**Transcript 20**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Interviewer name** | **XXXX** |
| **Sub-contractor organisation** | **ARU** |
| **Interview date** |  |
| **Duration of interview audio recording** | **44 mins 20 secs** |
| **Face-to-face or virtual interview** | **Virtual** |
| **Interview participant** | |
| * **Code** | **P20** |
| * **Participant name** | **XXXX** |
| * **Organisation name** | **XXXX** |
| * **Gender** | **Female** |
| * **Stakeholder category** | **NGO** |
| * **Country** | **Pakistan** |

RESPONDENT: Yeah you can record it.

INTERVIEWER: Perfect. So I have just put the recording on. The information being collected from you is for the purpose of this study only. And it will only be seen by the research team. Your name and any identifying features will not be used any where in the report. And once we are done with the report, we will share with you so you will have the recommendations as well. The interview will more or less take one hour to complete.

**Part 1: Introduction**

So let me just get directly into the questions. The first part is your introduction. Can you start by briefly telling me a bit about your organization and your position in which you were working. So, I know we are talking from the point of view of XXXX and yes you are no longer employed, but from that point of view, what was your role at XXXX and what were you doing there, or what was the nature of the project that you were involved in?

RESPONDENT: So basically, at the moment I am a XXXX. I worked at XXXX for about XXXX years as a XXXX. So basically, my job revolved around anything to do with environment, I was leading that. Initially, I was hired as XXXX, but then taking it forward, I was leading it. Any kind of research related to environment and gender and doing networking meetings, awareness sessions, capacity building anything related to environment, I was involved in that which means interaction with all duty bearers, whether it’s the community, whether it’s the line department or different NGOs. We have worked in XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: What was the year, I mean from which year to which year was this?

RESPONDENT: XXXX

INTERVIEWER: okay so basically since XXXX you have settled down and you are no longer working?

RESPONDENT: Yes, partially I am doing, I am doing different assignments like some small assignments that come up but not regular full-time work.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so you are doing some research work or consulting from home but not like a full-time job?

RESPONDENT: Yes partially, and that is not continuous, sometimes when it comes up.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so if you can tell us a bit about your background in terms of what have you studied, and how did you end up in XXXX, where have you worked before that and how did you come to XXXX?

RESPONDENT: Okay, basically, I have done Masters and MPhil in environmental sciences from XXXX, so I started doing research from there. XXXX

INTERVIEWER: Okay, so then you were at XXXX from 2011 to 2016 right? So if we speak in terms of energy, how much experience do you have with energy issues in terms of how many years have you worked on energy?

RESPONDENT: Okay, so are we taking energy directly with reference to electricity or cooking. If we take it related to cooking, as I told you I have worked on eco-social economics related to wetlands. You may know, turmerics are type of plants that people use for livelihood means, but those are also used as fuel wood, so if I consider that, I have been working on this topic since 2005 or 2006. But practical implementation in the field, that was with XXXX since XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: so for the sake of this interview regarding energy let’s not get into the power aspect of it because energy is power and energy is heat as well. Ok, so we will take it in your context that how are you related to energy and which specific form of energy, okay?

RESPONDENT: Right. Okay.

INTERVIEWER: So in that context if you can tell us about energy related programs you have worked on, whether it was a research, or fieldwork or solar cooking, not only solar but any clean cooking project, or any different activities or programs related to energy, if you can tell us about them?

RESPONDENT: Okay, so we had conducted, I told you that we used to conduct researches at XXXX. So after the research we highlighted issues and took them forward, doing our baseline survey. When I went to XXXX, I did a baseline survey with my team, in all districts… in all provinces and districts where XXXX works, which means throughout Pakistan. So what we found out was that women are directly impacted during cooking because they are using inefficient fuels and burning them causes a lot of problems.

Second, research told us that when they go out for collecting wood, they were being impacted due to some incidents with respect to their safety and security. So what we did was that we initiated a project um on fuel efficient stoves. It was a mega project in which we trained women in all districts and also men because gender is a cross-cutting thing. And if you consider our household system, women are not the only ones who are the decision makes so we took on board men also in that training. We initiated fuel efficient stoves which were made from household materials or locally available natural resources, long stacks, and the emissions from those went out of their home, so they can cook food using less quantity of wood at a time.

We did another research with the XXXX which was basically on XXXX. We also did capacity building sessions where we tried to link it to the economic perspective where we took up an organization XXXX from Karachi. This project was in XXXX basically. And this was based on the findings of our climate change research, in which our target was that we wanted women to start becoming entrepreneurs and they should have economic benefit by using solar chargers. So these were basically the 3-4 projects we had run.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so where does energy access come in these projects, or how would you define energy access as part of these projects?

RESPONDENT: Energy access is right at the start because if we consider gender women have clean affordable energy now. When we talk about clean, clean was where we link fuel efficient stoves, because there was where pollution was happening. There were indoor emissions.

Plus, there was a research on XXXX in XXXX, that once the crop is picked, the twigs and branches are sold out for burning fuel wood. And some is kept in their houses as well. These were causing quite a few problems. Before I joined XXXX the organization had conducted researches as well so we directly linked affordability with clean energy and solar. We have also developed some women friendly spaces in some districts through out Pakistan, which you can say are sub-offices for us, we have installed solar panels there.

INTERVIEWER: So specifically, if we speak about the energy access areas that you have worked on, your focus has been clean cooking?

RESPONDENT: solar.

INTERVIEWER: Solar and provision of solar energy, renewable energy in households for productive use?

RESPONDENT: Yes.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, when you were working at XXXX, so was there any special policy context or issues or any developments that influenced your work in terms of the existing policy at that time?

RESPONDENT: Not overall, not like that. Within XXXX we had our advantages and disadvantages, but at the policy level, it would be like if you for economic benefit, then there were many things which were lacking in the field. Then we would have to change the project, meaning there was no proper infrastructure in the communities, there were communication gaps between line departments, the departments we would visit, there was no gender sensitivity and they were not supportive of our efforts.

INTERVIEWER: Ok so just to understand, can you give me the context of the project, what was the project about?

RESPONDENT: Which project? I am talking about the fuel-efficient stove and solar. This was under XXXX that started for three years in which..

INTERVIEWER: Are we talking about fuel or solar?

RESPONDENT: We are talking about both solar and fuel efficient cook stoves.

INTERVIEWER: They were both under one project?

RESPONDENT: Yes, because we have divided into sub-sections based on our target indicators. So we had a research on climate change from which we moved forward, the findings of the research were converted into capacity building sessions. Then after that we had a project with the XXXX that we took forward.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so of course that project was defined by the XXXX procurement rules?

RESPONDENT: Yes. And the research was in collaboration with XXXX, that was just a research, but the power project was for XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, so the initial research was power projects for XXXX on the basis of which you were able to make the proposal for project which was sponsored, funded by the XXXX, right?

RESPONDENT: Yes!

INTERVIEWER: So um in, in that project just for my understanding that there were two parts to the project, one part was access to clean cooking stoves, the other part was access to um energy and lighting within the homes?

RESPONDENT: No, actually that project was an overall project, where all the components of XXXX came in - production, health and environment. So in the environment section we had these capacity building sessions.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, so these capacity building sessions with the um lighting, renewable and the clean cooking stoves, right?

RESPONDENT: yes.

**Part 2: Understanding of the Issues**

INTERVIEWER: so let’s move on to part 2 of the questionnaire which is about understanding issues. So what does equitable energy access mean to you?

RESPONDENT: For me it would mean having continuous energy every time meaning for 24 hours and um which is um which does not put financial burden on me for both men and women.

**INTERVIEWER: And what do you understand by gender equity in energy access mean to you?**

RESPONDENT: Gender equity means that the women… women in the household, she has access to clean and affordable energy, which she can put forward all other work that she does. Because women play a major role, like she is a producer in the house so energy access um less energy access leads her to performing duties which over burden her, which she invests her health and time in it.

INTERVIEWER: and do you think gender equity in energy access should be a priority for policy and interventions?

RESPONDENT: Yes.

INTERVIEWER: and why do you say that?

RESPONDENT: Why, because when we look at a household structure woman are the one who are doing all the household chores right, men are there but women are the major one which are doing it. If they are making food and they don’t have access to efficient stoves or things like that, they will be investing time in collecting wood which will take about 1 to 2 hours, 4 to 5 kilometers. But why do we bring gender in this? When we were doing the research with XXXX, when the interviews were conducted we came to know that women when they went for fuel wood collection they spend 1 to 2 hours and travel 4 to 5 kilometers while the same question was asked from the men of the same household and they said well, it takes only half hour. So to understand the needs the problems of a woman, it is really very important to take a gender in to account.

INTERVIEWER: Right… and the projects that you are talking about, obviously you determined some energy demand on which project scope was defined, about cooking stoves or capacity building that we did or any implementation. So these were all based on your research and field work that XXXX did, right?

RESPONDENT: yes, our researches and baselines

INTERVIEWER: so what is the criteria included in your research and do you consider gender as a critical part of that?

RESPONDENT: yes, XXXX is an organization which works… which has gender as its main core theme so everything we do revolves around gender, if it’s health’ it’s capacity building our main um focus is always on gender to see how to facilitate and how to identify issues which are pertaining to women to a specific area. Gender is always there.

INTERVIEWER: so the next question is that how equitable is energy access at community and household level in terms of gender equity?

RESPONDENT: um in terms of gender equity well if we look at it this way, when we did our researches, we had divided based on…. we had communicated with the people who lived in that area so we could identify the level of poverty and other things. So if you are asking in terms of energy access how equitable it is then that is dependent on the economic perspective of a specific household. The more economic power a household has the more better energy resources they use but still um the women of the house only has the role to play in um um in in production or reproduction, not in the decision making process when we look at community level. And if you look at this is in the rural or urban context with reference to rural and urban… um like we had an area in Bakhar that was an area which was a riverine area which had no electricity nothing. So, when we initiated our activity of clean cooking stove there it was a success because there was no other resources while in XXXX… the area um had very few population which had no electricity, while there were about 70 to 80 people who started using LPG so this was the difference. I don’t know if I answered it correctly.

INTERVIEWER: No you did to some extent. Some of the further questions have been included in it as well but I’ll keep coming back to that. So can you elaborate a little bit in terms of um How does gender affect the way that energy is used in households? For example, different task that use energy, whose responsibility is that. And do men and women use energy in different ways and why?

RESPONDENT: Men and women use energy differently… if you look at it then cooking is an activity that women have to do. So if women are doing that activity, then men are not doing it. Men are thought to be a bread winner and they are doing work outside of the home. So now it is the task of women, that they have to collect the firewood for cooking. Men are not helping them. But there are some places like when we went to Thatta, men were accompanying the women to collect wood. When we were doing the research with XXXX at XXXX side also there were men who were going out to collect wood but it is not everywhere. Women energy use is separate, plus in addition to that when we see these kind of things then women because she is spending more time on this stuff then she doesn’t have time to do other things….

INTERVIEWER: saadia you there?

RESPONDENT: yes yes.

INTERVIEWER: sorry, I have missed something in between, your voice cut. You were saying that women don’t have time to do anything because their entire day is spent in collecting wood and cooking food.

RESPONDENT: Yes, because when we did the climate change research, it became evident that collecting water is women’s job. Women take 2 to 3 trips to collect water… if they have to take a bath, they will take a third trip… they take one trip daily to collect fuel wood. It is a responsibility of the women so her time is invested more in these things.

She is the one who is um taking responsibility however, in addition um she has no role in the decision making because when we did this training for the solar battery chargers, there was a woman um who was interested in purchasing the unit. A unit has 7 spaces for solar chargers it means that for Rs 10, you can get one complete charge. But she was interested but she said to us that I will make decision after discussing with her husband. But when she came back, it was a no. so this kind of situation.

INTERVIEWER: right um, so just to probe this a little more… that how does gender relate to energy access in specific domain challenges such as clean cooking?

RESPONDENT: can you repeat your question?

INTERVIEWER: Yeah so in, in terms of how does gender relate to energy access in specific domain challenges such as clean cooking? I think you have answered this a bit so I’ll just skip that. Moving on to the next question, do different groups of women benefit from access to energy differently like if there is an age difference, if there are older and younger women, or different income groups, where they are based in the community, or religious, ethnic and cultural groups?

RESPONDENT: Not so much in terms of age, but different income groups show a lot of difference based on the area for example I shared the example of Muzaffgarh. There are some areas where people can afford LPG so they use LPG, they were not interested in the cooking stove so we didn’t focus on them but in the same area, a few kilometers away there was a population which didn’t had access to any kind of resources. They were poor so they were much more interested in these which means that if people are slightly low income, they mostly depend on fuel wood for burning and cooking. Apart from that a slightly higher income group… it all depends um it also depends on availability of the resource in that area, how far is it and how near is it because this was an example from Muzafargarh. Now for an area like Bakhar, which was a riverine area where XXXX was working, people had to travel a certain distance to get LPG so because of that, they preferred using um stoves, clean cooking stoves which were made with.. that we provided.

INTERVIEWER: So when you were at XXXX, did you provide any energy infrastructure, or did you just do capacity building training?

RESPONDENT: Infrastructure was only what we did at XXXX which was solar power… the solar panels that we installed.

INTERVIEWER: Right.. um so solar panels ,,, sorry WPS is what?

RESPONDENT: XXXX, women friendly spaces. XXXX has about 6 of them in throughout Pakistan.

INTERVIEWER: and they have put solar panels on them, right.

RESPONDENT: yes

INTERVIEWER: okay so when some new infrastructure or technology is provided like this, what is the difference between men and women, who benefits from it more?

RESPONDENT: I think at the moment, both because XXXX is a space where our trainings were conducted so both were benefitting. I mean it is not like we went to a household and did this… XXXX were basically, these were suboffices of XXXX where we had a coordinator and sub-cordinator and where are most of our activities were conducted so it was utilized by everyone

INTERVIEWER: and in terms of decision making, do men and women participate equally in decision making about energy access?

RESPONDENT: No. men do say that you can take these kind of resource like they are the ones who say that you have to collect fuelwood and you have to collect it from this location. It is not always the women’s choice to even identify an area that this is the area where we will get the proper firewood. Maybe because of the securities reasons or whatever decision making happens.

Second, I gave you the example of solar where the women… she doesn’t didn’t have the capacity or she wasn’t allowed to make all the decisions to purchase the complete solar charger unit. So mostly it’s not but there are also areas with where they do make decisions like in Bakhar when used to work in the city… um fuel efficient stoves were introduced in the riverine area of Bakhar but when XXXX conducted meetings within the city there were women who were leading their household… their houses and they were making decisions… so it varies… its not just static that only men do it.

INTERVIEWER: And in terms of decision making for finance related to energy technologies, how does it happen?

RESPONDENT: Um because it depends if the women is earning then she is making the decision, if she’s not earning then she’s not making the decision. This is where the whole story of gender and energy wraps up, if women does not have access to energy she does not have the resources, she spent most of her time collecting wood. She is doing everything in front of the stove.. , her health deteriorates, she cannot have education she cannot um find other opportunities to work and plus..

INTERVIEWER: you were saying plus something and then the voice disconnected?

RESPONDENT: no I was going to go towards the duty bearers because we are also doing networking meeting in XXXX to connect line department with the community so they can come up and give them trainings but when we get the baseline on the line departments, on energy departments um environment departments they had nothing for women nothing in um apart from the agricultural department we just had one or two so things not given to the women um they cannot make decisions and decision in our sector, our areas is mostly dependent upon um if a women is financially independent she can make her own decision.

INTERVIEWER: Right and is gender equity in energy access different between urban and rural contexts?

RESPONDENT: Yes, I give you an example of Muzaffargarh and Bakhar. Bakhar is in riverine area a pure rural area right so um that is the area where women are mostly going for collecting wood, fuel wood and using “*changa choolha*” like “*changa choolha”* [changa = good, chholha = stove] is fuel efficient stove while this is not so in Muzaffargarh because they have other opportunity, they utilize it.

INTERVIEWER: so how do you know about all these issues, what are they based on, like what evidence or experience do you have?

RESPONDENT: Um researches, experiences both. Um researches led to our capacity building session which led to interaction with communities and line department and other stakeholders and this is how, this was um basically direct interaction because our capacity building session and awareness sessions always had a follow up and follow up was of the area where we directly went into the field and contacted people. Or wherever we sent someone, we got response through direct interactions.

**Part 3: Policies and Interventions**

INTERVIEWER: Ok. I am going to move on to the third part of the questionnaire which is about policies and interventions. In your work on energy access, to what extent was gender equity factored in it?

P: Gender equity?

INTERVIEWER: yes,

RESPONDENT: I didn’t understand the question?

INTERVIEWER: so to what extent does gender equity factor in your work on energy access? So in terms of project priority, policy any internal process?

RESPONDENT: That is completely there, as I told you, XXXX is an is an organization which works on gender so gender is the main.

INTERVIEWER: Right and in terms of the work that you did how successful were your efforts, or what were the challenges that you faced?

RESPONDENT: Our actions…. research was fine as it was simple digging out things, getting with people doing focus on interviews blah bla, but when we went up to capacity building session we had issues. Um for example fuel efficient stoves um I told you that it was made with natural material we focused on um less economic cost but when floods came or there were rains um after our activity, one year after our activity, all those stoves got destroyed. And they had to be constructed again. It is not like they didn’t make them, but it was an effort which they made again… um which led us towards thinking that why um cant these women be given fuel efficient stoves which are made with material which is sustainable which solves the problem. That was one thing.

The second issue was communication gap um with line department or with others because when we do an intervention in a specific area, it just doesn’t stop after doing it. You have to go for follow up you have to link it with people, you have to link it with departments so for our solar activity, in which people purchased solar chargers for economic activity, the purchase was less because people thought that the chargers were expensive, the cost for using that was higher for the community um which were selected for this capacity building because that was their need. But because of the high cost, one problem that we had our project did not have room to allow for taking up the cost of the products and providing them or distributing the units to them from our side.

INTERVIEWER: okay so in terms of looking beyond your specific work, how can energy policies in Pakistan be gender sensitive?

RESPONDENT: Okay, in Pakistan there is no National Gender Policy. So we don’t have any line which tells us to how to do gender assessment, national gender assessment, there are no indicators on it, to link directly with energy. And when we look at energy, like I mentioned the cost factor to you, there is no gender sponsor budgeting for it. Plus the line departments, these are government departments um related to any sector, in environmental we look at energy, irrigation, agriculture and livestock, so the government has always allocated a budget under which they do trainings throughout the year. So what we saw in our baseline, most of these trainings were being done for men, very rarely there were trainings, maybe one or two under livestock or few in agriculture … there are no capacity building sessions [for women] from the line departments which has to be continuous um from the um government side so this is a gap that needs to be included in the policy.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, you have also mentioned the policy gaps because my next questions, was that if there are any policy gaps around women’s access to energy at local or international level and in your opinion what are these gaps, so mostly like you said its capacity building and um even awareness about certain things it almost always comes to the men and not to the women.

RESPONDENT: And one more thing, that when we talk about the departments, decision making bodies, though they are sensitized, but when you come to the field, we cannot observe sensitization for gender. Sensitization of gender is not just that you know that women have these problems or these problems…. It is not important to just know this… we do research to find out and then we implement it… we need to implement we need to take actions on it um we , I didn’t see actions on it, there are very you can when you start interacting with people you will see they are aware that sensitize but there is no use of sensitization if there is no action leading to solving the problem. So this was one shortcoming. They are sensitized that these are the issues and we have kept a quota in XXXX or in any other organization… like in our energy research this came up that in XXXX, they do have 10% or theoretically 32% quota for women, but there are no women employees there.. sorry… very less women employees or as you move upward the hierarchy, in senior positions there are no women so how can a woman state the issues of women in any policy?

INTERVIEWER: and are there any related social policies that you feel have an impact on energy equity? You have shared some from economic perspective, but any specific things?

RESPONDENT: So for example the land acquisition policy related to land rights because when we talk about energy or mega infrastructure. When you talk about women in energy, then capacity building comes with their awareness, that leads to economic empowerment right …for economic empowerment um which who do not have land rights.

So there are land rights and then environment related policies they need to be in detail whether we refer them regarding irrigation or power sector and then there are resettlement policies.

INTERVIEWER: Right, and all of these have an impact on energy equity, um?

RESPONDENT: yes because they intersect, now if a woman uses fuel, where does she bring that fuel from, the forest or agricultural land so that is linked.

INTERVIEWER: In specific policy that you have mentioned, what are the changes that we will have to make so that these policies or energy policies become more access equitable?

RESPONDENT: I think that first these policies need to be reviewed for what they lack. Then there needs to be an assessment that are they meeting gender needs in detail or not, specific to certain areas… it is not like you are making one policy and distributing it in all the areas.. and then with regards training… there should be training.. there should be sensitization.. there should be participation of women.. there should be awareness, and technical trainings.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, fair enough. Assuming that there are no policy or financial constraints, what are the best practices that we can implement to achieve gender equity in terms of energy access for Pakistan?

RESPONDENT: in terms of energy access what are the best practices..?

INTERVIEWER: Yes, so imagining no policy or financial constraints what in your view would be best practice for achieving gender equity in energy access for Pakistan?

RESPONDENT: I think um in energy department gender side, working on gender assessment and um doing there um identifying specific um first identifying the problem then the need, specific need of that area and linking it to market. I mean after identifying the issue, leading it to economic.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. In job. you are no longer employed so I will skip this question.

**Part 4: Topical Questions**

INTERVIEWER: This is the last part of the questionnaire. How balanced is gender representation in various decision making bodies within energy governance structures?

RESPONDENT: Umm I told you about the data that we had from um XXXX, they said that they had um 10% reserved seats for women and theoretically they follow a government policy where they had I think you know 30 to 32% for women participation decision making. But practically, there are no women, either women are not applying or I don’t know what the problem is, second, the female staff is less. On field it is even less and if there are any, they are either in HR or admin, or at some small post.. not at the higher level. And if they are there, let me add one more thing, normally consultants are hired with reference to gender.. this is the main thing that is seen now adays.

INTERVIEWER: So the next question is do you think renewable energy access finance processes are gender aware or sensitive? e.g. Green Climate Fund, national finance…

RESPONDENT: No.

INTERVIEWER: So a straight no from your end. Okay.

RESPONDENT: Because, as I told you, they don’t meet the needs. Only some of the specific things related to women are highlighted and if we consider the economic aspect as well, we had limitation as well.. because the issue of funding comes up.

But at government level there shouldn’t be funding issue, they should have specific allocation for women, economic capacity building related to energy, we don’t have it.

INTERVIEWER: And you have also answered this a bit, in terms of key challenges for gender equity in terms of renewable energy access finance, like purchase decisions for cooking stoves or solar home systems, so any thing like that?

RESPONDENT: so one part of that is the structure of the home, our patriarchal system, i.e. who is the decision maker, are women economically stable or not. Then as we step outside this framework, I told you about land ownership which is cross cutting.. then beyond that at government level, because to initiate anything you need awareness and other things if you don’t have that then you just do what you hear from anyone. For proper management these things have to be properly aligned.

**Part 5: Closing**

INTERVIEWER: so from my end, these were the questions only. Is there anything that I have missed out or you want to add to this?

RESPONDENT: So there is one thing, that I think more after getting married. You asked the question about rural and urban, so when I was working, I used to say, don’t use fuel wood, don’t use wood… the forest is spoiling. But the question arises if a woman doesn’t have anything to use she is forced to use fuelwood, if you want her to stop using fuelwood you want to save forest or whatever is deteriorating then provide opportunities for her, giver her a stove which she can use because she will be happy. Her health will be saved.

Plus if I speak about the urban area there is a huge shortage of gas right… so not um willingly people in urban areas have started using wood, whether that is something they have broken from their own garden for the sake of cooking for um …for one meal or two meal maybe… plus one more thing which is linked to this whole cooking issue is that if you have less resources… on Sui gas there is allocation of time that it will be available from this to this time so the woman is spending extra time on it. It is available from 5 am to only 10 am so she will be in a rush to do all her house.. kitchen chores especially cooking in that time. Then the rest of it they, if she has to do something or make something she cannot do it. So this decrease in resources is increasing the burden on a woman, not decreasing it so this is something that came in my mind.

INTERVIEWER: Thank you for sharing, it is very valuable. If there are any follow up questions, can I reach out to you again?

RESPONDENT: Yes, yes you can. I am happy to share the knowledge I have.

INTERVIEWER: No, no, it was very useful knowledge and very different from what you normally get. So it was quite interesting for me as well. I also got to learn somethings so that is always good.