**Transcript 11**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Interviewer name** | **XXXX** |
| **Sub-contractor organisation** | **ARU** |
| **Interview date** |  |
| **Duration of interview audio recording** | **51 mins 12 secs** |
| **Face-to-face or virtual interview** | **Virtual** |
| **Interview participant** |
| * **Code**
 | **P11** |
| * **Participant name**
 | **XXXX** |
| * **Organisation name**
 | **XXXX** |
| * **Gender**
 | **Female** |
| * **Stakeholder category**
 | **Energy Utilities**  |
| * **Country**
 | **Pakistan** |

INTERVIEWER: Thank you so much XXXX for approving your participation. Before we begin, let me just go through the checklist with you. Okay, you haven’t sent us the signed consent form, but you have seen it right?

RESPONDENT: No, I have not seen it. But it basically just asks if I want to give this interview or not or is there something else in it?

INTERVIEWER: No, basically that is it.. Let me just ask you if you are giving this interview willingly, by choice?

RESPONDENT: Yes, yes.

INTERVIEWER: And did you read the accompaniying participation sheet about the project?

RESPONDENT: I have seen a questionnaire, which other sheet was there?

INTERVIEWER: The one with the project information…

RESPONDENT: There is only the consent form here..

INTERVIEWER: There must be one more.. participant information sheet.

RESPONDENT: There is one consent form and one information sheet. OK. Which has the purpose of study?

INTERVIEWER: Yes, absolutely.

RESPONDENT: This includes a lot of things, but is this relevant now?

INTERVIEWER: Basically, go through Section B, ‘what will I be asked to do’. So in this, we are basically saying that we are inviting you for the interview, so that you can share your experience of working in the field of energy access with us and your views on how energy access related to gender equity. The interview approximately takes one hour and will be audio recorded. It will be scheduled according to your time and convenience. Other than that it includes details about who are the people participating in the project and all the details of the academic partners.

RESPONDENT: So does this interview and my name and other details go to the academic partners as well?

INTERVIEWER: They will not see your name. Only the transcript will be seen by them. They will only know that the interview respondent is somebody who works at a government firm and is a manger at the transmission and dispatch organization. They will be told you are a female employee and your answers will be shared.

RESPONDENT: Ok, alright.

INTERVIEWER: Okay? Because basically…..

RESPONDENT: Does the company name go in it as well?

INTERVIEWER: If you do not want, then we will not share the company name. we will only indicate that this is a government body, or policy body. We will indicate the type of stakeholder whether it is NGO or energy finance organization or private company of policy body or energy utility.

RESPONDENT: Okay. That means you will basically share my answers and not the audio?

INTERVIEWER: No, the audio will go as well. We will transcribe and translate it and the transcription will go to them.

RESPONDENT: hello?

INTERVIEWER: Okay, do you want to ask something else? If not, then we can start…

RESPONDENT: No, nothing.. the connection was breaking in between. If it breaks again?

INTERVIEWER: We will start again. I will pause the recording and when we reconnect, we will resume from there.

RESPONDENT: Ok

INTERVIEWER: Ok, let’s start

RESPONDENT: do we have to speak bilingual or respond in English to the interview.

INTERVIEWER: This is completely on you.

RESPONDENT: okay

INTERVIEWER: Please respond however you are comfortable.

RESPONDENT: there are no requirements?

INTERVIEWER: No, there are no requirements. Feel free to speak however you are comfortable and say however much you feel is required to give a better response.

RESPONDENT: Okay, right.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, then let’s start. I have already told you…

RESPONDENT: Ok, I am a XXXX. You said XXXX right, so I thought I should correct you.

INTERVIEWER: Yes, ok. XXXX. Please do mention that. I am starting now. Part 1 is introduction.

**PART 1: Introduction**

INTERVIEWER: Briefly tell us what is your current role and position and the organization you are working in?

RESPONDENT: hmm Briefly, actually my current role is I’m working as XXXX in XXXX of XXXX. XXXX is a transmission company, XXXX means XXXX and it is responsible for XXXXX.

INTERVIEWER: what is your role? Please elaborate a little bit about your own roles and responsibilities.

RESPONDENT: Umm.. roles and responsibilities... uh Basically I’m in XXXX. The XXXX is responsible for XXXX related to transmission and power evacuation. We XXXX

INTERVIEWER: Ok.. and is your work focused more on urban or rural? Or is it on both? Hello.. XXXX?

RESPONDENT: Can you hear me?

INTERVIEWER: No, please repeate.

RESPONDENT: With regards urban and rural, it the task of distribution companies that they have to work in urban or rural. Our major role is linked to transmission lines and grid stations. So this is regardless of urban or rural. In fact there are some areas where there is no technical justification. For example, in Balcohistan, in Quetta there are some settlements that are so far scattered that there is no financial justification for developing large grid startions but then when we look at social aspects, so then we get the approval from government for some things like this…

INTERVIEWER: Can you hear me? hello XXXX? Hello? Your voice keeps cutting. Okay, let me ask the other question, tell us about your background and how and why you got into this line of work.

RESPONDENT: Hello?

INTERVIEWER: helo XXXX can you hear us?

RESPONDENT: Mostly I can’t hear you and there is no one to assist us as all have gone for prayer break.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, let me pause this and when you come back then we will start. Okay, the other question is can you tell me a bit about your background and how and why you got into this line of work?

RESPONDENT: I am an XXXXX

INTERVIEWER: Right. So how many years has it been for you in XXXX?

RESPONDENT: so in the power sector it’s been,.. I joined in XXXX

INTERVIEWER: In XXXX?

RESPONDENT: No, I came to XXXX in 2007 and before that, I was at XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: XXXX. In XXXX…

RESPONDENT: This is a XXXX

INTERVIEWER: Right. So you have a lot of experience related to energy. So please discuss a little bit about the different projects you have worked on related to energy?

RESPONDENT: Basically, when I was at XXXX, most of my time was spent at the XXXX and I was in XXXX. At XXXX I have done many projects, like recently I have done the project on XXXX. It can be moved and we were testing that in case of an emergency, can we move it to a location that needs it. So, like this, and related to grid stations, we develop policy for XXXX. XXXX

INTERVIEWER: Right, right. Okay. So, your own work is related to resource XXXX. How is this done, at what level? Is your work to do with large grids only? Is there anything to do with energy access?

RESPONDENT: No, basically we support XXXX projects related to transmission or new grid construction. We need to do the analysis and get the approvals with respect to the project being financially viable… technically and financially both. Mostly this is our focus.

INTERVIEWER: Right. Have you ever worked on policy? Any work related to energy policy or not?

RESPONDENT: No, I have not worked on policy making. But recently I have been assigned the task by our XXXX to XXXX. I had to start that today that what it includes and what comments we can give on it.

INTERVIEWER: Just talk a little bit on which policies, whether they are at national level or provincial level that influence your work… under which you basically have to work?

RESPONDENT: Some policies we need to develop ourself like XXXX and by ourself I mean XXXX has done it with some help, some foreign help or own local resources. We have developed the XXXX, it is called XXXX. We had to make it earlier but with the correct grid codes it has been only XXXX that it is developed.

Some policies at the government level influence us like in any tenure, because Pakistan does not have the resources that it does an expansion of the electricity sector, the government does not have the funds. So when they get foreign funding or if they are getting a loan, sometimes there is a lot of money coming in. Like with the last government, a lot of investment was going in generation, so a lot of our projects were being developed for generation side. So it is influenced by the trend followed by government or what the funding position is like.

INTERVIEWER: and what do you think are the challenges you have to face in this?

RESPONDENT: So the challenge is that it has to be justified in every way for the approval process, technically and financially. That is the challenging bit, but if you say specific challenge, like I gave you an example that there are some areas where you can’t justify it financially, but if you don’t do it… if we don’t propose any grid in Balochistan and propose all of them in Punjab then it becomes like we are not giving equal access to people so we need to see how we can justify the project. That is challenging, when it makes no financial sense then how will we do it.

**PART 2: Understanding the Issues**

INTERVIEWER: Okay, let’s move to part 2. So the first question is what does equitable energy access mean to you? Bascially, what does equality in energy look like in your view or what could it mean?

RESPONDENT: so in general equitable energy access means that in Pakistan, if I speak about country or even in the world, every citizen should have access to energy irresepective of financial resources. Government needs to provide. I don’t know what else comes under this, equitable energy access is a very big domain.

INTERVIEWER: Absolutely right, you are in the right direction. So in your opinion, what is the importance of gender equity in energy access, or what would it look like and how much importance should it be given?

RESPONDENT: In the present scenario I don’t think there are any gender wise differences in energy access. Like where you have energy, obviously you need to pay if you need to use the energy and get the energy access and the cost is charged per unit, I don’t think anyone supervises that genderwise consumption. Like if there is one air conditioner it won’t be like a male is using it or a female is using it. Even in that the arrangement is made so everyone can adjust in it. Or if there is a heating arrangement, then everybody has access. Very rarely there can be a case in rural areas for example, that if there is a pedestal fan, then it’s direction will be towards the father and not the mother. In general, I don’t think there is any difference, gender wise.

INTERVIEWER: Right. And in your opnion, what should be the role of gender in policy?

RESPONDENT: Role in what sense? In terms of acces or policy making?

INTERVIEWER: In policy making, with regards to access. So if any infrastructure is being developed or energy XXXX is being done long term or short term, is gender considered, or how should we think about men and women, should we think about them both or separately… there should be role of gender as well in that policy?

RESPONDENT: So energy is a basic need for us so I think that it is equally important for both male and female. Both should have access and it isn’t like one has access and the other doesn’t in my experience. But in policy making, definitely there is domination of males but that is because females do not get the chance to move forward. There are less females in the policy making side any way, although the ration is increasing slowly with the passage of time. Like when I did my electrical engineering, there were very few females, now there are more so more are coming into our organization as well. Now they have reached the senior level as well, like one of our female colleagues is now a XXXX Engineer. So with the passage of time as their number increases at the senior level, then they will be able to influence policy more.

INTERVIEWER: Very nice, absolutely. Okay, so let’s move on to the next question… since XXXX does transmission and dispatch, how is demand determined at XXXX and how are the consumer needs understood?

RESPONDENT: Actually, we do demand forecasting in three ways. One is short term demand forecast, from next hour to next day, for maximum 1 day. Then medium term, and long term. Long term is 10 years plus, so we do that long term. So all three are calculated on different mechanisms, but there is a proper working for each. Surveys are mostly done by the distribution companies and provided to us. And then we need to do the research and statistical analysis of that data.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, so your own…

RESPONDENT: so the long term is calculated here in power systems XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: And the short term you are saying that DISCOs conduct their own surveys and that information comes to you?

RESPONDENT: DISCos basically give short term data to NPCC, National Power and Control Center in Islamabad. That is under the XXXX and they have to manage direction in and out in real time. So they collaborate directly with them.

Medium term is also survey-based system, actual information is collected about actual appliance usage as per households and sent to us.

In the long term, we don’t use surveys. We have different sectors like GDP growth and different sectors for long term.

INTERVIEWER: so when these on ground surveys are going on, is there any gender consideration or differentiation that how is the demand coming at household level?

RESPONDENT: This is not done for gender, this is done at the household level ony.

INTERVIEWER: At household level. Okay. Let’s go to the next question. Do you think energy access in our homes and our communities is equitable from gender point of view?

RESPONDENT: I think this question has been asked earlier?

INTERVIEWER: Yes, some of the questions maybe repeated slightly, you may give a brief answer again or mention that you have already responded to this earlier. However you are comfortable.

RESPONDENT: In terms of gender equity, there is no difference in males and females at energy level or household level. Not in my observation.

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Tell us, is there any difference in terms of gender on how energy is used in households. Are there any differences between men and women in terms of roles and responsibilities in domestic households? Please speak a little bit about this

RESPONDENT: One difference is that almost all men are working. Females are not all working, mostly they are housewifes. So mostly females are at home during the day and they need energy so in that relation how they use it during the day time. But in our scenario, energy consumption peak hours are during the evening. This means that at this time, men have returned home and all the activities begin. And rates are also more for peak time energy. Off-peak rates per unit are less.

Females have more role in this because they know that in each room where the light is on, where what is. Males I don’t think bother so much about the whole house but if they see it open, they will say this light needs to be off, this needs to be like this. They are more bothered about why energy is being wasted but they don’t monitor it as such. Monitoring is at the female end.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. And if we look at the household chores like cooking, are there any gender differences in that?

RESPONDENT: From an energy perspective?

INTERVIEWER: From access point of view.

RESPONDENT: no, not like that. But most of our cooking is on LBG based gas, so if by energy if we mean electricity, then it is not used for cooking.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. Tell us, do different groups of women get different benefits from access to energy? For example does energy access or use differ based on age or income groups or community or geographical location or are there any differences based on religion or ethnicity?

RESPONDENT: There are no differences based on religion. And age wise also. But it may happen that if someone is in a very old age, then their movement is restricted in the house and they are using less energy because of old age and restricted movement. But definitely, income groups are a major consideration, there is no role of gender here but if you have more income then you ise more and if you have less income then you use less. Then area wise, there are some areas where people are very rich but then there maybe some rural backward areas where there is very little awareness. Then people don’t consume energy like they do in urban areas or big cities.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. So you mentioned that XXXX basically works in transmission and dispatch and grid, so when new energy infrastructure or technologies are provided, in your opinion is there a difference between men and women that who benefits and how?

RESPONDENT: No, there is no consideration like this in policy making or in implementation, nothing gender wise as such.

INTERVIEWER: so then is there a difference in decision making regarding a new technology or appliance that needs to be purchased for the home?

RESPONDENT: Decision-making is different based on whose budget needs to be used for the purchase. Whoever’s budget is being used will dominate the decision. In normal cases, it is the male who is responsible for managing household finances and catering to them. But there is normally mutual decision making for appliances related to the kitchen, obviously ladies know more about this and they go to buy them or demand for them.

INTERVIEWER: Tell us, that is there a difference in gender equity in energy access amongst urban and rural contexts.

RESPONDENT: In rural, we can say there is a difference access wise compared to urban. In rural areas, the lines are sometimes very long so there is a lot more voltage issue. And even load shedding, in commercial areas for example it is discouraged and these areas are given more priority for energy delivery. So in this way I think rural areas are at a disadvantage compared to urban.

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Any gender differences in this? If we speak about access for men and women, from urban setting or rural setting?

RESPONDENT: No, I think there would be a financial factor in that, no difference gender wise.

**PART 3: Policies and Interventions**

INTERVIEWER: Okay, let’s move to part 3. So tell us, XXXX years experience, you have worked in the energy sector on energy access. Have you factored gender equity in this, in your work or in your projects, has there been any gender consideration?

RESPONDENT: No, it is only to the extent of funding, foreign funding or from government agencies. They have an environmental concern that there should be no effect on environment becaue of the project. The other thing about gender, if there is some nomination required for trainings related to a project so they ask that there should be gender equity while nominating male or female. Other than that there is no difference on the project gender wise, technically or financially.

INTERVIEWER: So do you think these kind of policies and systems should be there? Like you mentioned regarding the quota system that if men are there then women should also get the opportunity to work on projects? In addition to this, do you think gender should be considered or explored in your field?

RESPONDENT: So, there used to be a quota system for hiring, but since some time, females generally score better marks in examinations and interviews so they were hired more than males. So just like in the medical field, since some time, the quota system is no longer in place, it has been open merit.

Second, with regards policy making – so as I mentioned one of our female colleagues has just been promoted to XXXX. So at the XXXX or XXXX level, they are not given the charge of for example grid station construction or any field related task. It is preferred to give them office jobs or desk jobs, so both female and staff and management remain comfortable.

The more critical departments like grid construction, which includes grid operations so in case there is an emergency or the system collapses, then in no time, you need to get the new system up and running. So in positions like this, females have not yet been placed.

So the lady who has become our XXXX engineer, she has a lot of experience with regards high frequency energy grids construction, but now that she is the XXXX, she has been adjusted somewhere else. But she is the first XXXX, it may be possible there are more in future and then they have to be adjusted in the more critical roles as well.

INTERVIEWER: so you mentioned that they are not placed in the roles where there is lot of field work involved. Can you elaborate what are the challenges there due to which they are not comfortable?

RESPONDENT: One challenge is that it is not a fixed 9 to 5 job, you need to work according to the project timings. If the project is going on then you might have to stay late. For example a fault develops in the grid station at night, so even at 1:00 am or 2:00 am they will say go and check it, what has happened. So timing is one issue.

Second, you have to work in the open field. Most of our society is still getting used to it but they are not completely there yet. I think that if women are placed there, there will be no issue, but we are scared of change so maybe that’s why we don’t do it. The staff respects us a lot and our culture is also such that females are respected a lot, it may be possible that their behavior with males is not so good, but where there are females, the overall environment is also better, language is also better and employees are also better. Especially the places where I go. There is no reluctance.

When I joined XXXX I was the first XXXX there, there was no other female. Neither in Engineering, nor HR nor on the revenue side. The only other female there was a XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: How was your experience?

RESPONDENT: My experience was very good, I got a lot of respect and in XXXX, there was no concept of merit or girls doing engineering. There used to be only 2 or 3 girls who used to get good marks in their academics. I am an XXXX.

INTERVIEWER: So do you ever think you had to face more challenges just because you are female?

RESPONDENT: Being female, only one challenge that you have to face is that if you have any issue with your career progression or if you have a problem with something and you pursue it, then you are highlighted more, if you do something. If a male comes an hour late, nobody finds out but if a female comes late, everyone knows about it. So if there is any issue, and if you go and meet your senior or your MD regarding it, then the whole organization knows that the female had gone for the meeting today. This is the issue I feel.

INTERVIEWER: And how is the work environment?

RESPONDENT: Work environment is okay, it’s not like you can’t work or people are using unacceptable language, nothing like that. Work environment is ok.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so if you talk about Pakistan, beyond your own organization, do you think energy access policies should be gender sensitive?

RESPONDENT: That depends. What is the result that you want to get out of it, by making the policy gender sensitive?

INTERVIEWER: Do you think there can be any positive outcome on the demand side if gender is considered?

 RESPONDENT: Actually to consider gender, then the whole female community that uses energy, they need to be aware from the gender point of view, that what difference they can create in the demand for energy. Then maybe there will be some impact. Women use more energy for cooking and washing, so if they are aware, there can be a difference, that they can use the energy in a better way. Literacy level of people is quite low so energy programs and awareness campaigns are important. If women know that which appliance uses less energy and which technology they should use, then they will adopt it accordingly.

So for example for gas heaters, in winter, it comes printed on the bills that if you have gas geysers that you use to heat water, then you need to install a conical shaped piece on it. This is advertised on the bill that if you install it, you will save x amount on your bill. So if something is printed like this and ladies are made aware, that what is solar energy, what time should they use their washing machine, what time should they cook so there can be some impact but the consumers need to be given awareness.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. And do you think there are any gaps in the policy with regards women’s access to energy at the provincial or national level.

RESPONDENT: No, there are no gaps with regards access..

INTERVIEWER: Okay. And do you think there are any social policies that affect energy equity, for example if there is fair provision of energy, does that impact energy equity?

RESPONDENT: Social Policies?

INTERVIEWER: Yes

RESPONDENT: There are none in my mind. Maybe if you give an example I can relate.

INTERVIEWER: For example the quota for employment. From an economic point of view if there is a quota for women’s employment in the government, so you see a social aspect, how our culture differentiates roles and responsibilities. So from a gender point of view, how easy is women’s access to for example public places, eduction… any policies of this nature that affect energy access.

RESPONDENT: No, as I mentioned, I think there is no difference in energy access gender wise. If there was then you need to provide the policy that it goes towards gender equity. I think those policies can be like I just mentioned about energy awareness – so use is for both males and females but then there are some uses that females have to do so their needs to be an awareness campaign like that.

INTERVIEWER: So if we have to go towards an ideal scenario, that there should be no difference for women – like you mentioned that our country and society is changing slowly and more women are being employed in energy departments. So if we want to ensure gender equity in energy field, so what are your recommendations for it?

RESPONDENT: One, whenever a policy is made, it should include one point that it should be viewed from a gender equity perspective.

INTERVIEWER: okay and anything else?

RESPONDENT: and another think could be that more females need to be included in policy making. This means that more females need to be hired at senior levels in the ministry of energy and related departments so that their point of view can also be incorporated that how they look at things.

INTERVIEWER: Absolutely. Anything else in which women can be promoted so that they are shoulder to shoulder with men. Do you think this is possible with regards enerft access? Or in your role what can you do? Suppose that you have become the president or prime minister. So who will you consider gender equity then?

RESPONDENT: One consideration for me would be that at the MD level or XXXX Executive level, normally males are hired. It is very rare that a female is hired at this position, and never happened in the energy sector. I think there is one department in Punjab related to power where there is one woman XXXX. But generally there are no women. So their participation can be increased and they can be given the lead roles.

Then I gave the example of the XXXX, she is deployed at the sites that are not very crucial or critical or in sensitive areas of the department but when women are placed in these positions then of course they will be promoted to General XXXX and MD positions. So when you place them at the sites, seniority wise promotion on selection based seats will happen. So they need to be given these roles and responsibilities from the start so that they are groomed for the more demanding roles.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. And if a women is given such a position, what will be the benefit according to you?

RESPONDENT: The most beneficial thing would be that people’s thoughts will change. This thinking that males can do something better should be ended because ladies are now becoming pilots, they drive trucks as well, they are commandos as well.. they are doing everything, even becoming fighter pilots. But when females come and do good work in their departments and their fields, space is automatically created for future female employees.

**PART 4: Topical Questions**

INTERVIEWER: Okay, let’s move to part 4. You have mentioned this quite a bit but if you have some numbers then do share as well, how balanced is gender representation in government departments?

RESPONDENT: There is no representation of women in the government sector. There has never been any female energy minister in Pakistan and I don’t know about other countries.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. What is the male to female ratio in your organization.

RESPONDENT: I can’t say exactly, maybe I can check and get back to you.

INTERVIEWER: can you share a rough estimate?

RESPONDENT: I think the ratio would be 5:10.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, and in Pakistan, is gender considered in energy finance or do you see any policies like the Alternative and Renewable policy that consider gender?

RESPONDENT: No, policies are not considered from gender perspectives. Like I said, there is no difference in energy access from gender point of view. So that is why it is not considered. But if it is reviewed from that point of view one time, so there is nothing wrong with it.

**PART 5: Conclusion**

INTERVIEWER: Ok, so our interview has ended, if you want to add any comments, please feel free to.

RESPONDENT: so I want to add one thing, some of our areas belong to gangsters, and in these areas you cannot make recovery for utility services provided because of security issues. So in one area, they recruited a local woman and she managed to check the meters and make all the recoveries. So things improved significantly and people who didn’t pay bills or misbehaved with male officers, changed their attitudes as well.

 INTERVIEWER: Okay. Okay.

RESPONDENT: it is our mindset that females should bot be hired at locations like these but the results are indicating opposite. Where men were not allowed, they allow women. They don’t say anything to her out of respect. I think we don’t thing out of the box, other wise many things can be there definitely.

INTERVIEWER: This is a very good example. Thank you so much. Okay, I am ending the recording here now.