered in the research on the arts in health care.

**Introduction**

The application of the arts in health care has steadily developed globally, within Western bio-medical models (Wilson et al., 2016, All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing, 2017). Historically, Broderick (2011) argues that health care was founded on providing medical interventions for acute episodes and infectious diseases, as these were the predominant causes of mortality of the time. The medical model of health care that developed was predicated on the principles of the eradication of illness through diagnosis and effective treatment. With increased life expectancy, chronic and degenerative diseases have replaced infectious disease, leading to a shift in the model of health care provided to a more social model, with an emphasis on the multiple and interrelated factors influencing health (Broderick, 2011). Since the publication of the Marmot Review (Marmot et al., 2010), in the UK the social determinants of health have increasingly underpinned current government policy, and Sonke et al. (2009) suggest that the movement, towards a more integrative and social model of health, has opened the space for creative arts activities in health care.

Globally, over the past 30 years there has been a widening in practice of the arts in a wide range of healthcare settings. The growing recognition of the arts having an important role to play in improving the health and well-being of individuals has been a key driver (Leckey, 2011). In the UK the Department of Health (DH) published, in partnership with the Arts Council England (ACE), the ‘*Report of the Review of Arts and Health Working Group*’ (DH, 2007). The report concluded that the arts are integral to health, health care provision and healthcare environments (DH, 2007). Following on from this the DH, again in partnership with ACE, produced ‘*A prospectus for arts in health*’ illustrating how the arts make a major contribution to key health and wider community issues (ACE, 2007). Overall the prospectus promoted the benefits of the arts in improving well-being, health and health care and its role in supporting health care staff and caregivers. However, the potential for these reports to make an impact was limited by the global financial crisis in 2008, and the ensuing austerity measures that were implemented with cuts to public services and the arts (Wiesand, 2011). In terms of funding for the NHS it is not only the economic climate that has led to budget restraint, but also the shift towards neoliberalism following the change in government in 2010 (Pownall, 2013). Lord Howarth (previously Minister of Arts 1998-2001) suggested that the global financial crisis dominated UK policy thinking, with austerity cuts supplanting earlier optimism and willingness to explore more creative and imaginative paths with the arts in health care (Howarth, 2013). Yet despite this the recent publication of *Creative Health: The Arts for Health and Wellbeing* (All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing, 2017) signals new possibilities for influencing policy makers and health care commissioners to re-consider the potential to embed such approaches into mainstream health care.

here is increasing recognition that creative arts have

an important role to play in improving the health and

well-being of individuals; this is supported by the growing

evidence of the effectiveness of the arts in mental health

care (Arts Council England 2007).

here is increasing recognition that creative arts have

an important role to play in improving the health and

well-being of individuals; this is supported by the growing

evidence of the effectiveness of the arts in mental health

care (Arts Council England 2007).

The widening practice and delivery of arts and health projects has come with a recognition of the need to provide a satisfactory evidence base of arts and health interventions to maintain its growth and to convince policy makers of the need to adequately support the arts and health sector (Clift et al., 2009; Sonke, et al., 2009). In response there has been a number of reviews examining the medical literature on the impact of the arts on health. One of the first, by Staricoff (2004), examined and identified a number of benefits to using arts in healthcare settings. In 2011, Staricoff and Clift updated this review, and provided further evidence of the positive effects of arts interventions on psychological and physiological outcome of patients in a hospital environment.

**The review**

This critical review updates Staricoff and Clift’s earlier review (2011) on the value of the arts in healthcare settings, and in light of the publication of the All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing (2017) report is timely as it updates and summarises the evidence on the impact of the arts in health care on patients and service users. It forms one strand of a wider review funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council, as part of their Cultural Values project. The second strand of the review focused on the perceptions of caregivers on the value and impact of the arts in therapeutic and clinical interventions (Wilson et al., 2016).

**Aim**

The aim of this review is examine the impact of the arts in health care on patients and service users since 2011 to 2016.

**Design**

The review reported here fits the definition of a critical review. Critical reviews comprise narrative accounts of available research along with an effective, analytical, original assessment of this information. Such reviews critically compare and contrast the ideas and evidence and identify knowledge gaps (e.g. Jesson & Lacey, 2006). Petticrew and Roberts (2006) define critical reviews as literature reviews that assess a theory or hypothesis by critically examining the methods and results of the studies, but not using the formalised approach of a systematic review. Systematic reviews alternatively comprise comprehensive reviews of published articles selected to address a specific clearly defined question that uses a systematic method of identifying studies, with strict adherence to protocol. The search process is more rule-driven and rigorous and has specific criteria for abstracting data from studies and assessing quality of evidence (e.g. Jesson & Lacey, 2006). The present review comprised a critical review involving mixed-method synthesis whereby quantitative, mixed-method and qualitative evidence was integrated and interpreted (Petticrew & Roberts, 2006). An expert e-advisory group (see acknowledgments) provided strategic inputs to the early planning stages of the review in relation to definitional issues and relevant search terms.

***Search Methods***

Key search terms were identified from those used by Staricoff (2004) and Staricoff and Clift (2011) in addition a scoping exercise determined frequently used terms in the literature. Through this process three core keyword categories were agreed as *cultural activities*, *health-related outcomes* and *healthcare settings*. Within each of these three categories there were a number of sub-key words that are presented in Table 1 below.

[Table 1 about here]

Electronic databases were searched to identify published empirical research. Database searches were carried out using MedLine, CINAHL, AMED, Web of Science and ASSIA. UK and international empirical studies published from 2011 to 2016 written in the English language and which explored the effect of arts activities on health related outcomes in healthcare settings were included. The literature concerning participation in the arts is complex and wide ranging, with terms and definitions often used interchangeably and inconsistently (Skingley, Bungay & Clift, 2011). A broad and diverse range of arts activities informed our interpretation of the arts, and ranged from visual and performing arts, to music, dance, theatre and literature. For the purpose of this review clinical and therapeutic settings refer to inpatient settings (e.g. hospitals), outpatient settings (e.g. outpatient clinics, GP surgeries) and residential care home settings (e.g. hospices, older persons’ care homes). This excludes schools, prisons, community settings, and private residences. Studies reporting on art therapies (art, drama, and music) were also excluded, on the basis that in the therapies, the therapeutic relationship is generally of primary importance rather than the creation of the art/music itself. This review is interested in the intrinsic value of the arts activities rather than seeing them as a means to an end.

**Search Outcome**

Initial searches identified 131 potentially relevant studies. Abstracts and full-texts were divided and shared between the review authors and screened for relevance and quality using recognised critical appraisal tools (CASP, 2013; EPHPP, 2010). The remaining articles were then reviewed independently by all members of the research team, and following discussion 69 studies were deemed of sufficient quality, relevance and rigour to be included in the review.

**Results**

The majority of the papers (53/69, 76.8 %) were concerned with the positive effect of music listening on patients/service users, although some e.g. Vaajoki et al. (2011a; 2011b; 2012), reported different aspects and findings from the same studies (see Table 2 for details of the music listening studies). The remaining 16 papers incorporated a range of different art forms (See Table 3). The findings of the review are discussed in relation to context, methods and findings.

**The effect, impact and experiences of music listening**

*Contextual background*

The 53 studies exploring the effects of music listening were undertaken across a number of different countries and clinical settings and utilised a range of qualitative and quantitative methodologies (Table 2). The majority (49/53) adopted quantitative methods, including pre and post study test designs, a range of tools and measures were used including the State- Trait Anxiety Inventory (STAI), Visual Anxiety Scale (VAS) Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS).

*Emphasis on measurable effects and clinical outcomes*

There were just four studies that were informed by a qualitative approach. Two of these studies were by the same lead author who applied semi-structured interviews to examine paediatric and adult cancer patients’ views about music (O’Callaghan et al., 2011; O’Callaghan et al., 2014). The exploratory study by Dennis (2011) examined the effects of music listening and caregiver singing during personal care for residents with dementia in a care home, whilst a mixed-methods approach was undertaken by Trangeberg and Stomberg (2013) who used semi-structured interviews and a quantitative anxiety scale to examine the effects of music listening on patients during anaesthesia.

The quantitative studies using a pre and post-test study design compared and measured the degree of physiological change that occurred following a music listening intervention and/or the effects of music listening on patients/service users in relation to anxiety, stress and pain levels. Nineteenstudies primarily assessed the effect of music listening on anxiety and stress in a variety of different clinical and therapeutic settings. For instance, Bae et al. (2014) investigated the effects of music listening on anxiety levels for patients undergoing regional anaesthesia for a range of surgical procedures. In contrast, Kipnis, Tabak and Koton (2016) evaluated the effect of background music on preoperative anxiety in elective surgery patients, whereas Hsu et al. (2016) examined the effects of music listening on anxiety levels for patients undergoing knee replacement.

Measuring the effect of music listening on pain management was the next most common focus with 11 studies studying this phenomena. However, whilst the focus across the studies was similar, the settings differed. For example, Guetin et al. (2012) examined the effects of music listening in the management of patients with chronic pain, whereas Jose et al. (2012) assessed the effectiveness of music listening for managing pain in cardiac surgery patients. A number of studies also examined the effect of music listening in relation to both anxiety and pain levels, Chlan et al. (2013) tested whether music listening reduced anxiety and sedative levels during ventilator support in critically ill patients, and Angioli et al. (2014) investigated the effects of music listening on anxiety and perception of pain during gynaecological procedures.

The remaining quantitative studies examined the effects of music listening in relation to health care. A number of studies looked at perceptions of care and/or patient satisfaction in a range of different context settings, from a perioperative setting to Accident and Emergency (Mogos et al., 2013; Kilic et al., 2014). Length of hospital stay and the relationship between music listening was the focus of two studies, one in relation to patients on a ventilation machine (Szilagyi et al., 2014), and the other in relation to abdominal surgery patients (Vaajoki et al., 2012). Zhou et al. (2011) also examined duration of hospital stay, along with depression rates for breast cancer patients after a mastectomy. Similarly, Travers and Bartlett (2011) evaluated a radio programme that broadcasted music relevant to residents in a residential care setting who grew up in the 1920s – 1950s and looked at depression, quality of life and loneliness. Whereas Eggert et al. (2015) measured the effects of music and nature images on engagement for those diagnosed with dementia.

The findings from the music listening papers are discussed under the following headings: impact on anxiety, stress and pain; wider health care benefits; personally valued features of music listening; musical style and preferences; tensions and limitations.

*Impact of music listening on anxiety, stress and pain*

The papers that explored anxiety, stress and pain in relation to music listening overwhelmingly reported positive outcomes, which in most cases were also statistically significant. For example, in examining the effect of music listening on anxiety and pain levels for women undergoing a hysteroscopy Angioli et al. (2014) found women allocated to a music listening group during surgery experienced significantly lower anxiety after hysteroscopy and less pain during and after the procedure. Similar effects were also recorded over a longer timeframe, as Koca Kutlu and Eren (2014) found when they examined the effects of music listening on patients during 12 sessions of haemodialysis. The authors report that the 30 patients in the music group displayed significantly lower pain and nausea scores than the 30 patients in the control group who did not listen to music.

A reduction in depression scores was also reported in a number of the reviewed papers. For example, Zhou et al. (2011) found, after a mastectomy, women in the music listening group had significantly lower depression scores than the control group. Likewise, Guetin et al. (2012), investigated the effects of music listening in the management of chronic pain, found the music group had significantly reduced anxiety and depression scores in comparison to the control group. Additionally, Schneider et al. (2015) report evidence of strong positive effects on the quality of life of hospitalised patients who received live therapeutic harp music during the first 24 hours of their hospital stay.

There were also a number of positive significant effects reported in relation to physiological changes that are commonly associated with stress and anxiety. For example, Vaajoki et al. (2011) measured the effects of music listening on blood pressure, heart rate and respiratory rate in abdominal surgery patients. Music was played on the evening of the operation and on the first and second postoperative days. For those in the music group, respiratory rate and blood pressure was measured as significantly lower than the control group. Additionally, Lin et al. (2011) found that VAS ratings for anxiety and pain were significantly lower for patients assigned to the music group for spine surgery than those who were not, and one hour after surgery, blood pressure was also significantly lower in the music group than the control group.

*Wider health care benefits*

There were a number of areas where music listening was described as potentially benefiting the wider health care system. One such area was in relation to patient satisfaction. In the study by Mogos et al. (2013) higher ratings for care were given by patients who had live music at the bedside in comparison to those who did not. Harp music vigils were also offered to terminally ill patients in the study by Ganzini et al. (2013), which involved family members completing a short survey in relation to observed effects and perceived benefits. From this the authors report that music vigils have the potential to improve the patient and family member’s experience of the dying process.

The cost effective benefits of music listening were frequently identified in the reviewed papers, as the interventions were considered to be safe, inexpensive and largely easy to incorporate into the routine care of patients (Vaajoki et al., 2011a; Kushnir et al., 2012; Comeaux & Steele-Moses, 2013; Ganzini et al., 2013; Jimenez-Jimenez et al., 2013; Ozer et al., 2013; Trangeberg & Stomberg, 2013; Korhan et al., 2014).

Further cost effective benefits of music listening were in reducing hospital stays for patients. In the study by Zhou et al. (2011) duration of hospital stay was significantly shortened in the music group for breast cancer patients compared to the control group. Similarly, Szilagyi et al. (2014) reported that length of stay and time spent on a ventilator was significantly reduced in the study music group.

*Personally valued features of music listening*

There were only a small number of papers that considered music listening from a more exploratory and personalised study design. O’Callaghan et al. (2011) explored the relevance of music from the perspective of paediatric cancer patients. From the semi-structured interviews undertaken with children and their parents the authors suggest that the adverse experiences of cancer are often alleviated by listening to music and that music has the potential to alleviate distress. Similar findings were echoed when O’Callaghan et al. (2014) examined adult cancer patients’ views about music’s role before and after diagnosis. The authors found that music was often used and adapted by many patients to ameliorate cancer’s aversive effects. Patients spoke about how music provided emotional support that reduced their symptoms and strengthened their capacity to endure treatment, ongoing survival and impeding mortality.

In the paper by Dennis (2011), the effects of music listening and caregiver singing during personal care for residents with dementia were examined, music and singing were found to aid a reduction in the residents angry vocabulary, improved their diction and number of words used, and more eye contact was made with caregivers. Likewise, in the mixed-methods study Trangeberg and Stomberg (2013), explored patients’ experiences of music listening during anaesthesia, and music listening was found to offer patients a sense of calm and detachment from what was going on around them and was overall a positive, empowering experience.

*Musical style and preferences*

There were a few studies that examined attitudes towards music in the wider hospital setting. Overall patients responded positively and welcomed background music, recognising that it could improve mood and relieve pain (Perez-Cruz et al., 2012; Kilic et al., 2014). For those studies that examined the individual effects of music listening the selection of music style was often made by the study investigators. Usually the music was slow in tempo; typically 60-80 beats per minute, such as traditional and classical music (Lee et al., 2012). There were a number of studies, however, that allowed patients to choose their own preferred music style (Jafari et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2014), which was found to be of importance from the patient’s perspective. Trangeberg and Stomberg (2013) found that to facilitate the positive effects music listening can have on the individual, it is important that the patient has the opportunity to select the music that is meaningful to them.

*Tensions and limitations*

The choice of music in many of the studies was chosen by the study investigators, who similarly all favoured a slow-tempo style. Consequently there was very little consideration for individual preferences and likings. Indeed very few studies provided any evidence to support their choice of slow-tempo music, which raises questions around the assumptive and accepted nature of this style of music.

Additionally,a number of studies investigated the effects of music listening on patients who were mechanically ventilated, most of whom were reported as being in a critical condition within an intensive care ward. It was not always clear in the papers the level of patients’ consciousness and the extent to which they could consent to the intervention, (Puggina, da Silva & Santos, 2011; Beaulieu-Boire et al., 2013; Chlan et al., 2013; Szilagyi et al., 2014). In the study by Ganzini et al. (2013) assent was provided by family members to examine the benefits of harp vigils for terminally ill patients. However, Olischar et al. (2011), who examined the effect of music on the brain activity of new-borns in relation to sleep cycles, made no references to ethical consent or assent. Overall, there was little or no discussion about the ethical issues in gaining consent or assent from patients in a critical condition. Often the only references made to ethics were the confirmation that ethical approval had been granted from the necessary approving boards.

At a broader descriptive level there was an inconsistent use of terms, as a large number of the papers included incorrectly applied the term ‘music therapy’ to the intervention of music listening (e.g. Li et al., 2011; Lin et al., 2011; Jose et al., 2012; Lin et al., 2012; Korhan et al., 2014; Liu & Petrini, 2015). In relation to patient outcomes this may be inconsequential, but differentiation between ‘music listening’ and ‘music therapy’ is crucial to avoid blurring the processes between the therapeutic relationship and participation in the arts activity in and of itself. In a number of quantitative studies (e.g. Jimenez-Jimenez et al., 2013; Korhan et al., 2014; Szilagyi et al., 2014; Guetin et al., 2016), the small sample sizes of less than 40 participants also limits the generalisability of the findings.

**The effect, impact and experiences of different types of art forms**

The remaining 16 papers included in this review incorporated a range of different art forms and were conducted in a variety of clinical and therapeutic settings. As there were only a few papers for the various art forms and a lack of grouping in relation to setting, the remaining papers have been combined.

*Contextual background*

As previously stated the remaining 16 studies used a range of art forms. Five papers used singing and dance, and five used other arts activities, which ranged from music, dance and creative writing to poetry, ceramics and drawing. Four papers focused on the visual arts and poetry and reading were the art forms used in the remaining two papers (See Table 3 for details)

Geographically these 16 papers were drawn from fewer regions. The clinical and therapeutic setting where the different art form papers were undertaken also varied but the setting did not determine the art form used. For example, the art activity in the three mental health inpatient setting papers included music, drama and painting and dance (See Table 3).

*Emphasis on evaluation of the art form intervention*

The focus for the majority of the different art form papers were concerned with evaluating the direct effects of the art form on the target group. Unlike the music listening studies, where papers were predominately quantitative, the research designs were more varied, with six qualitative, six quantitative studies, and four mixed-methods studies

Semi-structured interviews were largely applied in the qualitative studies. Such interviews were used by Guzman-Garcia, et al. (2012) to examine the effects of a dance-based intervention on people with dementia, exploring the views and experiences of both residents and care staff. In the quantitative papers clinical outcomes were evaluated in three out of the five papers. For example, Crone et al. (2013) investigated the processes and outcomes of an arts intervention for patients with common mental health problems, such as anxiety, depression and stress. The art intervention was a ten-week programme to which 202 patients were referred and took part in a variety of participatory arts activities, such as poetry and ceramics in small groups. The Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Wellbeing Scale was completed pre- and post-intervention to examine the effects and changes in overall mental wellbeing.

In the four mixed-methods studies a range of different data collection methods were applied. Observations, reflective diaries and questionnaires were used by Dowrick et al. (2012) to evaluate a reading intervention for people with common mental health problems, whereas Froggett and Little (2012) used semi-structured interviews and the Herth Hope Index to evaluate the effect of a dance intervention in a mental health inpatient setting.

The findings from the different types of art form papers are themed around four areas that consist of improvement in health and well-being, enjoyment and satisfaction, wider health care benefits, tensions and limitations.

*Improvements in health and well-being*

In a number of papers improvement in well-being was reported. For example, Crone et al. (2013) found well-being scores improved for those with common mental health problems who completed a person-centred arts programme. Similarly, although the art form was different in the studies by Baumann et al. (2012), and Guzman-Garcia, et al. (2012), both studies reported improvements in well-being that was aided by the mental stimulation and interaction gained from the intervention.

A reduction in anxiety levels was recorded by Froggett and Little (2012) and Mouradian (2013). Likewise Dowrick et al. (2012) reported a reduction in depressive symptoms for those with common mental health problems attending reading groups for 12 months. Thomson et al. (2012) and Caddy et al. (2012) found improvements in scores in psychological measures of those who participated in creative activities. The evaluative feedback comments for an art-project for older people in a mental health trust by Shorters (2011) reported that creative expression had a role in recovery from mental distress that the authors suggest could be as important for some as medication. A similar finding was drawn in the study by Hurdle and Quinlan (2014) in their interviews with artists who delivered participatory arts activities to patients in a hospital setting, as most artists felt participation in the arts could facilitate healing and well-being.

*Enjoyment and satisfaction*

A common shared theme across this strand was the enjoyment and satisfaction patients/service users gained from the art intervention. For example, the young people with cystic fibrosis who took part in individual singing sessions expressed a high degree of enjoyment and satisfaction from the initiative (Yoon-Irons et al. 2013).

Gaining a sense of connection with others was also a valued feature in the study by Froggett and Little (2012) who evaluated a dance intervention in a mental health inpatient ward. Service users reported a feeling of inclusion from and within the group that was aided by a sense of everyone being in it together. Dancing also helped service users to relax by releasing tension. The study by Haraldsottir (2011) evaluated poetry reading and writing sessions for hospice patients and identified that the intervention was positively received by patients and enabled connections with staff by fostering dialogue and sharing of stories.

*Wider health care benefits*

Nature art displays were found to significantly decrease the number of queries made at the front desk and significantly increase social interaction in the study by Nanda et al. (2012), who examined emergency department patients’ behaviours to displays of nature. From the observations recorded the authors reported a significant reduction in restlessness, noise level and people staring at other people in the waiting room. The authors conclude that a simple visual intervention can improve the patient waiting experience in the emergency department, which has implications for patient satisfaction levels.

*Tensions and limitations*

In some of the different art form papers a tension was identified in relation to whose voice was being heard and whose was being ignored. The study by Hurdle and Quinlan (2014) only sought the artists’ perspectives in their review of a hospital based arts programme, which limits the transferability of the findings. The robustness of findings that draw upon feedback comments from those receiving the art intervention was another area of weakness in some studies. For example, it was unclear in both the papers by Haraldsottir (2011) and Shorters (2011) what the response rates were and how these comments were gathered and analysed. A lack of contextual background and detail was another area of weakness identified. For instance, the study by Low et al. (2016) is published as a short communication piece, but does not provide a link or reference to where the results of the study can be examined in greater depth.

**Discussion**

***Summary***

The papers included in this review largely report only on the positive effects of the arts in health care on patients and service users. Furthermore, this review illustrates an emphasis in the current literature on examining the effects of music listening on patients/service users. The reasons, as to why there is a disproportionate representation of studies on music listening relative to other art forms, was beyond the scope of this review, although accessibility and low cost would appear to be an influencing factor. The most common setting for such evaluations was a surgical context, where the main aims of the studies were to look at the impact of music listening on reducing stress and anxiety, with some studies also evaluating its impact on pain management. The findings from the studies were overwhelmingly positive and in most cases statistically significant with positive physiological effects on blood pressure, heart rate and respiratory rates recorded. There were also emotional impacts reported across the music listening studies including strengthened capacity to endure treatment, a sense of control in unfamiliar surroundings and a sense of calm and detachment. Patients/service users also recorded positive effects in the reduction of anxiety and stress levels, although in relation to the effects on pain levels opinions and evidence differed, particularly in a surgical setting.

Whilst music listening was the most commonly reported intervention other art forms were also evaluated, these included; singing, dancing, and a range of other arts activities. Overall the findings on the use of other arts forms were again mostly positive with improvements to breathing, endurance and muscle strength reported. As with music listening there were also reductions in anxiety levels and depressive symptoms, including the suggestion that the role of the intervention in recovery could be as important as medication. Other benefits to the individuals included increased enjoyment and satisfaction, and the opportunity to share and connect with others, and increased social interaction. There were also wider health care benefits, in relation to patient satisfaction, length of hospital stay and potential cost saving gains. Therefore, overall it is apparent in the studies reviewed, that patients/service users positively valued the arts in healthcare settings and recognised its potential positive effects, benefits and gains.

***Tensions and limitations***

The majority of studies included in this review only considered the impact and effect of the arts intervention within the boundaries of the study’s clinical setting or contextual condition. This can be seen in the number of studies that were undertaken to examine the effects of music listening on patients/service users, which were all very similar in research design, but were differentiated largely only by context and setting, with over half of studies undertaken in a surgical context.

Studies assessing the impact of music were quantitative, with typically pre- and post-test designs measuring physiological changes primarily focussed on measurable effects in relation to anxiety, stress and pain levels or some combination of these factors. This means that the results can be compared across studies, although it was noticeable that many authors did not refer to the existing ‘evidence base’ in their write up of individual studies. The limited use of multi-method and qualitative designs in relation to music is a gap in the field. The flexibility of such approaches might guide future work to explore and understand why and how music is important from the perspectives of a variety of stakeholders.

The designs used to assess the impact of other art forms were more varied and flexible, which helped to illuminate important issues that would be missed by the simple use of pre and post-test designs. However, qualitative studies, by nature, tended to be small in sample size, so comparison and generalisability is clearly limited. However, what this review illustrates is a lack of research, both quantitative and qualitative in nature, which examines the impact of different art forms in health care on patients and service users. A further limitation across studies is that designs tended to be cross-sectional rather than longitudinal in nature and in some settings (e.g. long-term residential care) the latter design would be particularly important in assessing the sustainability of the positive impacts of the art form.

A common theme identified across the music listening papers was a lack of participant choice and control, as the style of music played was often chosen by the study investigators.

In those studies that examined the effects of music listening on patients/service users, slow-tempo music was usually the preferred choice and little consideration or accommodation was given to the diversity of individual style preferences. However, in the study that allowed patients and service users to choose their preferred style of music there was some evidence to suggest this approach facilitated greater positive effects (Trangeberg & Stomberg, 2013). Similarly patients/service users’ voices were identified as missing in a number of the different art form studies, as instead, for example, the artists views were sought to examine the effects of the art intervention on patients/service users (Hurdle & Quinlan, 2014). The lack of consideration in the representation of voices in a number of the study papers thus raises questions about whose views are actually expressed and the ethical groundings of such studies.

**Reflections and recommendations**

This critical review has examined the current research evidence base published since Staricoff and Clift’s (2011) review, regarding the value of the arts in healthcare settings. The findings from this review further support the growing body of evidence that strongly attests to the benefits and positive impact on the health and well-being of patients/service users in introducing arts activities into a variety of health care settings. However, the evidence base continues to remain narrow in relation to both methodological approach and health care setting. Therefore, we suggest that now is the time for different voices, art forms, methodologies and health care settings to be considered in the research on the arts in health.

In the UK, policy makers and healthcare commissioners are becoming more aware of the potential of arts in health to be used to support the healthcare services, as evidenced by their testimonials within the APPG report (All-Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing, 2017). However, it is not only in the UK that this movement is happening, internationally, arts in health initiatives are being incorporated into policy across the world (Fancourt, 2017). In the UK the current fiscal restraints and the increasing pressures on health and social care suggest the need for creative solutions to the looming crisis in the National Health Service. Duncan Selbie, Chief Executive of Public Health England, actively promotes the great potential of the creative arts to improve population health and for that of the individual (Selbie, 2017). If a simple intervention, such as patients listening to music during procedures, reduces the need for pain medication and the length of stay in hospital, then this would result in a cost saving that is measurable and also may improve patient satisfaction with their care. Similarly, if anxiety and depression can be reduced through participating in arts activities, use of anti-depressants may be reduced with a subsequent reduction in costs and fewer side effects for patients. Cost saving is a powerful driver of much government policy. Whilst there is already some economic analyses of arts for health interventions, in addition to the research about individual health benefits, there is a need for further funded research and reviews focussing on both cost effectiveness and the wider benefits to society if the continued integration of arts in health is to be maintained.

**Acknowledgements**

The authors would like to thank the e-advisory group members who helped guide this review. They include: Prof. Jenny Secker, Dr. Theo Stickley, Dr. Trish Vella-Burrows and Prof. Norma Daykin.

**References**

All Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing. Inquiry Report (2017) *Creative Health: The arts for health and wellbeing,* available at: [www.arthealthandwellbeing.org.uk/appg/inquiry](http://www.arthealthandwellbeing.org.uk/appg/inquiry) [Accessed 21 July 2017].

Angioli, R., De Cicco, N.C., Plotti, F., Cafa, E.V., Dugo, N., Damiani, P., Terranova, C. (2014). Use of music to reduce anxiety during office hysteroscopy: Prospective randomized trial. *Journal of Minimally Invasive Gynaecology,* 21(3), 454-459.

Arts Council England. (2007). *A prospectus for arts and health*. London: Arts Council England.

Bae, I., Man Lim, H., Hur, M.H. & Lee, M. (2014). Intra-operative music listening for anxiety, the BIS index, and the vital signs of patients undergoing regional anesthesia. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine,* 22, 251-257.

Baumann, M., Peck, S., Collins, C. & Eades, G. (2012). The meaning and value of taking part in a person-centred arts programme to hospital-based stroke patients: findings from a qualitative study. *Disability & Rehabilitation,* 35(3), 244-256.

Beaulieu-Boire, G., Bourque, S., Chagnon, F., Chouinard, L., Gallo-Payet, N. & Lesur, O. (2013). Music and biological stress dampening in mechanically-ventilated patients at the intensive care unit ward – a prospective interventional randomized crossover trial. *Journal of Critical Care,* 28, 442-450.

Caddy, L., Crawford, F., & Page, A.C. (2012). 'Painting a path to wellness': correlations between participating in a creative activity group and improved measured mental health outcome. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing, 19*, 327-333.

CASP. (2013). *Qualitative Research Checklist.* Oxford: Critical Appraisal Skills Programme.

Chen, L.C., Wang, T.F., Shih, Y.N. & Wu, L.J. (2013). Fifteen-minute music intervention reduces pre-radiotherapy anxiety in oncology patients. *European Journal of Oncology Nursing,* 17, 436-441.

Chiasson, A.M., Baldwin, A.L., Mclaughlin, C., Cook, P. & Sethi, G. (2013). The effect of live spontaneous harp music on patients in the intensive care unit. E*vidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine,* [online] Available at: [Accessed 6 February 2015]

Chlan, L.L., Weinert, C.R., Heiderscheit, A., Tracy, M.F., Skaar, D.J., Guttormson, J.L. & Savik, K. (2013). Effects of patient-directed music intervention on anxiety and sedative exposure in critically ill patients receiving mechanical ventilator support: A randomized control trial. *Caring for the Critically Ill Patient,* 309(22), 2335-2344.

Comeaux, T. & Steele-Moses, S. (2013). The effect of complementary music therapy on the patient’s postoperative state anxiety, pain control and environmental noise satisfaction. *MedSurg Nursing,* 22(5), 313-318.

Crone, D.M., O’Connell, E.E., Tyson, P.J., Clark-Stone, F., Opher, S. & James, D.V.B. (2013). ‘Art Lift’ intervention to improve mental well-being: An observation study from UK general practice. *International Journal of Mental Health Nursing,* 22, 279-286.

Cutshall, S.A., Anderson, P.G., Prinsen, S.K., Wentworth, L.J., Olney, T.J., Messner, P.K., Bauer, B.A. (2011). Effect of the combination of music and nature sounds on pain and anxiety in cardiac surgical patients: a randomized study. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine, 17*(4), 16-23.

Department of Health. (2007). *Report of the Review of Arts and Health Working Group*. London: Department of Health.

Dennis, E. (2011). 'It's a good thing to have, to keep you happy.' *Journal of Dementia Care, 19*(2), 34-36.

Dowrick, C., Billington, J., Robinson, J., Hamer, A., & Williams, C. (2012). Get into Reading as an intervention for common mental health problems: exploring catalysts for change. *Medical Humanities, 38*, 15-20.

Eggert, J., Dye, C.J., Vincent, E., Parker, V., Daily, S.D., Pham, H., Turner Watson, A., Summey, H. & Roy, T. (2015). Effects of viewing a preferred nature image and hearing preferred music engagement, agitation, and mental status in persons with dementia. *SAGE Open Medicine,* doi: 10.1177/2050312115602579.

EPHPP. (2010). *Quality assessment tool for quantitative studies*. Retrieved from: <http://www.ephpp.ca/tools.html>

Fancourt, D., (2017) *Arts in Health* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Froggett, L., & Little, R. (2012). Dance as a complex intervention in an acute mental health setting: a place 'in-between'. *British Journal of Occupational Therapy, 75*(2), 93-99.

Ganzini, L., Rakoski, A., Cohn, S. & Mularski, R.A. (2013). Family members’ views on the benefits of harp music vigils for terminally-ill or dying loved ones. *Palliative and Supportive Care,* 13(1), 41-44.

Gooding, L., Swezey, S., & Zwischenberger, J.B. (2012). Using music interventions in perioperative care. *Southern Medical Journal, 105*(9), 486-490.

Graversen, M. & Sommer, T. (2013). Perioperative music may reduce pain and fatigue in patients undergoing laparoscopic cholecystectomy. *Acta Anaesthesiol Scandinavica,* 57, 1010-1016.

Guétin, S., Giniès, P., Siou, D.K., Picot, M.C., Pommié, C., Guldner, E., Touchon J. (2012). The effects of music intervention in the management of chronic pain: a single-blind, randomized, controlled trial. *The Clinical Journal of Pain*, 28(4), 329-337.

Guétin, S., Brun, L., Deniaud, M., Clerc, J-M., Thayer, J.F. & Koenig, J. (2016). Smartphone-based music listening to reduce pain and anxiety before coronarography: A focus on sex differences. *Alternative Therapies,* 22(4), 60-63.

Guzman-Garcia, A., Mukaetova-Ladinska, E. & James, I. (2012). Introducing a Latin ballroom dance class to people with dementia living in care homes, benefits and concerns: A pilot study. *Dementia,* 12(5), 523-535.

Hanson, H., Schroeter, K., Hanson, A., Asmus, K. & Grossman, A. (2013). Preferences for photographic art among hospitalised patients with cancer. *Oncology Nursing Forum,* 40(4), 37-45.

Haraldsottir, E. (2011). Poetry and creative writing in palliative care: an alternative approach to communication. B*MJ Supportive & Palliative Care, 1*, 260.

Howarth, (2013). *Arts, health and wellbeing: Personal reflections and political perspectives*. Retrieved from: <http://www.culturehealthwellbeing.org.uk/userfiles/documents/conf/Tuesday%2025th/Lord_Howarth_speech_CHW2013.pdf> [Accessed 15 August 2017].

Hsu, C-C., Chen, W-M., Chen, S-R., Tseng, Y-T. & Lin, P-C. (2016). Effectiveness of music listening in patients with total knee replacement during CPM rehabilitation. *Biological Research for Nursing,* 18(1), 68-75.

Hurdle, C.E. & Quinlan, M.M. (2014). A transpersonal approach to care: A qualitative study of performers’ experiences with DooR to DooR, a hospital-based arts programme. *Journal of Holistic Nursing,* 32(2), 78-88.

Jafari, H., Zeydi, A. E., Khani, S., Esmaeili, I., & Soleimani, A. (2012). The effects of listening to preferred music on pain intensity after open heart surgery. *Iranian Journal of Nursing and Midwifery Research*, 17(1), 1-6.

Jesson, J., & Lacey, F., (2006) How to do (or not to do) a critical literature review *Pharmacy Education* 6(2) 139-148.

Jimenez-Jimenez, M., Garcia-Escalona, A., Martin-Lopez, A., De Vera-Vera, R. & De Haro, J. (2013). Intraoperative stress and anxiety reduction with music therapy: A controlled randomized clinical trial of efficacy and safety. *Journal of Vascular Nursing,* 31(3), 101-106.

Johnson, B., Raymond, S., & Goss, J. (2012). Perioperative Music or Headsets to Decrease Anxiety. *Journal of PeriAnesthesia Nursing*, 27(3), 146-154.

Jose, J., Verma, M., & Arora, S. (2012). An Experimental Study to assess the Effectiveness of Music Therapy on the Post Operative Pain Perception of Patients Following Cardiac Surgery in a Selected Hospital of New Delhi. *International Journal of Nursing Education, 4*(2), 198-201.

Kilic, P., Karadag, G., Oyucu, S., Kale, O., Zengin, S., Ozdemir, E. & Korhan, E.A. (2014). Effect of music on pain, anxiety, and patient satisfaction in patients who present to the emergency department in Turkey. *Japan Journal of Nursing Science,* 12(1), 44-53.

Kim, Y. K., Kim, S.M., & Myoung, H. (2011). Musical intervention reduces patients' anxiety in surgical extraction of an impacted mandibular third molar. *Journal of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery*, 69(4), 1036-1045.

Kipnis, G., Tabak, N. & Koton, S. (2016). Background music playback in the preoperative setting: Does it reduce the level of preoperative anxiety among candidates for elective surgery? *Journal of PeriAnesthesia Nursing,* 31(3), 209-216.

Koca-Kutlu, A. & Eren, A.G. (2014). Effects of music on complications during hemodialysis for chronic renal failure patients. *Hemodialysis International.* Retrieved from: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/hdi.12161/pdf>

Koelsch, S., Fuermetz, J., Sack, U., Bauer, K., Hohenadel, M., Wiegel, M., Kaisers, U. X., & Heinke, W. (2011). Effects of music listening on cortisol levels and propofol consumption during spinal anesthesia. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 58(2), 1.

Korhan, E.A., Khorshid, L., & Uyar, M. (2011). The effect of music therapy on physiological signs of anxiety in patients receiving mechanical ventilatory support. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 20, 1026-1034.

Korhan, E.A., Uyar, M., Eyigor, C., Yont, G.H., Celik, S. & Khorshid, L. (2014). The effects of music therapy on pain in patients with neuropathic pain. *Pain Management Nursing,* 15(1), 306-314.

Kushnir, J., Friedman, A., Ehrenfeld, M. & Kushnir, T. (2012). Coping with preoperative anxiety in caesarean section: Physiological, cognitive, and emotional effects of listening to favourite music. *BIRTH,* 39(2), 121-127.

Lee, K.C., Chao, Y,H., Yiin, J.J., Hsieh, H.Y., Dai, W.J. & Chao, Y.F. (2011). Effectiveness of different music-playing devices for reducing preoperative anxiety: a clinical control study. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 48, 1180-1187.

Lee, K.C., Chao, Y,H., Yiin, J.J., Hsieh, H.Y., Dai, W.J. & Chao, Y.F. (2012). Evidence that music listening reduces preoperative patients' anxiety. *Biological Research for Nursing*, 14(1), 78-84.

Li, Y., & Dong, Y. (2012). Preoperative music intervention for patients undergoing cesarean delivery. *International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics*, 119, 81-83.

Li, X.M., Zhou, K.N., Yan, H., Wang, D.L., & Zhang, Y.P. (2011). Effects of music therapy on anxiety of patients with breast cancer patients after radical mastectomy: results from a randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 68(5), 1145-1155.

Lin, P.C., Lin, M.L., Huang, L.C., Hsu, H.C. & Lin, C.C. (2011). Music therapy for patients receiving spine surgery. *Journal of Clinical Nursing, 20*, 960-968.

Lin, Y.J., Lu, K.C., Chen, C.M., & Chang, C.C. (2012). The effects of music as therapy on the overall well-being of elderly patients on maintenance hemodialysis. *Biological Research for Nursing, 14*(3), 277-285.

Liu, Y. & Petrini, M.A. (2015). Effects of music therapy on pain, anxiety, and vital signs in patients after thoracic surgery. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine,* 23(5), 714-718.

Low, L.F., Carroll, S., Merom, D., Baker, J.R., Kochan, N., Moran, F. & Brodaty, H. (2016). We think you can dance! A pilot randomised controlled trial of dance for nursing home residents with moderate to severe dementia. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine,* doi: 10.1016/j.ctim.2016.09.005.

Marmot, M., Allen, J., Goldblatt, P., Boyce, T., McNeish, D., et al (2010) *Fair Society, Healthy Lives- The Marmot Review; Strategic review of health inequalities in England post -2010.* London: Department of Health.

Maskarinec, G.G., Look, M., Tolentino, K., Trask-Batti, M., Seto, T., de Silva, M. & Kaholokula, J.K. (2014). Patient perspectives on the hula empowering lifestyle adaptation study: benefits of dancing hula for cardiac rehabilitation. *Health Promotion Practice,* 20(10), 1-6.

McLeod, R. (2012). Evaluating the effect of music on patient anxiety during minor plastic surgery. *Journal of Perioperative Practice*, 22(1), 14-18.

Mogos, M.F., Angard, N., Goldstein, L. & Beckstead, J.W. (2013). The effects of live therapeutic music on patient’s affect and perceptions of care: A randomized field study. *Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice,* 19, 188-192.

Mouradian, L.E. (2013). Art-based occupation group reduces parent anxiety in the neonatal intensive care unit: a mixed-methods study. *The American Journal of Occupational Therapy,* 67(6), 692-700.

Nanda, U., Chanaud, C., Nelson, M., Zhu, X., Bajema, R. & Jansen, B.H. (2012). Impact of visual art on patient behavior in the emergency department waiting room. *The Journal of Emergency Medicine*, 43(1), 172-181.

Ni, C.H., Tsai, W.H., Lee, L.M., Kao, C.C. & Chen, Y.C. (2011). Minimising preoperative anxiety with music for day surgery patients - a randomised clinical trial. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 21, 620-625.

O'Callaghan, C., Baron, A., Barry, P. & Dun, B. (2011). Music's relevance for pediatric cancer patients: a constructivist and mosaic research approach. *Support Care Cancer*, 19, 779-788.

O’Callaghan, C., McDermott, F., Michael, N., Daveson, B.A., Hudson, P.L. & Zalcberg, J.R. (2014). “A quiet still voice that just touches”: Music’s relevance for adults living with life-threatening cancer diagnoses. *Support Care Cancer,* 22, 1037-1047.

Olischar, M., Shoemark, H., Holton, T., Weninger, M. & Hunt, R.W. (2011). The influence of music on aEEG activity in neurologically healthy newborns ≥32 weeks' gestational age. *Acta Paediatrica*, 100, 670-675.

Ozer, N., Ozlu, Z.K. & Gunes, N. (2013). Effect of music on postoperative pain and physiologic parameters of patients after open heart surgery. *Pain Management Nursing,* 14(1), 20-28.

Perez-Cruz, P., Nguyen, L., Rhondali, W., Hui, D., Palmer, J.L., Bruera E. (2012). Attitudes and perceptions of patients, caregivers, and health care providers toward background music in patient care areas: an exploratory study. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 15(10), 1130-1136.

Pettigrew, M., & Roberts H., (2006) *Systematic Review in the Social Sciences* Blackwell Publishing: Oxford.

Pownall, H. (2013). Neoliberalism, austerity and the Health and Social Care Act 2012. The coalition Government’s programme for the NHS and its implications for the public sector workforce. *Industrial Law Journal,* 4(1), 422-433.

Puggina, A.C.G., da Silva, M.J.P. & Santos, J.L.F. (2011). Use of music and voice stimulus on patients with disorders of consciousness. *Journal of Neuroscience Nursing*, 43(1), 8-16.

Sadideen, H., Parikh, A., Dobbs, T., Pay, A., & Critchley, P. S. (2012). Is there a role for music in reducing anxiety in plastic surgery minor operations? *Annals of The Royal College of Surgeons of England*, 94, 152-154.

Schneider, D.M., Graham, K., Croghan, K., Novotny, P., Parkinson, J., Lafky, V. & Sloan, J.A. (2015). Application of therapeutic harp sounds for Quality of Life among hospitalized patients. *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management,* 49(5), 836-845.

Selbie, D., (2017) Duncan Selbie’s Friday Message. Public Health Matters, [blog] 21 July. Available at: <https://publichealthmatters.blog.gov.uk/2017/07/21/duncan-selbies-friday-message-21-july-2017/> [Accessed 15 August 2017].

Shorters, V. (2011). Creating a hospital-based arts project for older people. *Mental Health Practice*, 15(3), 24-26.

Skingley, A., Bungay, H. & Clift, S. (2011) Researching participatory arts, well-being and health: Some methodological issues. Journal of Arts and Communities, 3(1), 73-87.

Staricoff, R. L. (2004). *Arts in health: a review of the medical literature*. London: Arts Council England.

Staricoff, R. L. & Clift. (2011) *Arts and Music in Healthcare: An overview of the medical literature: 2004-2011.* Retrieved from: http://www.lahf.org.uk/sites/default/files/Chelsea%20and%20Westminster%20Literature%20Review%20Staricoff%20and%20Clift%20FINAL.pdf

Szilagyi, A.K., Dioszeghy, C., Frituz, G., Gal, J. & Varga, K. (2014). Shortening the length of stay and mechanical ventilation time by using positive suggestions via MP3 players for ventilated patients. *Interventional Medicine & Applied Science,* 6(1), 3-15.

Thomson, L.J., Ander, E.E., Menon, U., Lanceley, A. & Chatterjee, H.J. (2012). Enhancing cancer patient well-being with a nonpharmacological, heritage-focused intervention. *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management*, 44(5), 731-740.

Trangeberg, O.S-O. & Stomberg, M.W. (2013). Listening to music during regional anaesthesia: Patients’ experiences and the effect on mood. *Journal of PeriAnesthesia Nursing,* 28(5), 291-297.

Travers, C. & Bartlett, H.P. (2011). Silver Memories: implementation and evaluation of a unique radio program for older people. *Aging & Mental Health*, 15(2), 169-177.

Vaajoki, A., Pietilä, A.M., Kankkunen, P. & Vehviläinen-Julkunen, K. (2011a). Effects of listening to music on pain intensity and pain distress after surgery: an intervention. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 21, 708-717.

Vaajoki, A., Kankkunen, P., Pietilä, A.M. & Vehviläinen-Julkunen, K. (2011b). Music as a nursing intervention: effects of music listening on blood pressure, heart rate, and respiratory rate in abdominal surgery patients. *Nursing and Health Sciences*, 13, 412-418.

Vaajoki, A., Kankkunen, P., Pietilä, A.M., Kokki, H. & Vehviläinen-Julkunen, K. (2012). The impact of listening to music on analgesic use and length of hospital stay while recovering from laparotomy. *Gastroenterology Nursing: The Official Journal Of The Society Of Gastroenterology Nurses And Associates*, 35(4), 279-284.

Wiesand, A. (2011). The financial crisis and its effects on public arts funding. [online[ Available at: <http://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/compendium-topics.php?aid=174> [Accessed 17 August 2017].

Wilson, C., Bungay, H., Munn-Giddings, C., & Boyce, M. (2016). Healthcare professionals' perceptions of the value and impact of the arts in healthcare settings: A critical review of the literature. International Journal of Nursing Studies, 56, 90-101. DOI: [dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2015.11.003](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2015.11.003)

Yoon-Irons, J., Kuipers, K. & Petocz, P. (2013). Exploring the health benefits of singing for young people with cystic fibrosis. *International Journal of Therapy & Rehabilitation,* 20(3), 144-153.

Zhang. Z., Wang, X., Xu, C., Zhang, C., Cao, Z., Xu, W., Wei, R. & Sun, Y. (2014). Music reduces panic: an initial study of listening to preferred music improve male patient discomfort and anxiety during flexible cystoscopy. *Journal of Endourology,* 28(6), 739-744.

Zhou, K.N., Li, X.M., Yan, H., Dang, S.N. & Wang, D.L. (2011). Effects of music therapy on depression and duration of hospital stay of breast cancer patients after radical mastectomy. *Chinese Medical Journal*, 124(15), 2321-2327.