#### **Original article**

### Impact of data extraction errors in meta-analyses on the association between depression and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers: An umbrella review

San Lee<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Keum Hwa Lee<sup>4</sup>, Kyung Mee Park<sup>1,2</sup>, Sung Jong Park<sup>1</sup>, Won Jae Kim<sup>1</sup>, Jinhee Lee<sup>5</sup>, Andreas Kronbichler<sup>6</sup>, Lee Smith<sup>7</sup>, Marco Solmi<sup>8,9,10</sup>, Brendon Stubbs<sup>11,12</sup>, Ai Koyanagi<sup>13,14</sup>, Louis Jacob<sup>13,15</sup>, Andrew Stickley<sup>16</sup>, Trevor Thompson<sup>17</sup>, Elena Dragioti<sup>18</sup>, Hans Oh<sup>19</sup>, Andre R. Brunoni<sup>20</sup>, Andre F. Carvalho<sup>21</sup>, Joaquim Radua<sup>10,22,23</sup>, Suk Kyoon An<sup>1,2</sup>, Kee Namkoong<sup>1,2</sup>, Eun Lee<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Jae II Shin<sup>4,\*</sup>, and Paolo Fusar-Poli<sup>10,24,25</sup>

 <sup>1</sup> Department of Psychiatry, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Seoul, Republic of Korea
 <sup>2</sup> Institute of Behavioral Science in Medicine, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Seoul, Republic of Korea

<sup>3</sup> Department of Psychiatry, Yongin Severance Hospital, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Yongin, Republic of Korea

<sup>4</sup> Department of Pediatrics, Yonsei University College of Medicine, Seoul, Republic of Korea

<sup>5</sup> Department of Psychiatry, Yonsei University Wonju College of Medicine, Wonju, Republic of Korea

<sup>6</sup> Department of Internal Medicine IV (Nephrology and Hypertension), Medical University Innsbruck, 6020 Innsbruck, Austria

<sup>7</sup> The Cambridge Centre for Sport and Exercise Sciences, Anglia Ruskin University, Cambridge CB1 1PT, UK

<sup>8</sup> Department of Neuroscience, University of Padua, Padua, Italy.

<sup>9</sup> Padova Neuroscience Center (PNC), University of Padua, Padua, Italy

<sup>10</sup> Early Psychosis: Interventions and Clinical-Detection (EPIC) Lab, Department of

Psychosis Studies, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College

London, London, United Kingdom

<sup>11</sup> Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College London, De Crespigny Park, London SE5 8AF, UK

<sup>12</sup> Physiotherapy Department, South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust, Denmark Hill, London SE5 8AZ, UK <sup>13</sup> Parc Sanitari Sant Joan de Déu/CIBERSAM, Universitat de Barcelona, Fundació Sant Joan de Déu, Sant Boi de Llobregat, Barcelona, Spain

<sup>14</sup> ICREA, Pg. Lluis Companys 23, Barcelona, Spain

<sup>15</sup> Faculty of Medicine, University of Versailles Saint-Quentin-en-Yvelines, Montigny-le-Bretonneux, France

<sup>16</sup> Stockholm Center for Health and Social Change (SCOHOST), Södertörn University,

Huddinge 141 89, Sweden

<sup>17</sup> Department of Psychology, University of Greenwich, London SE109LS, UK

<sup>18</sup> Pain and Rehabilitation Centre, and Department of Medical and Health Sciences,

Linköping University, SE-581 85 Linköping, Sweden

<sup>19</sup> School of Social Work, University of Southern California, CA, USA

<sup>20</sup> Department of Psychiatry and Psychotherapy, University Hospital, LMU Munich, Munich,

Germany; Service of Interdisciplinary Neuromodulation, Department of Psychiatry,

Laboratory of Neurosciences (LIM-27) and National Institute of Biomarkers in

Neuropsychiatry (INBioN), Institute of Psychiatry, University of Sao Paulo, Sao Paulo,

Brazil; Hospital Universitario, Departamento de Clínica Médica, Faculdade de Medicina da USP, São Paulo, Brazil

<sup>21</sup> Centre for Addiction and Mental Health (CAMH), Toronto, ON, Canada; Department of Psychiatry, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

<sup>22</sup> Centre for Psychiatry Research, Department of Clinical Neuroscience, Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, Sweden

<sup>23</sup> Imaging of Mood- and Anxiety-Related Disorders (IMARD) Group, Institut

d'Investigacions Biomèdiques August Pi i Sunyer (IDIBAPS), CIBERSAM, Barcelona, Spain

<sup>24</sup> OASIS service, South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK

<sup>25</sup> Department of Brain and Behavioural Sciences, University of Pavia, Pavia, Italy

#### \* Corresponding Authors

Eun Lee, MD, PhD, Professor Department of Psychiatry, Yonsei University College of Medicine, 50, Yonsei-ro, Seodaemun-gu, Seoul, 03722, Republic of Korea Tel.: +82-2-2228-1620, Fax: +82-2-313-0891, Email: leeeun@yuhs.ac

Jae II Shin, MD, PhD, Professor Department of Pediatrics, Yonsei University College of Medicine, 50, Yonsei-ro, Seodaemungu, Seoul, 03722, Republic of Korea Tel.: +82-2-2228-2050, Fax: +82-2-393-9118, Email: shinji@yuhs.ac

Word count: 3,657

#### ABSTRACT

**Background:** Accumulating evidence suggests that alterations in inflammatory biomarkers are important in depression. However, previous meta-analyses disagree on these associations, and errors in data extraction may account for these discrepancies.

**Methods:** PubMed/MEDLINE, Embase, PsycINFO, and the Cochrane Library were searched from database inception to January 14, 2020. Meta-analyses of observational studies examining the association between depression and levels of tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF-  $\alpha$ ), interleukin 1-beta (IL-1 $\beta$ ), interleukin-6 (IL-6), and C-reactive protein (CRP) were eligible. Errors were classified as follows: incorrect sample sizes, incorrectly used standard deviation, incorrect participant inclusion, calculation error, or analysis with insufficient data. We determined their impact on the results after correction thereof.

**Results:** Errors were noted in 14 of the 15 meta-analyses included. Across 521 primary studies, 118 (22.6%) showed the following errors: incorrect sample sizes (20 studies, 16.9%), incorrect use of standard deviation (35 studies, 29.7%), incorrect participant inclusion (7 studies, 5.9%), calculation errors (33 studies, 28.0%) and analysis with insufficient data (23 studies, 19.5%). After correcting these errors, 11 (29.7%) out of 37 pooled effect sizes changed by a magnitude of more than 0.1, ranging from 0.11 to 1.15. The updated meta-analyses showed that elevated levels of TNF-  $\alpha$ , IL-6, CRP, but not IL-1 $\beta$ , are associated with depression.

**Conclusions:** These findings show that data extraction errors in meta-analyses can impact findings. Efforts to reduce such errors are important in studies of the association between depression and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers, for which high heterogeneity and conflicting results have been continuously reported.

4

Keywords: data extraction error; depression; inflammatory biomarker; meta-analysis;

umbrella review

#### Introduction

A growing body of evidence indicates that alterations in immune-inflammatory pathways play important roles in the pathophysiology of depression (Maes, 1995, Miller and Raison, 2016). Compared with healthy controls, patients with depression show elevated blood levels of inflammatory cytokines, such as tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF- $\alpha$ ), interleukin 1-beta (IL-1 $\beta$ ), and IL-6 (Howren *et al.*, 2009, Liu *et al.*, 2012). In addition, C-reactive protein (CRP), an acute-phase reactant, has also been found to be elevated in depression (Wium-Andersen *et al.*, 2013).

However, given the number of primary studies reporting conflicting results on the associations between inflammatory biomarkers and depression, meta-analyses are typically employed as a state-of-the-art empirical summary, integrating data across multiple primary studies and providing a more reliable answer to a research question than a single study (Berlin and Golub, 2014). Nonetheless, whilst several meta-analyses have attempted to clarify the associations between depression and inflammatory biomarkers, they have still reported inconsistent findings (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2010, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2016, Howren *et al.*, 2009, Kohler *et al.*, 2017, Liu *et al.*, 2012, Ng *et al.*, 2018, Osimo *et al.*, 2019, Perrin *et al.*, 2019). Although elevated peripheral levels of TNF- $\alpha$  were associated with depression in some meta-analyses (Dowlati *et al.*, 2010, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2016, Kohler *et al.*, 2019), others reported no association between them (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2018). Likewise, IL-1 $\beta$  was associated with depression in several meta-analyses (Howren *et al.*, 2009, Ng *et al.*, 2018), but not in others (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Ng *et al.*, 2009, Ng *et al.*, 2018), but not in others (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2017, Liu *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2019, Ng *et al.*, 2009, Ng *et al.*, 2018), but not in others (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2010, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2017, Liu *et al.*, 2019, Dowlati *et al.*, 2019).

Errors in data extraction can be one potential explanation for why different meta-analyses

reach different conclusions for the same research question. Investigators who have attempted to replicate published meta-analyses found that 59%–100% contain errors (Ford *et al.*, 2010, Gotzsche *et al.*, 2007, Jones *et al.*, 2005). Such errors in data extraction can lead to overestimating or nullifying the significance of the results. For example, when performing a meta-analysis, it is sometimes necessary to standardize measurements on a uniform scale, such as standardized mean difference (SMD), before pooling across primary studies. During this process, sample sizes may be incorrectly exported (Park *et al.*, 2017), and standard errors (SEs) may be mistaken for standard deviations (SDs), which can substantially inflate point estimates and heterogeneity (Gotzsche *et al.*, 2007). Inaccuracy in calculation (Messori *et al.*, 1993) and data analysis with incomplete information (Buscemi *et al.*, 2006) can also occur during data extraction.

To address this, we selected four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers,  $TNF-\alpha$ , IL-1 $\beta$ , IL-6, and CRP, which have been extensively investigated in relation to depression. Then, we examined errors in meta-analyses of the association between depression and the four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers. We employed an umbrella review of meta-analyses to evaluate the presence, frequency, and nature of errors in data extraction and their impact on the results. Furthermore, we corrected the errors and then re-estimated the meta-analytical associations between depression and these peripheral inflammatory biomarkers. Finally, we collected all primary studies included in the meta-analyses and calculated the updated total pooled effect sizes (ESs) of the association between depression and the inflammatory biomarkers. With the updated ESs, we aimed to evaluate the association of the immune-inflammatory pathway with depression.

7

#### Methods

The protocol for this study was registered in PROSPERO (CRD42019133888). We adhered to the Preferred Reported Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analysis (PRISMA) guidelines (Moher *et al.*, 2009) and the Meta-analysis of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) guidelines (Stroup *et al.*, 2000) (Supplementary Appendix 1 in the Supplement).

#### Search Strategy and Selection Criteria

Four investigators (SL, KMP, SJP, and WJK) searched PubMed/MEDLINE, Embase, PsycINFO, and the Cochrane Library for articles published between database inception and January 14, 2020 using the search terms (CRP OR IL-1beta OR IL-6 OR TNF-alpha) AND depress\* AND meta using the [All Fields] search tag for all terms. The searching process was initially performed until February 11, 2019 and then repeated until January 14, 2020 to update the newly published meta-analyses. The full names and abbreviations of all four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers were employed in the search strategy. We chose eligible articles by consecutively screening their titles and abstracts, followed by their full texts (Figure 1). Disagreements were resolved via discussion among the authors SL, KHL, EL, and JIS.

We included meta-analyses of observational cross-sectional studies examining the association between unipolar or bipolar depression (Dargél *et al.*, 2015, Fernandes *et al.*, 2016, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2016, Rowland *et al.*, 2018) and levels of TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-1 $\beta$ , IL-6, or CRP in circulating blood (plasma/serum). ES metrics as outcome were limited to SMD [Cohen's d], Hedges' g, mean difference, or odds ratio, which are obtained from comparisons of the depressive and normal group. Some meta-analyses included primary studies for any depressive disorder and others included only studies on major depressive disorders. Our definition of depression followed that of each original meta-analysis. The international prospective register of systematic reviews (PROSPERO) registration status was evaluated. We screened articles written in English or at least those with titles and abstracts in English and only included meta-analyses that reported ESs for individual primary studies or the data necessary for their calculation. Hereinafter, we have used the term "overlapping meta-analyses" to indicate meta-analyses of the same association between depression and an inflammatory biomarker, and "overlapping studies" to indicate primary studies that were included in more than one meta-analysis.

#### Data Extraction

From each meta-analysis, four investigators (SL, KMP, SJP, and WJK) extracted the first author, publication date, literature search date, inflammatory biomarker of interest, model of analysis (e.g., fixed effect or random effects), sample sizes, maximally adjusted individual study estimates and corresponding 95% confidence intervals (CIs), and ES metrics presented for results (e.g., SMD [Cohen's *d*], Hedges' *g*, mean difference, or odds ratio). From the primary studies included in the meta-analyses, we extracted sample sizes and means  $\pm$  SDs, means  $\pm$  SEs, or medians and interquartile ranges (IQRs) for each inflammatory biomarker. If data were presented in terms of a median and IQR, the calculation method for their conversion to mean  $\pm$  SD was investigated. If a study compared two or more subgroups of depression to the same control, we combined the subgroups to create a single pair-wise comparison. A few primary studies that reported stimulated levels of inflammatory biomarkers from *in vitro* assays were found in one meta-analysis (Perrin *et al.*, 2019). In this case, extracted data were used for evaluation of the detection of errors and recalculation of ESs in the meta-analysis, but not in the calculation of total pooled results from all primary studies. If data were presented only in graphs, they were extracted with GetData Graph Digitizer (version 2.26) (GetData Graph Digitizer, 2013). If there were any discrepancies in extracted data among individual raters, the most appropriate data were selected through consensus-building discussion.

#### Data Analysis

We recalculated ESs and 95% CIs of primary studies included in the meta-analyses and reanalyzed each meta-analysis accordingly. Pooled ESs, 95% CIs, and p-values were recalculated using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis (version 3.3.070, Biostat, Englewood, NJ, USA). The level of statistical significance was set at p < 0.05.

To evaluate discrepancies between initial and re-estimated results, we applied 0.1 as a cut-off point in accordance with previous studies that also evaluated data extraction errors and disagreements of results in meta-analyses (Gotzsche *et al.*, 2007, Tendal *et al.*, 2009). Meanwhile, we followed the ES metrics of the original meta-analyses (i.e., SMD, Hedges' *g*, mean difference, or odds ratio) in recalculation. If our recalculated results for an ES or its CI differed from those of a primary study reported in the meta-analysis by 0.1 or more, this was regarded as a change in results. Then, we thoroughly investigated the reason of the difference. If an error was identified during the investigation, this was classified as either "incorrect sample sizes," "incorrectly used SD," "incorrect participant inclusion," "calculation error," or "analysis with insufficient data," as indicated below. We defined a case in which sample sizes in a primary study were wrongly extracted as incorrect sample sizes. If an extracted SD from a primary study was incorrect, the case was regarded as an incorrectly used SD. When a primary study that did not meet the inclusion criteria of each meta-analysis was included, the

case was defined as incorrect participant inclusion. Calculation error was defined as a case in which the reported effect size was inaccurate despite no errors in reported primary study data for calculating effect size. If not enough information with which to calculate SMD was provided in a primary study, the case was classified as an analysis with insufficient data. We conducted data analysis as follows. At first, we evaluated the presence and type of errors in all primary studies in each meta-analysis. Next, we re-evaluated errors in only overlapping studies included in more than one meta-analysis. If data were extracted directly from previous meta-analyses, not from primary studies, and an error in the previous meta-analyses was noted, there was a chance of error duplication from the previous meta-analyses. Thus, we recalculated pooled ESs of the meta-analyses after correcting all errors. If there was a case in which an initial pooled ES was different by more than 0.1 from our recalculated value, this was presented as a "change in result." Lastly, we gathered all primary studies included in the meta-analyses and calculated total pooled ESs and the 95% CIs of associations between depression and the four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers using a random effects model and SMD as an ES metric. To assess heterogeneity among primary study ESs, the I<sup>2</sup> index was calculated. We assessed the presence of publication bias using funnel plots and Egger's tests. Data in primary studies presented with SEs were converted to SDs, and calculation methods for converting medians and IQRs to means and SDs were applied in recalculation, if necessary (Luo et al., 2018, Wan et al., 2014). If ESs were presented with metrics other than SMD, we recalculated SMD with the information provided in the primary studies.

#### Results

#### Database

A total of 517 potentially eligible articles were retrieved by the literature search (Figure 1). During the screening process, 502 articles were excluded, with 15 articles included for analyses (Table 1) (Bizik, 2010, D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Dargél *et al.*, 2015, Dowlati *et al.*, 2010, Ellul *et al.*, 2016, Fernandes *et al.*, 2016, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2016, Howren *et al.*, 2009, Kohler *et al.*, 2017, Liu *et al.*, 2012, Munkholm *et al.*, 2013, Ng *et al.*, 2018, Osimo *et al.*, 2019, Perrin *et al.*, 2019, Rowland *et al.*, 2018). The publication years of the meta-analyses ranged from 2010 to 2019. All meta-analyses exhibited significant heterogeneity among primary studies. Only two (13.3%) recently published meta-analyses were registered in PROSPERO (D'Acunto *et al.*, 2019, Perrin *et al.*, 2019).

#### Errors detected across meta-analyses

Errors detected in meta-analyses of the association between depression and the four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers are detailed in Table 2. The number of primary studies included in the meta-analyses ranged from 3 to 61. Except for the meta-analysis performed by Rowland et al. (2018), which investigated the association of bipolar depression with TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP (Rowland *et al.*, 2018), all meta-analyses (93.3%) had at least one type of an error. Overall, among the 521 primary studies included in the meta-analyses, errors were identified for 118 (22.6%) studies. The types of errors included incorrect sample sizes (16.9%), incorrectly used SD (29.7%), incorrect participant inclusion (5.9%), calculation error (28.0%), or analysis with insufficient data (19.5%). Among the different types of errors, incorrectly used SD was considered to be the most frequent.

#### Errors detected across overlapping primary studies

A total of 305 overlapping primary studies were included in the meta-analyses (Table 3). Overall, 61 of the 305 primary studies (20.0%) were associated with incorrect data extraction. "Twelve from 79 overlapping studies of TNF-  $\alpha$  (15.2%) were found with data extraction errors. In the overlapping studies of IL-1 $\beta$ , IL-6, and CRP, 20.5%, 17.5%, and 44.4% of each studies showed errors, respectively." The types of errors consisted of incorrect sample sizes (24.6%), incorrectly used SD (44.2%), incorrect participant inclusion (8.2%), calculation error (19.7%), or analysis with insufficient data (3.3%). Again, incorrectly used SD was the most frequent error among overlapping studies.

#### Re-estimation of meta-analytical findings

Table 4 shows a comparison of originally calculated pooled ESs and their CIs with our recalculated values. Eleven (29.7%) of the 37 pooled ESs from overlapping meta-analyses changed by more than 0.1 after recalculation, ranging from 0.11 to 1.15, and those changes were categorized as a "change in results." In 11 pooled ESs for TNF- $\alpha$ , two (18.2%) recalculated pooled ESs were classified as a change in results. In studies of IL-1 $\beta$ , the error rates were higher compared to studies of TNF- $\alpha$ . Five (62.5%) out of eight recalculated pooled ESs for IL-1 $\beta$  showed a change in results. During recalculation and comparison of pooled ESs of studies of IL-1 $\beta$ , two pooled ESs by Ellul and colleagues (Ellul *et al.*, 2016) were not included because their meta-analysis did not specify a method to classify high- and low-quality studies. Thus, it was not possible to separate and recalculate the pooled ESs of the high- and low-quality studies in the same way. Therefore, we had to recalculate a pooled ES by integrating all studies in the meta-analysis. Although the recalculated pooled ES

differed from a non-significant result of low-quality studies, we were unable to determine a change in results because those ESs were derived from non-comparable data. In 12 and 6 pooled ESs for IL-6 and CRP, three (25.0%) and one (16.7%) recalculated pooled ESs were changes in results, respectively.

We also included all primary studies for each inflammatory biomarker and calculated total pooled SMDs of the associations with depression. The number of primary studies for the four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers ranged from 39 to 112. We found that elevated peripheral levels of three inflammatory biomarkers (TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP) were significantly associated with depression. Total pooled ESs with 95% CIs for TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP were 0.49 (95% CI 0.34 to 0.65), 0.46 (95% CI 0.38 to 0.54), and 0.27 (95% CI 0.21 to 0.33), respectively. IL-1 $\beta$  was not associated with depression. Significant heterogeneity was found for all four biomarkers, with I<sup>2</sup> values ranging from 85.1% to 88.2% (Supplementary Figures 1–4 in the Supplement). Funnel plots and Egger's tests showed publication bias among studies of TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP (all p < 0.001), but not among studies of IL-1 $\beta$  (p = 0.257) (Supplementary Figures 5–8 in the Supplement).

#### Discussion

We found a considerable number of errors in 14 (93.3%) of the 15 overlapping meta-analyses of the association between depression and four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers. Of the 521 primary studies included in the overlapping meta-analyses, errors were identified for 118 (22.6%) studies. The most common errors were incorrect use of SDs (29.7%), followed by calculation errors (28.0%), analysis with insufficient data (19.5%), incorrect sample sizes (16.9%), and incorrect participant inclusion (5.9%). From the 305 overlapping studies that were included in more than one meta-analysis, errors were found in 61 (20.0%) of them. Again the most common errors (19.7%), incorrect participant inclusion (8.2%), and analysis with insufficient data (3.1%). After correcting these errors and repeating the analyses, 11 (29.7%) of 37 pooled ESs from the meta-analyses changed the magnitude of the effect size by more than 0.1, ranging from 0.11 to 1.15. The updated meta-analyses showed that elevated levels of peripheral TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP, but not IL-1 $\beta$ , were associated with depression.

Incorrectly identifying sample sizes is a potential meta-analytical problem. Although this type of error was more prominent among overlapping studies of CRP, it was also noted in studies of the other three inflammatory biomarkers. As the data extraction process is usually performed manually, it may increase the risk of errors. In future, machine learning may be applied to search for and screen studies to include in a meta-analysis and further improve the meta-analytic research (Xiong *et al.*, 2018).

An incorrectly used SD was the most common data extraction error in our umbrella review, consistent with previous reports of SEs mistaken for SDs (Gotzsche *et al.*, 2007, Tendal *et al.*, 2009). This type of error can inflate point estimates and artificially reduce CIs substantially

(Gotzsche *et al.*, 2007), impacting pooled ESs and estimated heterogeneity. Therefore, it can change the clinical meaningfulness of meta-analytical results. Some primary studies did not even indicate precisely whether their results were presented with SEs or SDs. In the review of Jones et al. (2005), 34 systematic reviews conducted by the Cochrane Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group were evaluated for data-handling and reporting errors (Jones *et al.*, 2005). In result, errors were found in 20 reviews, which four (20.0%) out of the 20 reviews were related with incorrectly used SDs. Thirty-five primary studies in 11 meta-analyses included in our study were found to have incorrectly used SDs. Accordingly, this type of error may be more frequent in meta-analytical studies in psychiatry research than in other medical disciplines.

Inaccuracies in participant inclusion and calculation were also noticed. Some studies that were not related to depression and inflammatory biomarkers or that did not meet the inclusion criteria of a meta-analysis were found to be erroneously included in the meta-analytic results (Koenig *et al.*, 1997, Komulainen *et al.*, 2007). Ford et al. (2010) reported in their review that five (62.5%) out of eight meta-analyses of pharmacological interventions for irritable bowel syndrome had included studies that were ineligible according to the predefined eligibility criteria (Ford *et al.*, 2010). In our study of 15 meta-analyses, only seven primary studies included in three meta-analyses were related to this type of error, and the error was relatively less frequent than that of the study conducted by Ford et al..

In some cases, even though no error was found in the reported primary study data, inaccurate effect sizes were identified. This can lead us to presume that there were calculation errors and a possible discrepancy in data used for actual calculation and reported data (Soneji, 2018). In the review of Gøtzsche et al. (2007), 27 meta-analyses published in 2004 that had used SMD were included for the evaluation of errors. The authors randomly selected two trials from

each meta-analysis and found that 10 (37%) of the 27 meta-analyses had at least one error. In the 10 meta-analyses with errors, one (8.3%) out of 12 trials was related to calculation errors. Although it would be difficult to compare the calculation error rate of our results to that of the review directly, we can presume that considerable calculation errors may also influence results in psychiatry.

In some cases, primary studies did not report sufficient information about their analyses. Therefore, with the absence of essential data for meta-analysis, it was not possible to extract data from some primary studies (Steptoe *et al.*, 2003, Suarez, 2004). In line with this, nonstatistically significant effects (NSUEs), which are frequently unreported, should be addressed. Some studies with non-significant group differences sometimes did not present any statistics that are necessary to be converted into ES. Recent statistical approaches (e.g., MetaNSUE) have been developed to overcome this problem (Albajes-Eizagirre *et al.*, 2019, Radua *et al.*, 2015).

Like many previous meta-analyses (Dowlati *et al.*, 2010, Fernandes *et al.*, 2016, Goldsmith *et al.*, 2016, Kohler *et al.*, 2017, Liu *et al.*, 2012, Osimo *et al.*, 2019), total pooled ESs of the four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers in our study showed that elevated peripheral levels of TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-6, and CRP, but not IL-1 $\beta$ , are associated with depression. We also found significant heterogeneity among primary studies of all four biomarkers, presumably reflecting diversity in the characteristics of individual studies and the important roles of biological, clinical, and technical confounders.

Some limitations of our umbrella review and meta-analysis should be acknowledged. The severity and duration of depression, medication status, and other confounding factors, such as body mass index can affect the association between depression and inflammatory biomarkers (Beurel *et al.*, 2020, Köhler-Forsberg *et al.*, 2017). However, such factors were not identically

adjusted in primary studies included in the overlapping meta-analyses. The significant heterogeneity among primary studies also reveals that the total pooled ESs of the four biomarkers should be interpreted and applied carefully to individual levels. We included unipolar and bipolar depression and summarized those data together. However, as differences between unipolar and bipolar depression have been reported (Brunoni et al., 2020, Goya-Maldonado et al., 2016), this should be taken into consideration before generalizing our results. In addition, data were extracted from graphs in 51 primary studies. Data extracted from graphs may be less accurate than data extracted from numbers, and incorrectly used SD and calculation errors can be related to inaccuracies in data extraction from graphs. However, only three cases of incorrectly used SD and nine cases of calculation error were noticed in all extracted data from graphs, and our results were not primarily affected by it. Although any discrepancies during study selection and data extraction were resolved via discussion among the raters, the methods of reporting interrater reliability were not used in our study (Belur et al., 2018). Lastly, although we spent much time and effort checking for the presence of errors in previous meta-analyses, the possibility of errors in our umbrella review itself cannot be excluded.

Although the statistical calculations in meta-analyses are ostensibly simple, data extraction and analysis are particularly prone to errors. Our study findings show that data extraction in meta-analyses can lead to significant errors. We noted that the errors could change the statistical significances of the association between depression and inflammatory biomarkers. Because errors in data extraction may influence ES and inflate heterogeneity among studies, efforts to reduce data extraction errors are important in studies of the association between depression and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers, for which high heterogeneity and conflicting results have continuously been reported.

#### Contributors

SL, KHL, EL, and JIS designed the study. SL, KMP, SJP, and WJK performed the literature search and screening; extracted, analyzed, and interpreted the data; and made the figures and tables. Any discrepancies were resolved via discussion among SL, KHL, EL, and JIS. SL, EL, and JIS drafted the manuscript. JL, AK, LS, MS, BS, AK (Koyanagi), LJ, AS, TT, ED, HO, ARB, AFC, JR, SKA, KN, and PFP were involved in critically revising the manuscript for important intellectual content. All authors approved the final version of the manuscript for publication. EL and JIS contributed as joint corresponding authors.

#### Acknowledgments

This paper presents independent research. The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the acknowledged institutions. This review was supported by the Basic Science Research Program through the National Research Foundation of Korea funded by the Ministry of Science, ICT & Future Planning, Republic of Korea (2017R1A2B3008214). The funders had no role in the study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript. All authors had full access to all of the study data, and the corresponding authors had the final responsibility for the decision to submit for publication.

#### **Conflict of interests**

We declare no competing interests.

#### **Ethical standards**

The authors assert that all procedures contributing to this work comply with the ethical standards of the relevant national and institutional committees on human experimentation and with the Helsinki Declaration of 1975, as revised in 2008.

#### References

Albajes-Eizagirre, A., Solanes, A. & Radua, J. (2019). Meta-analysis of non-statistically significant unreported effects. *Stat Methods Med Res* 28, 3741-3754.

Belur, J., Tompson, L., Thornton, A. & Simon, M. (2018). Interrater Reliability in Systematic
Review Methodology: Exploring Variation in Coder Decision-Making. *Sociological Methods*& Research 50, 837-865.

Berlin, J. A. & Golub, R. M. (2014). Meta-analysis as Evidence: Building a Better Pyramid. *JAMA* 312, 603-606.

Beurel, E., Toups, M. & Nemeroff, C. B. (2020). The Bidirectional Relationship of Depression and Inflammation: Double Trouble. *Neuron* **107**, 234-256.

**Bizik, G.** (2010). Meta-analysis of plasma interleukine-6 levels in patients with depressive disorder. *Act Nerv Super* **52**, 76-80.

Brunoni, A. R., Supasitthumrong, T., Teixeira, A. L., Vieira, E. L. M., Gattaz, W. F., Benseñor, I. M., Lotufo, P. A., Lafer, B., Berk, M., Carvalho, A. F. & Maes, M. (2020). Differences in the immune-inflammatory profiles of unipolar and bipolar depression. *Journal of Affective Disorders* **262**, 8-15.

Buscemi, N., Hartling, L., Vandermeer, B., Tjosvold, L. & Klassen, T. P. (2006). Single data extraction generated more errors than double data extraction in systematic reviews. *Journal of clinical epidemiology* **59**, 697-703.

**D'Acunto, G., Nageye, F., Zhang, J., Masi, G. & Cortese, S.** (2019). Inflammatory Cytokines in Children and Adolescents with Depressive Disorders: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *J Child Adolesc Psychopharmacol* **29**, 362-369.

Dargél, A. A., Godin, O., Kapczinski, F., Kupfer, D. J. & Leboyer, M. (2015). C-reactive protein alterations in bipolar disorder: A meta-analysis. *The Journal of Clinical Psychiatry* 76,

142-150.

# Dowlati, Y., Herrmann, N., Swardfager, W., Liu, H., Sham, L., Reim, E. K. & Lanctot, K.

L. (2010). A meta-analysis of cytokines in major depression. Biol Psychiatry 67, 446-57.

Ellul, P., Boyer, L., Groc, L., Leboyer, M. & Fond, G. (2016). Interleukin-1 beta-targeted treatment strategies in inflammatory depression: toward personalized care. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* **134**, 469-484.

Fernandes, B. S., Steiner, J., Molendijk, M. L., Dodd, S., Nardin, P., Goncalves, C. A., Jacka, F., Kohler, C. A., Karmakar, C., Carvalho, A. F. & Berk, M. (2016). C-reactive protein concentrations across the mood spectrum in bipolar disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Lancet Psychiatry* **3**, 1147-1156.

Ford, A. C., Guyatt, G. H., Talley, N. J. & Moayyedi, P. (2010). Errors in the conduct of systematic reviews of pharmacological interventions for irritable bowel syndrome. *Am J Gastroenterol* **105**, 280-8.

GetData Graph Digitizer (2013). GetData Graph Digitizer.

Goldsmith, D. R., Rapaport, M. H. & Miller, B. J. (2016). A meta-analysis of blood cytokine network alterations in psychiatric patients: comparisons between schizophrenia, bipolar disorder and depression. *Mol Psychiatry* **21**, 1696-1709.

Gotzsche, P. C., Hrobjartsson, A., Maric, K. & Tendal, B. (2007). Data extraction errors in meta-analyses that use standardized mean differences. *Jama* **298**, 430-7.

Goya-Maldonado, R., Brodmann, K., Keil, M., Trost, S., Dechent, P. & Gruber, O. (2016). Differentiating unipolar and bipolar depression by alterations in large-scale brain networks. *Human brain mapping* **37**, 808-818.

Howren, M. B., Lamkin, D. M. & Suls, J. (2009). Associations of depression with C-reactive protein, IL-1, and IL-6: a meta-analysis. *Psychosom Med* **71**, 171-86.

Jones, A. P., Remmington, T., Williamson, P. R., Ashby, D. & Smyth, R. L. (2005). High prevalence but low impact of data extraction and reporting errors were found in Cochrane systematic reviews. *J Clin Epidemiol* 58, 741-2.

Koenig, H. G., Cohen, H. J., George, L. K., Hays, J. C., Larson, D. B. & Blazer, D. G. (1997). Attendance at religious services, interleukin-6, and other biological parameters of immune function in older adults. *Int J Psychiatry Med* **27**, 233-50.

Köhler-Forsberg, O., Buttenschøn, H. N., Tansey, K. E., Maier, W., Hauser, J., Dernovsek,
M. Z., Henigsberg, N., Souery, D., Farmer, A., Rietschel, M., McGuffin, P., Aitchison, K.
J., Uher, R. & Mors, O. (2017). Association between C-reactive protein (CRP) with depression symptom severity and specific depressive symptoms in major depression. *Brain, Behavior, and Immunity* 62, 344-350.

Kohler, C. A., Freitas, T. H., Maes, M., de Andrade, N. Q., Liu, C. S., Fernandes, B. S.,
Stubbs, B., Solmi, M., Veronese, N., Herrmann, N., Raison, C. L., Miller, B. J., Lanctot,
K. L. & Carvalho, A. F. (2017). Peripheral cytokine and chemokine alterations in depression:
a meta-analysis of 82 studies. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* 135, 373-387.

Komulainen, P., Lakka, T. A., Kivipelto, M., Hassinen, M., Penttila, I. M., Helkala, E. L., Gylling, H., Nissinen, A. & Rauramaa, R. (2007). Serum high sensitivity C-reactive protein and cognitive function in elderly women. *Age Ageing* **36**, 443-8.

Liu, Y., Ho, R. C. & Mak, A. (2012). Interleukin (IL)-6, tumour necrosis factor alpha (TNFalpha) and soluble interleukin-2 receptors (sIL-2R) are elevated in patients with major depressive disorder: a meta-analysis and meta-regression. *J Affect Disord* **139**, 230-9.

Luo, D., Wan, X., Liu, J. & Tong, T. (2018). Optimally estimating the sample mean from the sample size, median, mid-range, and/or mid-quartile range. *Stat Methods Med Res* 27, 1785-1805.

Maes, M. (1995). Evidence for an immune response in major depression: a review and hypothesis. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* **19**, 11-38.

Messori, A., Scroccaro, G. & Martini, N. (1993). Calculation errors in meta-analysis. *Ann Intern Med* **118**, 77-8.

Miller, A. H. & Raison, C. L. (2016). The role of inflammation in depression: from evolutionary imperative to modern treatment target. *Nat Rev Immunol* 16, 22-34.

Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J. & Altman, D. G. (2009). Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *Annals of internal medicine* 151, 264-269.

Munkholm, K., Vinberg, M. & Vedel Kessing, L. (2013). Cytokines in bipolar disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Affect Disord* 144, 16-27.

Ng, A., Tam, W. W., Zhang, M. W., Ho, C. S., Husain, S. F., McIntyre, R. S. & Ho, R. C. (2018). IL-1beta, IL-6, TNF- alpha and CRP in Elderly Patients with Depression or Alzheimer's disease: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Sci Rep* **8**, 12050.

**Osimo, E. F., Baxter, L. J., Lewis, G., Jones, P. B. & Khandaker, G. M.** (2019). Prevalence of low-grade inflammation in depression: a systematic review and meta-analysis of CRP levels. *Psychol Med* **49**, 1958-1970.

Park, J. H., Eisenhut, M., van der Vliet, H. J. & Shin, J. I. (2017). Statistical controversies in clinical research: overlap and errors in the meta-analyses of microRNA genetic association studies in cancers. *Ann Oncol* **28**, 1169-1182.

Perrin, A. J., Horowitz, M. A., Roelofs, J., Zunszain, P. A. & Pariante, C. M. (2019).
Glucocorticoid Resistance: Is It a Requisite for Increased Cytokine Production in Depression?
A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Front Psychiatry* 10, 423.

Radua, J., Schmidt, A., Borgwardt, S., Heinz, A., Schlagenhauf, F., McGuire, P. & Fusar-

**Poli, P.** (2015). Ventral Striatal Activation During Reward Processing in Psychosis: A Neurofunctional Meta-Analysis. *JAMA psychiatry* **72**, 1243-1251.

Rowland, T., Perry, B. I., Upthegrove, R., Barnes, N., Chatterjee, J., Gallacher, D. & Marwaha, S. (2018). Neurotrophins, cytokines, oxidative stress mediators and mood state in bipolar disorder: systematic review and meta-analyses. *Br J Psychiatry* **213**, 514-525.

**Soneji, S.** (2018). Errors in Data Input in Meta-analysis on Association Between Initial Use of e-Cigarettes and Subsequent Cigarette Smoking Among Adolescents and Young Adults. *JAMA Pediatr* **172**, 92-93.

Steptoe, A., Kunz-Ebrecht, S. R. & Owen, N. (2003). Lack of association between depressive symptoms and markers of immune and vascular inflammation in middle-aged men and women. *Psychol Med* **33**, 667-74.

Stroup, D. F., Berlin, J. A., Morton, S. C., Olkin, I., Williamson, G. D., Rennie, D., Moher,
D., Becker, B. J., Sipe, T. A. & Thacker, S. B. (2000). Meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology: a proposal for reporting. *Jama* 283, 2008-2012.

Suarez, E. C. (2004). C-reactive protein is associated with psychological risk factors of cardiovascular disease in apparently healthy adults. *Psychosom Med* 66, 684-91.

Tendal, B., Higgins, J. P., Juni, P., Hrobjartsson, A., Trelle, S., Nuesch, E., Wandel, S., Jorgensen, A. W., Gesser, K., Ilsoe-Kristensen, S. & Gotzsche, P. C. (2009). Disagreements in meta-analyses using outcomes measured on continuous or rating scales: observer agreement study. *Bmj* **339**, b3128.

Wan, X., Wang, W., Liu, J. & Tong, T. (2014). Estimating the sample mean and standard deviation from the sample size, median, range and/or interquartile range. *BMC medical research methodology* 14, 135.

Wium-Andersen, M. K., Orsted, D. D., Nielsen, S. F. & Nordestgaard, B. G. (2013).

Elevated C-reactive protein levels, psychological distress, and depression in 73, 131 individuals. *JAMA Psychiatry* **70**, 176-84.

Xiong, Z., Liu, T., Tse, G., Gong, M., Gladding, P. A., Smaill, B. H., Stiles, M. K., Gillis, A.
M. & Zhao, J. (2018). A Machine Learning Aided Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Relative Risk of Atrial Fibrillation in Patients With Diabetes Mellitus. *Front Physiol* 9, 835.

#### **Figure Legends**

#### Figure 1. Flow chart of literature search and screening.



#### Tables

	Dublication				Included analyses			
First author, Year	date	Search date	Effect size metrics	Heterogeneity	Publication bias	Meta- regression	- PROSPERO Registration	
ΤΝΓ-α								
D'Acunto, 2019	June 2019	July 2018	Hedges' g	+	Egger's test	-	+	
Perrin, 2019	June 2019	October 2018	SMD	+	Funnel plot	+	-	
Ng, 2018	August 2018	March 2017	SMD	+	Egger's test	+	-	
Köhler, 2017	January 2017	May 2016	Hedges' g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test, trim and fill, fail-safe N	+	-	
Goldsmith, 2016	February 2016	March 2015	Hedges' g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	+	-	
Liu, 2012	August 2012	February 2011	SMD	+	Egger's test	+	-	
Dowlati, 2010	March 2010	August 2009	MD	+	Funnel plots, rank correlation tests	-	N/A	
Rowland, 2018	September 2018	February 2017	SMD	+	Funnel plot	-	-	
Munkholm, 2013	January 2013	January 2012	SMD	+	No	-	-	
IL-1B	-							
D'A ounto 2010	Juna 2010	July 2019	Hadaas' a	Ŧ	Eccor's test		1	
D Acunto, 2019 Ng 2018	Julie 2019	July 2018 March 2017	SMD	+	Egger's test	-	Т	
Ng, 2010 Kähler 2017	August 2016	March 2017	Undras' a	+	Egger's test	т 	-	
Coldsmith 2016	January 2017	Marsh 2015	Hedges g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test, unit and mit, fan-sale N	т 1	-	
Lin. 2012	August 2010	Eshman 2011	nedges g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	+	-	
Liu, 2012 Davilati, 2010	August 2012 Marah 2010	August 2000	SMD	+	Egger s lesi	+	- NI/A	
Dowlati, 2010	Fahman 2000	August 2009		+	Funnel plots, rank correlation tests	-	IN/A	
Howren, 2009	February 2009	January 2008	SMD	+	Funnel piol, fail-sale N	+	IN/A	
Ellul, 2016	December 2016	January 2016	SMD	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	-	-	
IL-6	L	O-4-1 2019	CMD	l.	Error 1 alst			
$\frac{1}{2019}$	June 2019	October 2018	SMD	+	Funnel piot	+	-	
Ng, 2018	August 2018	March 2017	SMD	+	Egger's test	+	-	
Konler, 2017	January 2017	May 2016	Hedges g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test, trim and fill, fail-safe N	+	-	
Goldsmith, 2016	February 2016	March 2015	Hedges' g	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	+	-	
Liu, 2012	August 2012	February 2011	SMD	+	Egger's test	+	-	
Bizik, 2010	June 2010	October 2009	SMD	+	Fail-safe N	-	N/A	
Dowlati, 2010	March 2010	August 2009	MD	+	Funnel plots, rank correlation tests	-	N/A	
Howren, 2009	February 2009	January 2008	SMD	+	Funnel plot, fail-safe N	+	N/A	
Rowland, 2018	September 2018	February 2017	SMD	+	Funnel plot	-	-	
Munkholm, 2013	January 2013	January 2012	SMD	+	No	-	-	
CRP								
Osimo, 2019	September 2019	July 2018	OR	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	+	+	
Ng, 2018	August 2018	March 2017	SMD	+	Egger's test	+	-	
Howren, 2009	February 2009	January 2008	SMD	+	Funnel plot, fail-safe N	+	N/A	
Rowland, 2018	September 2018	February 2017	SMD	+	Funnel plot	-	-	
Fernandes, 2016	December 2016	August 2016	Hedges' g	+	Funnel plot, trim and fill, fail-safe N test	+	-	
Dargel, 2015	February 2015	June 2013	SMD	+	Funnel plot, Egger's test	-	-	

able 1. Literature search, analysis, and rei	porting of overlapping meta-analy	vses of the association between depression	and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers

PROSPERO, international prospective register for systematic review protocols; SMD, standardized mean difference; MD, mean difference; OR, odds ratio TNF- $\alpha$ , tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$ ; IL-1 $\beta$ , interleukin 1- $\beta$ ; IL-6, interleukin 6; CRP, C-reactive protein; N/A, not applicable.

Included No. of	Errors			
First author, Year diagnosis studies/papers cases/controls significance Heterogeneity Dias sample sizes used SD patients	Incorrect participant inclusion	Calculation error	Analysis with insufficient data <sup>a</sup>	
TNF-a				
D'Acunto, 2019 DD 4 72/61 No No Yes 0 0	0	0	0	
Perrin, 2019 DD 15 604/864 Yes Yes N/A 0 2	0	0	0	
Ng, 2018 DD 5 478/4611 No Yes N/A 0 0	0	0	0	
Köhler, 2017 MDD 42 1742/1478 Yes Yes Yes 2 1	1	2	0	
Goldsmith, 2016         MDD, BD         BD: 2         BD: 44/105         BD: No         BD: No         BD: N/A         0         Chronic	0	0	0	
Acute MDD: 8 Acute: 296/281 Acute MDD: Yes Acute MDD: Yes Acute MDD: No MDD: 1				
Chronic MDD: 8 Chronic: 362/439 Chronic MDD: No Chronic MDD: Yes Chronic MDD: N/A				
Liu, 2012 MDD 15 541/444 Yes Yes No 0 1	0	1	0	
Dowlati, 2010 MDD 13 438/350 Yes Yes No 0 4	0	0	0	
Rowland, 2018 BD 6 81/253 Yes Yes N/A 0 0	0	0	0	
Munkholm, 2013 BD 3 39/155 No Yes N/A 0 2	0	0	0	
Π1β				
D'Acunto, 2019 DD 4 72/61 No Yes No 0 1	0	0	0	
Ng, 2018 DD 5 314/895 Yes Yes N/A 0 0	0	0	0	
Köhler, 2017 MDD 22 784/722 No No No 1 0	0	0	0	
Goldsmith, 2016 MDD, BD Acute MDD: 4 Acute MDD: Acute MDD: Yes Acute MDD: Yes N/A 0 Chronic	0	0	0	
Chronic MDD: 4 116/112 Chronic MDD: No Chronic MDD: Yes MDD: 1				
Chronic MDD: 138/190				
Ellul, 2016 MDD 21 824/1085 High-quality studies: Yes High-quality studies: Yes N/A 3 2 Low-quality studies: No Low-quality studies: Yes	0	0	2	
Liu 2012 MDD 10 290/290 No Yes No 1 1	0	0	0	
Dowlati 2010 MDD 9 267/246 No Yes No 1 2	0	0	0	
Howren, 2009 DD 14 323/346 <sup>b</sup> Yes Yes Yes 0 1	1	4	1	
IL-6				
Perrin, 2019 DD 23 1607/1042 Yes Yes N/A 0 3	0	0	0	
Ng, 2018 DD 9 2016/7211 Yes Yes No 0 0	0	1	0	
Köhler, 2017 MDD 42 1587/1183 Yes No No 0 1	1	0	0	
Goldsmith, 2016 MDD, BD BD: 3 BD:102/344 BD: No BD: Yes BD: N/A 0 Chronic	0	0	0	
Acute MDD: 10 Acute MDD: Acute MDD: Yes Acute MDD: Yes Acute MDD: No MDD: 2				
Chronic MDD: 7 306/216 Chronic MDD: Yes Chronic MDD: Yes Chronic MDD: No				
Chronic MDD: 189/211				
Liu, 2012 MDD 18 508/415 Yes Yes No 1 2	0	0	0	
Bizik, 2010 DD 16 433/581 Yes Yes Yes 1 3	0	0	0	
Dowlati, 2010 MDD 16 492/400 Yes Yes No 2 4	0	0	0	
Howren, 2009 DD 61 3020/10598 <sup>b</sup> Yes Yes Yes 1 0	2	12	12	
Rowland, 2018 BD 6 130/471 No Yes N/A 0 0	0	0	0	
	0	0	0	

 Table 2. Results from overlapping meta-analyses of the association between depression and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers

CRP											
Osimo, 2019	DD	17	7761/155728	Yes	Yes	No	2	0	1	0	0
Ng, 2018	DD	9	2513/11991	No	Yes	No	0	1	0	1	0
Howren, 2009	DD	49	4050/23179 <sup>b</sup>	Yes	Yes	Yes	1	0	1	8	8
Rowland, 2018	BD	3	91/329	No	No	N/A	0	0	0	0	0
Fernandes, 2016	BD	11	441/922	Yes	Yes	No	2	0	0	4	0
Dargel, 2015	BD	4	107/297	No	Yes	N/A	2	0	0	0	0
Total											
Primary studies		521					20	35	7	33	23
(Meta-analyses)		(15)					(9)	(11)	(3)	(5)	(2)
Dargel, 2015 Total Primary studies (Meta-analyses)	BD BD	521 (15)	441/922 107/297	Yes No	Yes Yes	NO N/A	2 2 20 (9)	0 0 35 (11)	0 0 7 (3)	4 0 33 (5)	0 0 23 (2)

SMD, standardized mean difference; DD, depressive disorder, BD, bipolar depression; MDD, major depressive disorder; TNF-α, tumor necrosis factor-α; IL-1β, interleukin 1-β; IL-6, interleukin 6; CRP, Creactive protein; N/A, not applicable.

<sup>a</sup>Analysis with insufficient data indicates that sufficient information with which to calculate SMD was not provided in a primary study. <sup>b</sup>Effect sizes in some single population studies were calculated using correlation coefficients. In such cases, the number of all participants in the study was not included in this column.

#### Table 3. Summary of characteristics of overlapping primary studies of peripheral inflammatory biomarkers with errors

Characteristic of error	N	umber of studies	(%)
TNF-a			
Total no. of overlapping studies of TNF-α	79 (100%)		
Total no. of overlapping studies of TNF-α with errors		12 (15.2%)	
Incorrect sample sizes			1 (8.3%)
Incorrectly used SD			8 (66.7%)
Incorrect participant inclusion			1 (8.3%)
Calculation error			2 (16.7%)
Analysis with insufficient data			0 (0%)
ΙL-1β			
Total no. of overlapping studies of IL-1β	73 (100%)		
Total no. of overlapping studies of IL-1β with errors		15 (20.5%)	
Incorrect sample sizes			4 (26.7%)
Incorrectly used SD			6 (40.0%)
Incorrect participant inclusion			1 (6.7%)
Calculation error			2 (13.3%)
Analysis with insufficient data			2 (13.3%)
IL-6			
Total no. of overlapping studies of IL-6	126 (100%)		
Total no. of overlapping studies of IL-6 with errors		22 (17.5%)	
Incorrect sample sizes			5 (22.7%)
Incorrectly used SD			12 (54.5%)
Incorrect participant inclusion			1 (4.6%)
Calculation error			4 (18.2%)
Analysis with insufficient data			0 (0%)
CRP			
Total no. of overlapping studies of CRP	27 (100%)		
Total no. of overlapping studies of CRP with errors		12 (44.4%)	
Incorrect sample sizes			5 (41.7%)
Incorrectly used SD			1 (8.3%)
Incorrect participant inclusion			2 (16.7%)
Calculation error			4 (33.3%)
Analysis with insufficient data			0 (0%)
Total for all four peripheral inflammatory biomarkers			
Total no. of overlapping studies of all peripheral inflammatory biomarkers	305 (100%)		
Total no. of overlapping studies of all peripheral inflammatory		61 (20 0%)	
biomarkers with errors		01 (20.0 /0)	
Incorrect sample sizes			15 (24.6%)
Incorrectly used SD			27 (44.2%)
Incorrect participant inclusion			5 (8.2%)
Calculation error			12 (19.7%)
Analysis with insufficient data			2 (3.3%)

SD, standard deviation; TNF- $\alpha$ , tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$ ; IL-1 $\beta$ , interleukin 1- $\beta$ ; IL-6, interleukin 6; CRP, C-reactive protein. "Analysis with insufficient data" indicates that sufficient information with which to calculate SMD was not provided in a primary study.

Einst andh an maan	Madal	Outcome	Reported		Recalculate	d	Change in	True of data automation array
First author, year	Widdel	metrics	ES (95% CI)	p-value	ES (95% CI)	p-value	results <sup>a</sup>	Type of data extraction error
ΓΝΓ-α								
D'Acunto, 2019	Random effects	Hedges' g	0.35 (-0.01 to 0.70)	0.053	0.35 (0.01 to 0.70)	0.045	None	No errors.
Perrin, 2019	Random effects	SMD	0.40 (0.12 to 0.68)	0.006	0.49 (0.16 to 0.82)	0.004	None	SD (Carvalho, 2013; Lamers, 2013).
Ng, 2018	Random effects	SMD	0.11 (-0.12 to 0.35)	0.351	0.12 (-0.12 to 0.35)	0.334	None	No errors.
Köhler, 2017	Random effects	Hedges' g	0.68 (0.43 to 0.92)	<0.001	0.65 (0.41 to 0.88)	<0.001	None	Sample (Eller, 2009; Farid Hosseini, 2007), SD (O'Donovan, 2013), PI (O'Brien, 2007), and calculation (Baek, 2013; Grassi-Oliveira, 2009),
Goldsmith, 2016	Fixed effect	Hedges' g	-0.16 (-0.53 to 0.21)	0.4	-0.16 (-0.53 to 0.21)	0.386	None	No errors in the BD subgroup.
			0.35 (0.17 to 0.53)	< 0.01	0.39 (0.20 to 0.57)	< 0.001	None	No errors in the acute MDD subgroup.
			0.05 (-0.10 to 0.19)	0.52	0.07 (-0.08 to 0.22)	0.332	None	SD (Einvik, 2012) in the chronic MDD subgroup.
Liu, 2012	Random effects	SMD	0.56 (0.13 to 0.99)	0.01	0.49 (0.10 to 0.89)	0.014	None	SD (Pavon, 2006) and calculation (Tuglu, 2003).
Dowlati, 2010	Random effects	MD	3.97 (2.24 to 5.71)	< 0.001	3.14 (1.61 to 4.66)	<0.001	Changed <sup>b</sup>	SD (O'Brien, 2007; Pavon, 2006; Tuglu, 2003; Yang, 2007).
Rowland, 2018	Random effects	SMD	2.09 (0.82 to 3.36)	< 0.001	2.17 (0.85 to 3.49)	0.001	None	No errors.
Munkholm, 2013	Random effects	SMD	4.31 (-0.57 to 9.19)	0.08	3.16 (0.02 to 6.29)	0.048	Changed	SD (Kapczinski, 2011; O'Brien, 2006).
Total pooled results of	Random effects	SMD	-	-	0.49 (0.34 to 0.65)	<0.001	-	71 primary studies included.
all primary studies								
L-1β								
D'Acunto, 2019	Random effects	Hedges' g	0.47 (-0.20 to 1.15)	0.169	0.26 (-0.27 to 0.78)	0.335	Changed	SD (Miklowitz, 2016).
Ng, 2018	Random effects	SMD	0.64 (0.06 to 1.21)	0.026	0.65 (0.08 to 1.22)	0.026	None	No errors.
Köhler, 2017	Random effects	Hedges' g	0.03 (-0.29 to 0.35)	0.847	0.16 (-0.21 to 0.53)	0.402	Changed	Sample (Alcocer-Gomez, 2014).
Goldsmith, 2016	Fixed effect	Hedges' g	-0.22 (-0.49 to 0.06)	0.13	-0.19 (-0.46 to 0.08)	0.164	None	No errors in the acute MDD subgroup.
			0.21 (-0.04 to 0.47)	0.1	0.22 (-0.04 to 0.47)	0.096	None	SD (Einvik, 2012) in the chronic MDD subgroup.
Ellul, 2016	Random effects	SMD	-0.54 (-1.03 to -0.83) ° 0.10 (-0.45 to 0.66)	0.021 0.715	0.36 (0.03 to 0.70)	0.035	-	Sample (Alcocer-Gomez, 2013; Marques-Deak, 2007; van den Biggelaar, 2006), SD (Pavon, 2006; Piletz, 2006), and ID (Hughes, 2012; Yang, 2007).
Liu, 2012	Random effects	SMD	-0.53 (-1.36 to 0.32)	0.221	-0.13 (-0.79 to 0.53)	0.697	Changed	Sample (Kagaya, 2001) and SD (Pavon, 2006).
Dowlati, 2010	Random effects	MD	-1.58 (-3.59 to 0.43)	0.39	-1.35 (-3.69 to 1.00)	0.26	Changed <sup>b</sup>	Sample (Kagaya, 2001) and SD (Pavon, 2006; Yang, 2007).
Howren, 2009	Random effects	SMD	0.35 (0.03 to 0.67)	0.03	0.24 (-0.15 to 0.63)	0.229	Changed	SD (Kagaya, 2001), PI (Levine, 1999), calculation (Ferketich, 2005; Huang, 2007; Miller, 2002; Owen, 2001), and ID (Hekler, 2007).
Total pooled results of all primary studies	Random effects	SMD	-	-	0.17 (-0.06 to 0.39)	0.143	-	39 primary studies included.

 Comparison of results from overlapping meta-analyses with recalculated effect sizes and confidence intervals

L-6

Perrin, 2019	Random effects	SMD	0.61 (0.36 to 0.85)	< 0.001	0.50 (0.27 to 0.74)	<0.001	Changed	SD(Carvalho, 2013; Lamers, 2013, Maes, 1995c).
Ng, 2018	Random effects	SMD	0.38 (0.16 to 0.60)	< 0.001	0.38 (0.16 to 0.60)	< 0.001	None	Calculation (Nadroski, 2016).
Köhler, 2017	Random effects	Hedges' g	0.62 (0.49 to 0.76)	< 0.001	0.64 (0.50 to 0.78)	< 0.001	None	SD (O'Donovan, 2013) and PI (O'Brien, 2007).
Goldsmith, 2016	Fixed effect	Hedges' g	0 (-0.23 to 0.23)	0.98	0 (-0.23 to 0.23)	0.99	None	No errors in the BD subgroup.
			0.76 (0.56 to 0.95)	< 0.01	0.74 (0.55 to 0.92)	< 0.001	None	No errors in the acute MDD subgroup.
			0.39 (0.2 to 0.59)	< 0.01	0.40 (0.20 to 0.60)	< 0.001	None	SD (Dhabhar, 2009; Einvik, 2012) in the chronic MDD
								subgroup.
Liu, 2012	Random effects	SMD	0.68 (0.44 to 0.92)	< 0.001	0.61 (0.38 to 0.84)	< 0.001	None	Sample (Kagaya, 2001) and SD (Dhabhar, 2009; Pavon, 2006).
Bizik, 2010	Random effects	SMD	1.06 (0.59 to 1.52)	< 0.001	0.71 (0.43 to 0.99)	<0.001	Changed	Sample (Kagaya, 2001) and SD (Alesci, 2005; Dhabhar, 2009; Maes, 1995a).
Dowlati, 2010	Random effects	MD	1.78 (1.23 to 2.33)	< 0.001	1.87 (0.92 to 2.81)	<0.001	Changed <sup>b</sup>	Sample (Kagaya, 2001; O'Brien, 2007) and SD (Dhabhar, 2009; Maes, 1995a; Pavon, 2006; Yang, 2007).
Howren, 2009	Random effects	SMD	0.25 (0.18 to 0.31)	<0.001	0.27 (0.19 to 0.34)	<0.001	None	Sample (Kagaya, 2001), PI (Cyranowski, 2007; Lutgendorf, 1999), calculation (Ferketich, 2005; Jacobson, 2008; Jehn, 2006; Kiecolt-Glaser, 2007; Kudoh, 2001; Maes, 1995a; Maes, 1997; Miller, 2002; Motivala, 2005; Sluzewska, 1995; Soygur, 2007 (cancer and normal)), and ID (Allen-Mersh, 1998; Costanzo, 2005; Ferruci, 2002; Glaser, 2003; Haack, 1999; Hekler, 2007; Koening, 1997; Ranjit, 2007; Steptoe, 2003; Suarez, 2003; Whooley, 2007 (males and females)).
Rowland, 2018	Random effects	SMD	0.67 (-0.08 to 1.42)	0.08	0.63 (-0.13 to 1.39)	0.106	None	No errors.
Munkholm et al., 2013	Random effects	SMD	1.04 (-0.54 to 2.62)	0.2	1.05 (-0.45 to 2.55)	0.17	None	No errors.
Total pooled results of	Random effects	SMD	-	-	0.46 (0.38 to 0.54)	<0.001	-	112 primary studies included.
all primary studies								
CRP								
Osimo, 2019	Random effects	OR	1.46 (1.22 to 1.75)	< 0.001	1.40 (1.31 to 1.50)	< 0.001	None	Sample (Cepeda, 2016; Ekinci, 2017) and PI (Kling, 2007).
Ng, 2018	Random effects	SMD	0.5 (0 to 1)	0.05	0.19 (-0.01 to 0.39)	0.062	Changed	SD (Kop, 2002) and calculation (Bremmer, 2008).
Howren, 2009	Random effects	SMD	0.22 (0.15 to 0.28)	<0.001	0.14 (0.09 to 0.19)	<0.001	None	Sample (Almeida, 2007), PI (Kling, 2006), calculation (Arai, 2006; Hornig, 1998; Hung, 2007; Liukkonen, 2006 (males and females); Miller, 2002; Shimbo, 2006; Vaccarino, 2007), and ID (Danner, 2003 (males and females); Douglas, 2004 (males and females); Komulainen, 2007; Ranjit, 2007; Steptoe, 2003; Suares, 2004).
Rowland, 2018	Random effects	SMD	-0.02 (-0.25 to 0.21)	0.86	-0.02 (-0.25 to 0.21)	0.86	None	No errors.

Fernandes, 2016	Random effects	SMD	0.67 (0.23 to 1.11)	0.003	0.74 (0.32 to 1.16)	0.001	None	Sample (Cunha, 2008; Jacoby, 2016) and calculation (Bai,
								2013; Dickerson, 2015; Hung, 2007; Su, 2011).
Dargel, 2015	Random effects	SMD	0.28 (-0.17 to 0.73)	0.227	0.31 (-0.17 to 0.78)	0.206	None	Sample (Cunha, 2008; Fontoura, 2012).
Total pooled results of	Random effects	SMD	-	-	0.27 (0.21 to 0.33)	<0.001	-	80 primary studies included.
all primary studies								

## 3D, bipolar depression; MDD, major depressive disorder; SMD, standardized mean difference; MD, mean difference; ES, effect size; SD, standard deviation; CI, confidence interval; PI, participant nclusion; ID, insufficient data; TNF-α, tumor necrosis factor-α; IL-1β, interleukin 1-β; IL-6, interleukin 6; CRP, C-reactive protein.

If our recalculation of the pooled ES for each meta-analysis differed from that of the original meta-analysis by 0.1 or more, this is denoted as "changed."

When the MD was converted to SMD, the difference in pooled SMD between the original meta-analysis and our recalculation was 0.1 or more.

The first row of reported ESs presents the results of high-quality studies, and the second row presents the result of low-quality studies. The recalculated ES results from all primary studies.

#### **Online Supplementary Material**

Impact of data extraction errors in meta-analyses on the association between depression and peripheral inflammatory biomarkers: An umbrella review

Supplementary Appendix 1. PRISMA Checklist and MOOSE Checklist Supplementary Figure 1. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated TNF- $\alpha$ . Supplementary Figure 2. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated IL-1 $\beta$ . Supplementary Figure 3. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated IL-6. Supplementary Figure 4. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated CRP. Supplementary Figure 5. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated TNF- $\alpha$ . Supplementary Figure 6. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-1 $\beta$ . Supplementary Figure 7. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-1 $\beta$ . Supplementary Figure 8. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-6. Supplementary Figure 8. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-6. Supplementary Figure 8. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated CRP.

Number of eAppendix: 1

Number of eFigure: 8

## Supplementary Appendix 1. PRISMA checklist and MOOSE Checklist

#### PRISMA 2009 Checklist

Section/topic	#	Checklist item	Reported on page #
TITLE			
Title	1	Identify the report as a systematic review, meta-analysis, or both.	1
ABSTRACT			
Structured summary	2	Provide a structured summary including, as applicable: background; objectives; data sources; study eligibility criteria, participants, and interventions; study appraisal and synthesis methods; results; limitations; conclusions and implications of key findings; systematic review registration number.	4-5
INTRODUCTION			
Rationale	3	Describe the rationale for the review in the context of what is already known.	6
Objectives	4	Provide an explicit statement of questions being addressed with reference to participants, interventions, comparisons, outcomes, and study design (PICOS).	7
METHODS			
Protocol and registration	5	Indicate if a review protocol exists, if and where it can be accessed (e.g., Web address), and, if available, provide registration information including registration number.	8
Eligibility criteria	6	Specify study characteristics (e.g., PICOS, length of follow-up) and report characteristics (e.g., years considered, language, publication status) used as criteria for eligibility, giving rationale.	8-9
Information sources	7	Describe all information sources (e.g., databases with dates of coverage, contact with study authors to identify additional studies) in the search and date last searched.	8-9
Search	8	Present full electronic search strategy for at least one database, including any limits used, such that it could be repeated.	8-9
Study selection	9	State the process for selecting studies (i.e., screening, eligibility, included in systematic review, and, if applicable, included in the meta-analysis).	8-9
Data collection process	10	Describe method of data extraction from reports (e.g., piloted forms, independently, in duplicate) and any processes for obtaining and confirming data from investigators.	9
Data items	11	List and define all variables for which data were sought (e.g., PICOS, funding sources) and any assumptions and simplifications made.	9
Risk of bias in individual studies	12	Describe methods used for assessing risk of bias of individual studies (including specification of whether this was done at the study or outcome level), and how this information is to be used in any data synthesis.	10-11

Section/topic	#	Checklist item	Reported on page #
Summary measures	13	State the principal summary measures (e.g., risk ratio, difference in means).	10-11
Synthesis of results	14	Describe the methods of handling data and combining results of studies, if done, including measures of consistency (e.g., I <sup>2</sup> ) for each meta-analysis.	10-11
Risk of bias across studies	15	Specify any assessment of risk of bias that may affect the cumulative evidence (e.g., publication bias, selective reporting within studies).	10-11
Additional analyses	16	Describe methods of additional analyses (e.g., sensitivity or subgroup analyses, meta-regression), if done, indicating which were pre-specified.	10-11
RESULTS			
Study selection	17	Give numbers of studies screened, assessed for eligibility, and included in the review, with reasons for exclusions at each stage, ideally with a flow diagram.	12
Study characteristics	18	For each study, present characteristics for which data were extracted (e.g., study size, PICOS, follow-up period) and provide the citations.	12
Risk of bias within studies	19	Present data on risk of bias of each study and, if available, any outcome level assessment (see item 12).	12
Results of individual studies	20	For all outcomes considered (benefits or harms), present, for each study: (a) simple summary data for each intervention group (b) effect estimates and confidence intervals, ideally with a forest plot.	12-13, Table 4
Synthesis of results	21	Present results of each meta-analysis done, including confidence intervals and measures of consistency.	13-14 Table 4
Risk of bias across studies	22	Present results of any assessment of risk of bias across studies (see Item 15).	13-14, Supplements
Additional analysis	23	Give results of additional analyses, if done (e.g., sensitivity or subgroup analyses, meta-regression [see Item 16]).	12-14
DISCUSSION			
Summary of evidence	24	Summarize the main findings including the strength of evidence for each main outcome; consider their relevance to key groups (e.g., healthcare providers, users, and policy makers).	15-17
Limitations	25	Discuss limitations at study and outcome level (e.g., risk of bias), and at review-level (e.g., incomplete retrieval of identified research, reporting bias).	17-18
Conclusions	26	Provide a general interpretation of the results in the context of other evidence, and implications for future research.	18
FUNDING			
Funding	27	Describe sources of funding for the systematic review and other support (e.g., supply of data); role of funders for the systematic review.	19

*From:* Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, The PRISMA Group (2009). Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement. PLoS Med 6(7): e1000097. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed1000097

Item No	Recommendation	Reported on Page No
Reporting	of background should include	
1	Problem definition	6-7
2	Hypothesis statement	6-7
3	Description of study outcome(s)	6-7
4	Type of exposure or intervention used	6-7
5	Type of study designs used	6-7
6	Study population	6-7
Reporting	of search strategy should include	
7	Qualifications of searchers (e.g., librarians and investigators)	NA
8	Search strategy, including time period included in the synthesis and key words	8
9	Effort to include all available studies, including contact with authors	8-9
10	Databases and registries searched	8
11	Search software used, name and version, including special features used (e.g., explosion)	9-10
12	Use of hand searching (e.g., reference lists of obtained articles)	8-9
13	List of citations located and those excluded, including justification	Figure 1
14	Method of addressing articles published in languages other than English	9
15	Method of handling abstracts and unpublished studies	NA
16	Description of any contact with authors	NA
Reporting	of methods should include	
17	Description of relevance or appropriateness of studies assembled for assessing the hypothesis to be tested	8-9
18	Rationale for the selection and coding of data (e.g., sound clinical principles or convenience)	8-9
19	Documentation of how data were classified and coded (e.g., multiple raters, blinding and interrater reliability)	9-10, 18
20	Assessment of confounding (e.g., comparability of cases and controls in studies where appropriate)	8-9
21	Assessment of study quality, including blinding of quality assessors, stratification or regression on possible predictors of study results	NA
22	Assessment of heterogeneity	11
23	Description of statistical methods (e.g., complete description of fixed or random effects models, justification of whether the chosen models account for predictors of study results, dose-response models, or cumulative meta-analysis) in sufficient detail to be replicated	10-11
24	Provision of appropriate tables and graphics	Tables 1-4, Figure 1, Supplement file

Item No	Recommendation							
Reporting	of results should include							
25	Graphic summarizing individual study estimates and overall estimate							
26	Table giving descriptive information for each study included	Table 1						
27	Results of sensitivity testing (e.g., subgroup analysis)							
28	Indication of statistical uncertainty of findings							
Reporting	of discussion should include							
29	Quantitative assessment of bias (e.g., publication bias)	NA						
30	Justification for exclusion (e.g., exclusion of non-English language citations)							
31	Assessment of quality of included studies	NA						
Reporting	of conclusions should include							
32	Consideration of alternative explanations for observed results	15-17						
33	Generalization of the conclusions (i.e., appropriate for the data presented and within the domain of the literature review)	15-17						
34	Guidelines for future research	NA						
35	Disclosure of funding source	19						

*From*: Stroup DF, Berlin JA, Morton SC, et al, for the Meta-analysis Of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) Group. Meta-analysis of Observational Studies in Epidemiology. A Proposal for Reporting. *JAMA*. 2000;283(15):2008-2012. doi: 10.1001/jama.283.15.2008.

Transcribed from the original paper within the NEUROSURGERY® Editorial Office, Atlanta, GA, United Sates. August 2012.

Al-Hakeim 2015 (e4) Baek & Park, 2013 (e9) Brambilla, 1998 (e15) Brambilla, 2004 (e16) Brietzke, 2009 (e18) Camardese, 2011 (e19) Carvalho, 2013 (e21) Charlton, 2018 (e25) Cmkovic, 2012 (e26) Dahl, 2014 (e28) Dinan, 2009 (e34) Diniz, 2010 (e35) Dome, 2009 (e36) Du, 2013 (e39) Duniic-Kostic, 2013 (e40) Einvik, 2012 (e42) Eller, 2008 (e44) Eller, 2009 (e45) Farid Hosseini, 2007 (e49) Fiedorowicz, 2015 (e51) Fitzgerald, 2005 (e52) Fornaro, 2013 (e55) Forti, 2010 (e56) Gabbay, 2009a (e59) Gabbay, 2009b (e60) Grassi-Oliveira, 2009 (e62) Ho, 2015 (e68) Hocaoglu, 2012 (e69) Huang, 2007 (e73) Hughes, 2012 (e74) Hung, 2007 (e75) Jacoby, 2016 (e79) Kagaya, 2001 (e81) Kahl, 2005 (e82) Kahl 2015 (e83) Kahl, 2017 (e84) Kapczinski, 2011 (e85) Karlovic, 2012 (e86) Lamers, 2013 (e94) Landmann, 1997 (e95) Leo, 2006 (e97) Li, 2013 (e99) Maes, 2012a (e109) Maes, 2012b (e110) Marinho, 2012 (e111) Martinac, 2017 (e113) Miklowitz, 2016 (e116) Mikova, 2001 (e117) Milaneschi, 2009 (e118) O'Brien, 2006a (e129) O'Brien, 2007 (e130) O'Donovan, 2013 (e131) Ortiz-Domi'nguez, 2007 (e132) Pavon, 2006 (e139) Penninx, 2003 (e140) Piletz, 2009 (e142) Rudzki, 2017 (e146) Schmidt, 2014 (e148) Simon, 2008 (e153) Song, 2009 (e157) Spanemberg, 2014 (e160) Su, 2011 (e161) Sutcigil, 2007 (e162) Trzonkowski 2004 (e168) Tuglu, 2003 (e170) Vetta, 2001 (e174) Weinstein, 2010 (e177) Yang, 2005 (e180) Yang, 2007 (e181) Yoshimura, 2009 (e182) Zoga, 2014 (e184) Overall (I<sup>2</sup> = 87.6%)



**Supplementary Figure 1. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated TNF-α.** TNF-α, tumor necrosis factor-alpha; SMD, standardized mean difference; CI, confidence interval.



**Supplementary Figure 2. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated IL-1β.** IL-1β, interleukin 1-beta; SMD, standardized mean difference; CI, confidence interval.



**Supplementary Figure 3. Forest plot of primary studies that investigated IL-6.** IL-6, interleukin 6; SMD, standardized mean difference; CI, confidence interval.

Almeida, 2007 (e6) Andrei, 2007 (e7) Arai, 2006 (e8) Bai, 2014 (e11) Bremmer, 2008 (e17) Cepeda, 2016 (e22) Chamberlain, 2018 (e23) Chang, 2016 (e24) Cunha, 2008 (e27) Danese, 2008 (e29) De Berardis, 2008 (e30) Dickerson, 2015 (e32) Dome, 2009 (e36) Douglas, 2004 (e37) Dressler, 2006, female (e38) Dressler, 2006, male (e38) Ekinci, 2017(e43) Elderkin-Thompson, 2012 (e41) Elovainio, 2006 (e46) Empana, 2005 (e47) Fontoura, 2012 (e53) Forti, 2010 (e56) Gallagher, 2017 (e61) Hafner, 2008 (e63) Hannestad, 2013 (e64) Hemingway, 2003 (e65) Hope, 2011 (e70) Hornig, 1998 (e71) Huang & Lin, 2007, female (e72) Huang & Lin, 2007, male (e72) Hung, 2007 (e75) Jacoby, 2016 (e77) Janszky, 2005 (e78) Joyce, 1992 (e80) Kop, 2002 (e89) Ladwig, 2005 (e93) Lanquillon, 2000 (e96) Lesperance, 2004 (e98) Liukkonen, 2006, female (e100) Liukkonen, 2006, male (e100) Loucks, 2006, female (e101) Loucks, 2006, male (e101) Lutgendorf, 2004 (e102) Ma, 2010 (e104) McDade, 2006 (e114) Melamed, 2004, female (e115) Melamed, 2004, male (e115) Milaneschi, 2009 (e118) Miller, 2002 (e119) Miller, 2005a (e120) Miller, 2005b (e121) Moorman, 2007 (e122) Nadrowski, 2016 (e126) Naghashpour, 2011 (e127) O'Brien, 2006 (e129) Pan. 2008 (e135) Panagiotakos, 2004, female (e136) Panagiotakos, 2004, male (e136) Park, 2014 (e138) Penninx, 2003 (e140) Rothermundt, 2001 (e144) Schins, 2005 (e147) Seidel, 1995 (e149) Shimbo, 2006 (e150) Shin, 2016 (e151) Sluzewska, 1996 (e155) Su, 2011 (e161) Taylor, 2006 (e163) Thomas, 2005 (e164) Tiemeier, 2003 (e165) Toker, 2005, female (e166) Toker, 2005, male (e166) Tsai, 2014 (e169) Tuglu, 2003 (e170) Vaccarino, 2007 (e171) Vogelzangs, 2014 (e175) Wei, 2017 (e176) Whooley, 2007, female (e178) Whooley, 2007, male (e178) Wium-Andersen, 2014 (e179) Overall (I2 = 87.9%)





**Supplementary Figure 5. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated TNF-***α***.** TNF-*α*, tumor necrosis factor-alpha.



**Supplementary Figure 6. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-1***β***.** IL-1*β*, interleukin 1-beta.



Supplementary Figure 7. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated IL-6. IL-6, interleukin 6.



Supplementary Figure 8. Funnel plot of primary studies that investigated CRP. CRP, C-reactive protein.

#### **Supplementary References**

- 1 Ai AL, Kronfol Z, Seymour E, Bolling SF. Effects of mood state and psychosocial functioning on plasma Interleukin-6 in adult patients before cardiac surgery. *Int J Psychiatry Med* 2005; **35**: 363-76.
- 2 Alcocer-Gomez E, de Miguel M, Casas-Barquero N, et al. NLRP3 inflammasome is activated in mononuclear blood cells from patients with major depressive disorder. *Brain Behav Immun* 2014; **36**: 111-7.
- 3 Alesci S, Martinez PE, Kelkar S, et al. Major depression is associated with significant diurnal elevations in plasma interleukin-6 levels, a shift of its circadian rhythm, and loss of physiological complexity in its secretion: clinical implications. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2005; **90**: 2522-30.
- 4 Al-Hakeim HK, Al-Rammahi DA, Al-Dujaili AH. IL-6, IL-18, sIL-2R, and TNFα proinflammatory markers in depression and schizophrenia patients who are free of overt inflammation. *J Affect Disord* 2015; **182**: 106-14.
- 5 Allen AP, Naughton M, Dowling J, et al. Kynurenine pathway metabolism and the neurobiology of treatment-resistant depression: Comparison of multiple ketamine infusions and electroconvulsive therapy. *J Psychiatr Res* 2018; **100**: 24-32.
- 6 Almeida OP, Norman P, Hankey GJ, Jamrozik K, Flicker L. The association between C-reactive protein concentration and depression in later life is due to poor physical health: results from the Health in Men Study (HIMS). *Psychol Med* 2007; **37**: 1775-86.
- Andrei AM, Fraguas R, Jr., Telles RM, et al. Major depressive disorder and inflammatory markers in elderly patients with heart failure.
   *Psychosomatics* 2007; 48: 319-24.
- Arai H, Takechi H, Wada T, et al. Usefulness of measuring serum markers in addition to comprehensive geriatric assessment for cognitive impairment and depressive mood in the elderly. *Geriatr Gerontol Int* 2006; **6**: 7-14.

- 9 Baek D, Park Y. Association between erythrocyte n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids and biomarkers of inflammation and oxidative stress in patients with and without depression. *Prostaglandins Leukot Essent Fatty Acids* 2013; **89**: 291-6.
- Bahrini L, Ouanes S, Ghachem R. Inflammatory profile in depression and associated clinical and sociodemographic features in a
   Middle-Eastern North-African population. *J Affect Disord* 2016; **198**: 122-6.
- 11 Bai YM, Su TP, Tsai SJ, et al. Comparison of inflammatory cytokine levels among type I/type II and manic/hypomanic/euthymic/depressive states of bipolar disorder. *J Affect Disord* 2014; **166**: 187-92.
- 12 Basterzi AD, Aydemir C, Kisa C, et al. IL-6 levels decrease with SSRI treatment in patients with major depression. *Hum Psychopharmacol* 2005; **20**: 473-6.
- 13 Berk M, Wadee AA, Kuschke RH, O'Neill-Kerr A. Acute phase proteins in major depression. *J Psychosom Res* 1997; **43**: 529-34.
- 14 Blom EH, Lekander M, Ingvar M, Åsberg M, Mobarrez F, Serlachius E. Pro-inflammatory cytokines are elevated in adolescent females with emotional disorders not treated with SSRIs. *J Affect Disord* 2012; **136**: 716-23.
- Brambilla F, Maggioni M. Blood levels of cytokines in elderly patients with major depressive disorder. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* 1998;
   97: 309-13.
- 16 Brambilla F, Monteleone P, Maj M. Interleukin-1beta and tumor necrosis factor-alpha in children with major depressive disorder or dysthymia. *J Affect Disord* 2004; **78**: 273-7.
- 17 Bremmer MA, Beekman AT, Deeg DJ, et al. Inflammatory markers in late-life depression: results from a population-based study. *J* Affect Disord 2008; **106**: 249-55.
- 18 Brietzke E, Stertz L, Fernandes BS, et al. Comparison of cytokine levels in depressed, manic and euthymic patients with bipolar

disorder. J Affect Disord 2009; 116: 214-7.

- 19 Camardese G, Pizi G, Marino M, et al. Immune-inflammatory response changes in patients with major depressive disorder. *Journal of Psychopathology* 2011; **17**: 396-403.
- 20 Carvalho LA, Juruena MF, Papadopoulos AS, et al. Clomipramine in vitro reduces glucocorticoid receptor function in healthy subjects but not in patients with major depression. *Neuropsychopharmacology : official publication of the American College of Neuropsychopharmacology* 2008; **33**: 3182-9.
- 21 Carvalho LA, Torre JP, Papadopoulos AS, et al. Lack of clinical therapeutic benefit of antidepressants is associated overall activation of the inflammatory system. *J Affect Disord* 2013; **148**: 136-40.
- Cepeda MS, Stang P, Makadia R. Depression Is Associated With High Levels of C-Reactive Protein and Low Levels of Fractional
   Exhaled Nitric Oxide: Results From the 2007-2012 National Health and Nutrition Examination Surveys. *J Clin Psychiatry* 2016; 77: 1666-71.
- 23 Chamberlain SR, Cavanagh J, de Boer P, et al. Treatment-resistant depression and peripheral C-reactive protein. *The British journal of psychiatry : the journal of mental science* 2019; **214**: 11-9.
- Chang HH, Wang TY, Lee IH, et al. C-reactive protein: A differential biomarker for major depressive disorder and bipolar II disorder.
   *World J Biol Psychiatry* 2017; 18: 63-70.
- 25 Charlton RA, Lamar M, Zhang A, et al. Associations between pro-inflammatory cytokines, learning, and memory in late-life depression and healthy aging. *Int J Geriatr Psychiatry* 2018; **33**: 104-12.
- 26 Crnkovic D, Buljan D, Karlovic D, Krmek M. Connection between inflammatory markers, antidepressants and depression. Acta Clin

*Croat* 2012; **51**: 25-33.

- 27 Cunha AB, Andreazza AC, Gomes FA, et al. Investigation of serum high-sensitive C-reactive protein levels across all mood states in bipolar disorder. *Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 2008; **258**: 300-4.
- 28 Dahl J, Ormstad H, Aass HC, et al. The plasma levels of various cytokines are increased during ongoing depression and are reduced to normal levels after recovery. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2014; **45**: 77-86.
- 29 Danese A, Moffitt TE, Pariante CM, Ambler A, Poulton R, Caspi A. Elevated inflammation levels in depressed adults with a history of childhood maltreatment. *Arch Gen Psychiatry* 2008; **65**: 409-15.
- 30 De Berardis D, Conti CM, Campanella D, et al. Evaluation of C-reactive protein and total serum cholesterol in adult patients with bipolar disorder. *Int J Immunopathol Pharmacol* 2008; **21**: 319-24.
- 31 Dhabhar FS, Burke HM, Epel ES, et al. Low serum IL-10 concentrations and loss of regulatory association between IL-6 and IL-10 in adults with major depression. *J Psychiatr Res* 2009; **43**: 962-9.
- 32 Dickerson F, Katsafanas E, Schweinfurth LA, et al. Immune alterations in acute bipolar depression. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* 2015; 132:
   204-10.
- 33 Dimopoulos N, Piperi C, Psarra V, Lea RW, Kalofoutis A. Increased plasma levels of 8-iso-PGF2alpha and IL-6 in an elderly population with depression. *Psychiatry Res* 2008; **161**: 59-66.
- 34 Dinan T, Siggins L, Scully P, O'Brien S, Ross P, Stanton C. Investigating the inflammatory phenotype of major depression: focus on cytokines and polyunsaturated fatty acids. *J Psychiatr Res* 2009; **43**: 471-6.
- 35 Diniz BS, Teixeira AL, Talib LL, Mendonca VA, Gattaz WF, Forlenza OV. Increased soluble TNF receptor 2 in antidepressant-free

patients with late-life depression. J Psychiatr Res 2010; 44: 917-20.

- 36 Dome P, Teleki Z, Rihmer Z, et al. Circulating endothelial progenitor cells and depression: a possible novel link between heart and soul. *Mol Psychiatry* 2009; **14**: 523-31.
- 37 Douglas KM, Taylor AJ, O'Malley PG. Relationship between depression and C-reactive protein in a screening population. *Psychosom Med* 2004; 66: 679-83.
- 38 Dressler WW, Balieiro MC, Ribeiro RP, Dos-Santos JE. Depressive symptoms and C-reactive protein in a Brazilian urban community. Braz J Med Biol Res 2006; 39: 1013-9.
- 39 Du Y-J, Li B, Zhang H-Y, et al. Airway inflammation and hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis activity in asthmatic adults with depression. *The Journal of asthma : official journal of the Association for the Care of Asthma* 2013; **50**: 274-81.
- 40 Dunjic-Kostic B, Ivkovic M, Radonjic NV, et al. Melancholic and atypical major depression--connection between cytokines, psychopathology and treatment. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2013; **43**: 1-6.
- 41 Elderkin-Thompson V, Irwin MR, Hellemann G, Kumar A. Interleukin-6 and memory functions of encoding and recall in healthy and depressed elderly adults. *Am J Geriatr Psychiatry* 2012; **20**: 753-63.
- 42 Einvik G, Vistnes M, Hrubos-Strom H, et al. Circulating cytokine concentrations are not associated with major depressive disorder in a community-based cohort. *Gen Hosp Psychiatry* 2012; **34**: 262-7.
- 43 Ekinci O, Ekinci A. The connections among suicidal behavior, lipid profile and low-grade inflammation in patients with major depressive disorder: a specific relationship with the neutrophil-to-lymphocyte ratio. *Nord J Psychiatry* 2017; **71**: 574-80.
- 44 Eller T, Vasar V, Shlik J, Maron E. Pro-inflammatory cytokines and treatment response to escitalopram in major depressive disorder.

Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry 2008; 32: 445-50.

- Eller T, Aluoja A, Maron E, Vasar V. Soluble interleukin-2 receptor and tumor necrosis factor levels in depressed patients in Estonia.
   *Medicina (Kaunas)* 2009; 45: 971-7.
- 46 Elovainio M, Keltikangas-Jarvinen L, Pulkki-Raback L, et al. Depressive symptoms and C-reactive protein: the Cardiovascular Risk in Young Finns Study. *Psychol Med* 2006; **36**: 797-805.
- Empana JP, Sykes DH, Luc G, et al. Contributions of depressive mood and circulating inflammatory markers to coronary heart disease
   in healthy European men: the Prospective Epidemiological Study of Myocardial Infarction (PRIME). *Circulation* 2005; 111: 2299 305.
- Eskandari F, Martinez PE, Torvik S, et al. Low bone mass in premenopausal women with depression. *Arch Intern Med* 2007; 167:
  2329-36.
- Farid Hosseini R, Jabbari Azad F, Talaee A, et al. Assessment of the immune system activity in Iranian patients with Major Depression
   Disorder (MDD). *Iran J Immunol* 2007; 4: 38-43.
- Ferketich AK, Ferguson JP, Binkley PF. Depressive symptoms and inflammation among heart failure patients. *Am Heart J* 2005; 150: 132-6.
- 51 Fiedorowicz JG, Prossin AR, Johnson CP, Christensen GE, Magnotta VA, Wemmie JA. Peripheral inflammation during abnormal mood states in bipolar I disorder. *J Affect Disord* 2015; **187**: 172-8.
- 52 Fitzgerald P, O'Brien SM, Scully P, Rijkers K, Scott LV, Dinan TG. Cutaneous glucocorticoid receptor sensitivity and proinflammatory cytokine levels in antidepressant-resistant depression. *Psychol Med* 2006; **36**: 37-43.

- 53 Fontoura PC, Pinto VL, Matsuura C, et al. Defective nitric oxide-cyclic guanosine monophosphate signaling in patients with bipolar disorder: a potential role for platelet dysfunction. *Psychosom Med* 2012; **74**: 873-7.
- 54 Fornaro M, Martino M, Battaglia F, Colicchio S, Perugi G. Increase in IL-6 levels among major depressive disorder patients after a 6week treatment with duloxetine 60 mg/day: a preliminary observation. *Neuropsychiatr Dis Treat* 2011; **7**: 51-6.
- 55 Fornaro M, Rocchi G, Escelsior A, Contini P, Martino M. Might different cytokine trends in depressed patients receiving duloxetine indicate differential biological backgrounds. *J Affect Disord* 2013; **145**: 300-7.
- 56 Forti P, Rietti E, Pisacane N, et al. Blood inflammatory proteins and risk of incident depression in the elderly. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord* 2010; **29**: 11-20.
- 57 Frommberger UH, Bauer J, Haselbauer P, Fraulin A, Riemann D, Berger M. Interleukin-6-(IL-6) plasma levels in depression and schizophrenia: comparison between the acute state and after remission. *Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 1997; **247**: 228-33.
- 58 Frodl T, Carballedo A, Hughes MM, et al. Reduced expression of glucocorticoid-inducible genes GILZ and SGK-1: high IL-6 levels are associated with reduced hippocampal volumes in major depressive disorder. *Transl Psychiatry* 2012; **2**: e88.
- Gabbay V, Klein RG, Alonso CM, et al. Immune system dysregulation in adolescent major depressive disorder. *J Affect Disord* 2009;
   115: 177-82.
- 60 Gabbay V, Klein RG, Guttman LE, et al. A preliminary study of cytokines in suicidal and nonsuicidal adolescents with major depression. *J Child Adolesc Psychopharmacol* 2009; **19**: 423-30.
- 61 Gallagher D, Kiss A, Lanctot K, Herrmann N. Depression with inflammation: longitudinal analysis of a proposed depressive subtype in community dwelling older adults. *Int J Geriatr Psychiatry* 2017; **32**: e18-e24.

- 62 Grassi-Oliveira R, Brietzke E, Pezzi JC, Lopes RP, Teixeira AL, Bauer ME. Increased soluble tumor necrosis factor-alpha receptors in patients with major depressive disorder. *Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 2009; **63**: 202-8.
- 63 Hafner S, Baghai TC, Eser D, et al. C-reactive protein is associated with polymorphisms of the angiotensin-converting enzyme gene in major depressed patients. *J Psychiatr Res* 2008; **42**: 163-5.
- 64 Hannestad J, DellaGioia N, Gallezot J-D, et al. The neuroinflammation marker translocator protein is not elevated in individuals with mild-to-moderate depression: a [<sup>11</sup>C]PBR28 PET study. *Brain, behavior, and immunity* 2013; **33**: 131-8.
- 65 Hemingway H, Shipley M, Mullen MJ, et al. Social and psychosocial influences on inflammatory markers and vascular function in civil servants (the Whitehall II study). *Am J Cardiol* 2003; **92**: 984-7.
- 66 Hernandez ME, Mendieta D, Martinez-Fong D, et al. Variations in circulating cytokine levels during 52 week course of treatment with SSRI for major depressive disorder. *Eur Neuropsychopharmacol* 2008; **18**: 917-24.
- 67 Hernandez ME, Mendieta D, Perez-Tapia M, et al. Effect of selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors and immunomodulator on cytokines levels: an alternative therapy for patients with major depressive disorder. *Clin Dev Immunol* 2013; **2013**: 267871.
- 68 Ho PS, Yeh YW, Huang SY, Liang CS. A shift toward T helper 2 responses and an increase in modulators of innate immunity in depressed patients treated with escitalopram. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2015; **53**: 246-55.
- 69 Hocaoglu C, Kural B, Aliyazicioglu R, Deger O, Cengiz S. IL-1beta, IL-6, IL-8, IL-10, IFN-gamma, TNF-alpha and its relationship with lipid parameters in patients with major depression. *Metab Brain Dis* 2012; **27**: 425-30.
- 70 Hope S, Dieset I, Agartz I, et al. Affective symptoms are associated with markers of inflammation and immune activation in bipolar disorders but not in schizophrenia. *J Psychiatr Res* 2011; 45: 1608-16.

- Hornig M, Goodman DB, Kamoun M, Amsterdam JD. Positive and negative acute phase proteins in affective subtypes. *J Affect Disord* 1998; 49: 9-18.
- Huang TL, Lin FC. High-sensitivity C-reactive protein levels in patients with major depressive disorder and bipolar mania. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2007; **31**: 370-2.
- Huang TL, Lee CT. T-helper 1/T-helper 2 cytokine imbalance and clinical phenotypes of acute-phase major depression. *Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 2007; 61: 415-20.
- Hughes MM, Carballedo A, McLoughlin DM, et al. Tryptophan depletion in depressed patients occurs independent of kynurenine
   pathway activation. *Brain Behav Immun* 2012; 26: 979-87.
- 75 Hung YJ, Hsieh CH, Chen YJ, et al. Insulin sensitivity, proinflammatory markers and adiponectin in young males with different subtypes of depressive disorder. *Clin Endocrinol (Oxf)* 2007; **67**: 784-9.
- Jacobson CM, Rosenfeld B, Pessin H, Breitbart W. Depression and IL-6 blood plasma concentrations in advanced cancer patients.
   *Psychosomatics* 2008; **49**: 64-6.
- 77 Jacoby AS, Munkholm K, Vinberg M, Pedersen BK, Kessing LV. Cytokines, brain-derived neurotrophic factor and C-reactive protein in bipolar I disorder - Results from a prospective study. *J Affect Disord* 2016; **197**: 167-74.
- Janszky I, Lekander M, Blom M, Georgiades A, Ahnve S. Self-rated health and vital exhaustion, but not depression, is related to inflammation in women with coronary heart disease. *Brain Behav Immun* 2005; 19: 555-63.
- Jehn CF, Kuehnhardt D, Bartholomae A, et al. Biomarkers of depression in cancer patients. *Cancer* 2006; **107**: 2723-9.
- 80 Joyce PR, Hawes CR, Mulder RT, Sellman JD, Wilson DA, Boswell DR. Elevated levels of acute phase plasma proteins in major

depression. Biol Psychiatry 1992; 32: 1035-41.

- 81 Kagaya A, Kugaya A, Takebayashi M, et al. Plasma concentrations of interleukin-1beta, interleukin-6, soluble interleukin-2 receptor and tumor necrosis factor alpha of depressed patients in Japan. *Neuropsychobiology* 2001; **43**: 59-62.
- 82 Kahl KG, Bester M, Greggersen W, et al. Visceral fat deposition and insulin sensitivity in depressed women with and without comorbid borderline personality disorder. *Psychosom Med* 2005; **67**: 407-12.
- 83 Kahl KG, Schweiger U, Pars K, et al. Adrenal gland volume, intra-abdominal and pericardial adipose tissue in major depressive disorder. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2015; **58**: 1-8.
- 84 Kahl KG, Herrmann J, Stubbs B, et al. Pericardial adipose tissue and the metabolic syndrome is increased in patients with chronic major depressive disorder compared to acute depression and controls. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2017; **72**: 30-5.
- Kapczinski F, Dal-Pizzol F, Teixeira AL, et al. Peripheral biomarkers and illness activity in bipolar disorder. *J Psychiatr Res* 2011; 45: 156-61.
- 86 Karlovic D, Serretti A, Vrkic N, Martinac M, Marcinko D. Serum concentrations of CRP, IL-6, TNF-alpha and cortisol in major depressive disorder with melancholic or atypical features. *Psychiatry Res* 2012; **198**: 74-80.
- 87 Kiecolt-Glaser JK, Belury MA, Porter K, Beversdorf DQ, Lemeshow S, Glaser R. Depressive symptoms, omega-6:omega-3 fatty acids, and inflammation in older adults. *Psychosom Med* 2007; 69: 217-24.
- 88 Kim YK, Lee SW, Kim SH, et al. Differences in cytokines between non-suicidal patients and suicidal patients in major depression. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2008; **32**: 356-61.
- 89 Kop WJ, Gottdiener JS, Tangen CM, et al. Inflammation and coagulation factors in persons > 65 years of age with symptoms of

depression but without evidence of myocardial ischemia. Am J Cardiol 2002; 89: 419-24.

- 90 Krogh J, Benros ME, Jorgensen MB, Vesterager L, Elfving B, Nordentoft M. The association between depressive symptoms, cognitive function, and inflammation in major depression. *Brain Behav Immun* 2014; **35**: 70-6.
- 91 Kubera M, Kenis G, Bosmans E, et al. Plasma levels of interleukin-6, interleukin-10, and interleukin-1 receptor antagonist in depression: comparison between the acute state and after remission. *Pol J Pharmacol* 2000; **52**: 237-41.
- 92 Kudoh A, Katagai H, Takazawa T. Plasma inflammatory cytokine response to surgical trauma in chronic depressed patients. *Cytokine* 2001; **13**: 104-8.
- 93 Ladwig K-H, Marten-Mittag B, Löwel H, Döring A, Koenig W, Study M-KAC. C-reactive protein, depressed mood, and the prediction of coronary heart disease in initially healthy men: results from the MONICA-KORA Augsburg Cohort Study 1984-1998. *Eur Heart J* 2005; 26: 2537-42.
- 94 Lamers F, Vogelzangs N, Merikangas KR, de Jonge P, Beekman ATF, Penninx BWJH. Evidence for a differential role of HPA-axis function, inflammation and metabolic syndrome in melancholic versus atypical depression. *Mol Psychiatry* 2013; 18: 692-9.
- 95 Landmann R, Schaub B, Link S, Wacker HR. Unaltered monocyte function in patients with major depression before and after three months of antidepressive therapy. *Biol Psychiatry* 1997; **41**: 675-81.
- 96 Lanquillon S, Krieg JC, Bening-Abu-Shach U, Vedder H. Cytokine production and treatment response in major depressive disorder. *Neuropsychopharmacology* 2000; 22: 370-9.
- 97 Leo R, Di Lorenzo G, Tesauro M, et al. Association between enhanced soluble CD40 ligand and proinflammatory and prothrombotic states in major depressive disorder: pilot observations on the effects of selective serotonin reuptake inhibitor therapy. *J Clin Psychiatry*

2006; **67**: 1760-6.

- Lesperance F, Frasure-Smith N, Theroux P, Irwin M. The association between major depression and levels of soluble intercellular adhesion molecule 1, interleukin-6, and C-reactive protein in patients with recent acute coronary syndromes. *Am J Psychiatry* 2004; 161: 271-7.
- 99 Li Z, Qi D, Chen J, et al. Venlafaxine inhibits the upregulation of plasma tumor necrosis factor-alpha (TNF-α) in the Chinese patients with major depressive disorder: a prospective longitudinal study. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 2013; **38**: 107-14.
- Liukkonen T, Silvennoinen-Kassinen S, Jokelainen J, et al. The Association Between C-Reactive Protein Levels and Depression:
   Results from the Northern Finland 1966 Birth Cohort Study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2006; 60: 825-30.
- 101 Loucks EB, Berkman LF, Gruenewald TL, Seeman TE. Relation of social integration to inflammatory marker concentrations in men and women 70 to 79 years. *Am J Cardiol* 2006; **97**: 1010-6.
- 102 Lutgendorf SK, Russell D, Ullrich P, Harris TB, Wallace R. Religious participation, interleukin-6, and mortality in older adults. *Health Psychol* 2004; **23**: 465-75.
- 103 Lyness JM, Moynihan JA, Williford DJ, Cox C, Caine ED. Depression, medical illness, and interleukin-1beta in older cardiac patients. Int J Psychiatry Med 2001; 31: 305-10.
- Ma Y, Chiriboga DE, Pagoto SL, et al. Association between Depression and C-Reactive Protein. *Cardiol Res Pract* 2010; 2011:
   286509-.
- 105 Maes M, Meltzer HY, Bosmans E, et al. Increased plasma concentrations of interleukin-6, soluble interleukin-6, soluble interleukin-2 and transferrin receptor in major depression. *J Affect Disord* 1995; **34**: 301-9.

- 106 Maes M, Meltzer HY, Buckley P, Bosmans E. Plasma-soluble interleukin-2 and transferrin receptor in schizophrenia and major depression. *Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 1995; 244: 325-9.
- 107 Maes M, Bosmans E, Meltzer HY. Immunoendocrine aspects of major depression. Relationships between plasma interleukin-6 and soluble interleukin-2 receptor, prolactin and cortisol. *Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 1995; **245**: 172-8.
- 108 Maes M, Bosmans E, De Jongh R, Kenis G, Vandoolaeghe E, Neels H. Increased serum IL-6 and IL-1 receptor antagonist concentrations in major depression and treatment resistant depression. *Cytokine* 1997; **9**: 853-8.
- 109 Maes M, Ringel K, Kubera M, Berk M, Rybakowski J. Increased autoimmune activity against 5-HT: a key component of depression that is associated with inflammation and activation of cell-mediated immunity, and with severity and staging of depression. J Affect Disord 2012; 136: 386-92.
- Maes M, Mihaylova I, Kubera M, Ringel K. Activation of cell-mediated immunity in depression: association with inflammation,
   melancholia, clinical staging and the fatigue and somatic symptom cluster of depression. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2012; 36: 169-75.
- Marinho PE, Castro CM, Raposo MC, Guerra RO, de Andrade AD. Depressive symptoms, inflammatory markers and body
   composition in elderly with and without chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). *Arch Gerontol Geriatr* 2012; 54: 453-8.
- Marques-Deak AH, Neto FL, Dominguez WV, et al. Cytokine profiles in women with different subtypes of major depressive disorder.
   *J Psychiatr Res* 2007; 41: 152-9.
- 113 Martinac M, Babić D, Bevanda M, et al. Activity of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis and inflammatory mediators in major depressive disorder with or without metabolic syndrome. *Psychiatr Danub* 2017; **29**: 39-50.

- 114 McDade TW, Hawkley LC, Cacioppo JT. Psychosocial and behavioral predictors of inflammation in middle-aged and older adults: the Chicago health, aging, and social relations study. *Psychosom Med* 2006; **68**: 376-81.
- 115 Melamed S, Shirom A, Toker S, Berliner S, Shapira I. Association of fear of terror with low-grade inflammation among apparently healthy employed adults. *Psychosom Med* 2004; **66**: 484-91.
- 116 Miklowitz DJ, Portnoff LC, Armstrong CC, et al. Inflammatory cytokines and nuclear factor-kappa B activation in adolescents with bipolar and major depressive disorders. *Psychiatry Res* 2016; **241**: 315-22.
- 117 Mikova O, Yakimova R, Bosmans E, Kenis G, Maes M. Increased serum tumor necrosis factor alpha concentrations in major depression and multiple sclerosis. *Eur Neuropsychopharmacol* 2001; 11: 203-8.
- 118 Milaneschi Y, Corsi AM, Penninx BW, Bandinelli S, Guralnik JM, Ferrucci L. Interleukin-1 receptor antagonist and incident depressive symptoms over 6 years in older persons: the InCHIANTI study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2009; **65**: 973-8.
- 119 Miller GE, Stetler CA, Carney RM, Freedland KE, Banks WA. Clinical depression and inflammatory risk markers for coronary heart disease. *Am J Cardiol* 2002; **90**: 1279-83.
- Miller GE, Freedland KE, Duntley S, Carney RM. Relation of depressive symptoms to C-reactive protein and pathogen burden
   (cytomegalovirus, herpes simplex virus, Epstein-Barr virus) in patients with earlier acute coronary syndromes. *Am J Cardiol* 2005; **95**: 317-21.
- 121 Miller GE, Rohleder N, Stetler C, Kirschbaum C. Clinical depression and regulation of the inflammatory response during acute stress. *Psychosom Med* 2005; **67**: 679-87.
- 122 Moorman AJ, Mozaffarian D, Wilkinson CW, et al. In patients with heart failure elevated soluble TNF-receptor 1 is associated with

higher risk of depression. J Card Fail 2007; 13: 738-43.

- 123 Mota R, Gazal M, Acosta BA, et al. Interleukin-1beta is associated with depressive episode in major depression but not in bipolar disorder. *J Psychiatr Res* 2013; **47**: 2011-4.
- Motivala SJ, Sarfatti A, Olmos L, Irwin MR. Inflammatory markers and sleep disturbance in major depression. *Psychosom Med* 2005;
   67: 187-94.
- 125 Musselman DL, Miller AH, Porter MR, et al. Higher than normal plasma interleukin-6 concentrations in cancer patients with depression: preliminary findings. *Am J Psychiatry* 2001; **158**: 1252-7.
- 126 Nadrowski P, Chudek J, Skrzypek M, et al. Associations between cardiovascular disease risk factors and IL-6 and hsCRP levels in the elderly. *Exp Gerontol* 2016; **85**: 112-7.
- 127 Naghashpour M, Amani R, Nutr R, Nematpour S, Haghighizadeh MH. Riboflavin status and its association with serum hs-CRP levels among clinical nurses with depression. *J Am Coll Nutr* 2011; **30**: 340-7.
- 128 Nikkheslat N, Zunszain PA, Horowitz MA, et al. Insufficient glucocorticoid signaling and elevated inflammation in coronary heart disease patients with comorbid depression. *Brain, behavior, and immunity* 2015; **48**: 8-18.
- 129 O'Brien SM, Scully P, Scott LV, Dinan TG. Cytokine profiles in bipolar affective disorder: focus on acutely ill patients. *J Affect Disord* 2006; **90**: 263-7.
- 130 O'Brien SM, Scully P, Fitzgerald P, Scott LV, Dinan TG. Plasma cytokine profiles in depressed patients who fail to respond to selective serotonin reuptake inhibitor therapy. *J Psychiatr Res* 2007; **41**: 326-31.
- 131 O'Donovan A, Rush G, Hoatam G, et al. Suicidal ideation is associated with elevated inflammation in patients with major depressive

disorder. Depress Anxiety 2013; 30: 307-14.

- Ortiz-Domínguez A, Hernández ME, Berlanga C, et al. Immune variations in bipolar disorder: phasic differences. *Bipolar Disord* 2007; 9: 596-602.
- Owen BM, Eccleston D, Ferrier IN, Young AH. Raised levels of plasma interleukin-1beta in major and postviral depression. *Acta Psychiatr Scand* 2001; **103**: 226-8.
- 134 Pace TW, Mletzko TC, Alagbe O, et al. Increased stress-induced inflammatory responses in male patients with major depression and increased early life stress. *Am J Psychiatry* 2006; **163**: 1630-3.
- 135 Pan A, Ye X, Franco OH, et al. The association of depressive symptoms with inflammatory factors and adipokines in middle-aged and older Chinese. *PLoS One* 2008; **3**: e1392.
- 136 Panagiotakos DB, Pitsavos C, Chrysohoou C, et al. Inflammation, coagulation, and depressive symptomatology in cardiovascular disease-free people; the ATTICA study. *Eur Heart J* 2004; 25: 492-9.
- 137 Parissis JT, Adamopoulos S, Rigas A, et al. Comparison of circulating proinflammatory cytokines and soluble apoptosis mediators in patients with chronic heart failure with versus without symptoms of depression. *Am J Cardiol* 2004; **94**: 1326-8.
- 138 Park S, Joo YH, McIntyre RS, Kim B. Metabolic syndrome and elevated C-reactive protein levels in elderly patients with newly diagnosed depression. *Psychosomatics* 2014; **55**: 640-9.
- 139 Pavon L, Sandoval-Lopez G, Eugenia Hernandez M, et al. Th2 cytokine response in Major Depressive Disorder patients before treatment. *J Neuroimmunol* 2006; **172**: 156-65.
- 140 Penninx BW, Kritchevsky SB, Yaffe K, et al. Inflammatory markers and depressed mood in older persons: results from the Health,

Aging and Body Composition study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2003; 54: 566-72.

- 141 Pike JL, Irwin MR. Dissociation of inflammatory markers and natural killer cell activity in major depressive disorder. *Brain Behav Immun* 2006; **20**: 169-74.
- 142 Piletz JE, Halaris A, Iqbal O, et al. Pro-inflammatory biomakers in depression: treatment with venlafaxine. *World J Biol Psychiatry* 2009; **10**: 313-23.
- 143 Rief W, Pilger F, Ihle D, Bosmans E, Egyed B, Maes M. Immunological differences between patients with major depression and somatization syndrome. *Psychiatry Res* 2001; **105**: 165-74.
- 144 Rothermundt M, Arolt V, Peters M, et al. Inflammatory markers in major depression and melancholia. *J Affect Disord* 2001; 63: 93 102.
- 145 Rudolf S, Greggersen W, Kahl KG, Huppe M, Schweiger U. Elevated IL-6 levels in patients with atypical depression but not in patients with typical depression. *Psychiatry Res* 2014; **217**: 34-8.
- Rudzki L, Pawlak D, Pawlak K, et al. Immune suppression of IgG response against dairy proteins in major depression. *BMC Psychiatry* 2017; 17: 268-.
- Schins A, Tulner D, Lousberg R, et al. Inflammatory markers in depressed post-myocardial infarction patients. *J Psychiatr Res* 2005;
   39: 137-44.
- Schmidt FM, Lichtblau N, Minkwitz J, et al. Cytokine levels in depressed and non-depressed subjects, and masking effects of obesity.
   J Psychiatr Res 2014; 55: 29-34.
- 149 Seidel A, Arolt V, Hunstiger M, Rink L, Behnisch A, Kirchner H. Cytokine production and serum proteins in depression. Scand J

*Immunol* 1995; **41**: 534-8.

- 150 Shimbo D, Rieckmann N, Paulino R, Davidson KW. Relation between C reactive protein and depression remission status in patients presenting with acute coronary syndrome. *Heart* 2006; **92**: 1316-8.
- 151 Shin Y-C, Jung C-H, Kim H-J, Kim E-J, Lim S-W. The associations among vitamin D deficiency, C-reactive protein, and depressive symptoms. *J Psychosom Res* 2016; **90**: 98-104.
- 152 Simmons WK, Burrows K, Avery JA, et al. Appetite changes reveal depression subgroups with distinct endocrine, metabolic, and immune states. *Mol Psychiatry* 2018; https://doi.org/10.1038/s41380-018-0093-6. 10.1038/s41380-018-0093-6.
- 153 Simon NM, McNamara K, Chow CW, et al. A detailed examination of cytokine abnormalities in Major Depressive Disorder. *Eur Neuropsychopharmacol* 2008; 18: 230-3.
- 154 Sjogren E, Leanderson P, Kristenson M, Ernerudh J. Interleukin-6 levels in relation to psychosocial factors: studies on serum, saliva, and in vitro production by blood mononuclear cells. *Brain Behav Immun* 2006; **20**: 270-8.
- 155 Sluzewska A, Rybakowski JK, Laciak M, Mackiewicz A, Sobieska M, Wiktorowicz K. Interleukin-6 serum levels in depressed patients before and after treatment with fluoxetine. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 1995; **762**: 474-6.
- 156 Sluzewska A, Rybakowski J, Bosmans E, et al. Indicators of immune activation in major depression. *Psychiatry Res* 1996; 64: 161-7.
- 157 Song C, Lin A, Bonaccorso S, et al. The inflammatory response system and the availability of plasma tryptophan in patients with primary sleep disorders and major depression. *J Affect Disord* 1998; **49**: 211-9.
- 158 Song C, Halbreich U, Han C, Leonard BE, Luo H. Imbalance between pro- and anti-inflammatory cytokines, and between Th1 and Th2 cytokines in depressed patients: the effect of electroacupuncture or fluoxetine treatment. *Pharmacopsychiatry* 2009; **42**: 182-8.

- 159 Soygur H, Palaoglu O, Akarsu ES, et al. Interleukin-6 levels and HPA axis activation in breast cancer patients with major depressive disorder. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2007; **31**: 1242-7.
- 160 Spanemberg L, Caldieraro MA, Vares EA, et al. Biological differences between melancholic and nonmelancholic depression subtyped by the CORE measure. *Neuropsychiatr Dis Treat* 2014; **10**: 1523-31.
- 161 Su SC, Sun MT, Wen MJ, Lin CJ, Chen YC, Hung YJ. Brain-derived neurotrophic factor, adiponectin, and proinflammatory markers in various subtypes of depression in young men. *Int J Psychiatry Med* 2011; **42**: 211-26.
- 162 Sutcigil L, Oktenli C, Musabak U, et al. Pro- and anti-inflammatory cytokine balance in major depression: effect of sertraline therapy. *Clin Dev Immunol* 2007; **2007**: 76396.
- 163 Taylor SE, Lehman BJ, Kiefe CI, Seeman TE. Relationship of early life stress and psychological functioning to adult C-reactive protein in the coronary artery risk development in young adults study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2006; **60**: 819-24.
- 164 Thomas AJ, Davis S, Morris C, Jackson E, Harrison R, O'Brien JT. Increase in interleukin-1beta in late-life depression. Am J Psychiatry 2005; 162: 175-7.
- 165 Tiemeier H, Hofman A, van Tuijl HR, Kiliaan AJ, Meijer J, Breteler MM. Inflammatory proteins and depression in the elderly. *Epidemiology* 2003; 14: 103-7.
- 166 Toker S, Shirom A, Shapira I, Berliner S, Melamed S. The association between burnout, depression, anxiety, and inflammation biomarkers: C-reactive protein and fibrinogen in men and women. *J Occup Health Psychol* 2005; **10**: 344-62.
- 167 Torres KC, Lima GS, Fiamoncini CM, et al. Increased frequency of cluster of differentiation 14 (CD14+) monocytes expressing interleukin 1 beta (IL-1β) in Alzheimer's disease patients and intermediate levels in late-onset depression patients. *Int J Geriatr*

*Psychiatry* 2014; **29**: 137-43.

- 168 Trzonkowski P, Myśliwska J, Godlewska B, et al. Immune consequences of the spontaneous pro-inflammatory status in depressed elderly patients. *Brain, behavior, and immunity* 2004; **18**: 135-48.
- 169 Tsai SY, Chung KH, Huang SH, Chen PH, Lee HC, Kuo CJ. Persistent inflammation and its relationship to leptin and insulin in phases of bipolar disorder from acute depression to full remission. *Bipolar Disord* 2014; **16**: 800-8.
- 170 Tuglu C, Kara SH, Caliyurt O, Vardar E, Abay E. Increased serum tumor necrosis factor-alpha levels and treatment response in major depressive disorder. *Psychopharmacology (Berl)* 2003; **170**: 429-33.
- 171 Vaccarino V, Johnson BD, Sheps DS, et al. Depression, inflammation, and incident cardiovascular disease in women with suspected coronary ischemia: the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute-sponsored WISE study. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2007; **50**: 2044-50.
- 172 Vaccarino V, Brennan ML, Miller AH, et al. Association of major depressive disorder with serum myeloperoxidase and other markers of inflammation: a twin study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2008; **64**: 476-83.
- 173 Verduijn J, Milaneschi Y, Schoevers RA, van Hemert AM, Beekman ATF, Penninx BWJH. Pathophysiology of major depressive disorder: mechanisms involved in etiology are not associated with clinical progression. *Transl Psychiatry* 2015; **5**: e649-e.
- 174 Vetta F, Ronzoni S, Lupattelli MR, et al. Tumor necrosis factor-alpha and mood disorders in the elderly. *Arch Gerontol Geriatr Suppl* 2001; 7: 435-42.
- 175 Vogelzangs N, Comijs HC, Oude Voshaar RC, Stek ML, Penninx BW. Late-life depression symptom profiles are differentially associated with immunometabolic functioning. *Brain Behav Immun* 2014; **41**: 109-15.
- 176 Wei L, Du Y, Wu W, Fu X, Xia Q. Elevation of plasma neutrophil gelatinase-associated lipocalin (NGAL) levels in schizophrenia

patients. J Affect Disord 2018; 226: 307-12.

- 177 Weinstein AA, Deuster PA, Francis JL, Bonsall RW, Tracy RP, Kop WJ. Neurohormonal and inflammatory hyper-responsiveness to acute mental stress in depression. *Biol Psychol* 2010; **84**: 228-34.
- 178 Whooley MA, Caska CM, Hendrickson BE, Rourke MA, Ho J, Ali S. Depression and inflammation in patients with coronary heart disease: findings from the Heart and Soul Study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2007; **62**: 314-20.
- 179 Wium-Andersen MK, Orsted DD, Nordestgaard BG. Elevated C-reactive protein, depression, somatic diseases, and all-cause mortality: a mendelian randomization study. *Biol Psychiatry* 2014; **76**: 249-57.
- Yang K, Zhang Z, Xie G, Wang C, Tang Y, Lui G. Serum levels of cytokine, C-reactive protein and zinc in patients with depression:
   Changes worth paying attention to. *Chinese J Clin Rehab* 2005; **9**: 37-9.
- 181 Yang K, Xie G, Zhang Z, et al. Levels of serum interleukin (IL)-6, IL-1beta, tumour necrosis factor-alpha and leptin and their correlation in depression. *Aust N Z J Psychiatry* 2007; **41**: 266-73.
- 182 Yoshimura R, Hori H, Ikenouchi-Sugita A, Umene-Nakano W, Ueda N, Nakamura J. Higher plasma interleukin-6 (IL-6) level is associated with SSRI- or SNRI-refractory depression. *Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry* 2009; **33**: 722-6.
- 183 Yoshimura R, Umene-Nakano W, Hoshuyama T, et al. Plasma levels of brain-derived neurotrophic factor and interleukin-6 in patients with dysthymic disorder: comparison with age- and sex-matched major depressed patients and healthy controls. *Hum Psychopharmacol* 2010; 25: 566-9.
- 184 Zoga M, Oulis P, Chatzipanagiotou S, et al. Indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase and immune changes under antidepressive treatment in major depression in females. *In Vivo* 2014; 28: 633-8.