What do players of virtual reality exercise games want? A thematic analysis of online reviews of virtual reality exergames

Nuša Farič1,2, Henry W W Potts2, Adrian Hon3, Lee Smith4, Katie Newby5, Andrew Steptoe1, Abi Fisher1

1. University College London, Dept. Behavioural Science & Health, Torrington Place, WC1E 7HB

2. UCL Institute of Health Informatics, University College London, 222 Euston Road, NW1 2DA

3. Six to Start, c/o LSD Accountants, 72 Stockwood Business Park, Redditch, B96 6SX

4. The Cambridge Centre for Sport and Exercise Sciences, Anglia Ruskin University, East Road, Cambridge, CB1 1PT

5. Coventry University, Priory Street, Coventry, CV1 5FV

Corresponding author

Nuša Farič

UCL Health Behaviour Research Centre

University College London

1-19 Torrington Place

London

WC1E 6BT

T. 0207 7679 4466 (int ext 419 14)

M. +44 (0)75 3441 7752

E. nusa.faric.11@ucl.ac.uk

ABSTRACT

Background: Physical activity (PA) is associated with a variety of physical and psychosocial health benefits, but levels of moderate-to-vigorous intensity physical activity (MVPA) remain low worldwide. The application of virtual reality (VR) gaming systems involving movement (VR exergames) could be used to engage people in more physical activity.

Objective: Our objective was to synthesise public reviews of popular VR exergames to identify common features that players liked or disliked in order to inform future VR exergame design.

Methods: We conducted a thematic analysis of 498 reviews of the 29 most popular exergames sold in the top three VR marketplaces: Steam, Viveport and Oculus. We grouped reviews into positive and negative categories as they appeared in the marketplaces and identified the most prevalent common themes using inductive thematic analysis.

Results: The reviews were often mixed, reporting a great variety of expectations, preferences and gaming experiences. Players preferred highly realistic games (e.g. closely simulate real-world sport), games that were intuitive (in terms of the body movement and controls), and games which provide gradual step-by-step increases in skill acquisition. Players reported feeling that they reached a high level of exertion when playing, and that the immersion distracted them from the exercise intensity. Music and social aspects of the games, with multiplayer options to include friends or help from experienced players, were also preferred features. There were three main themes in negative reviews: The first concerned bugs that rendered games frustrating. Second, the quality of graphics had a particularly strong impact on perceived enjoyment. Finally, reviewers disliked when games had overly complex controls and display functions that evoked motion sickness.

Conclusions: Exergames prove a stimulating avenue for players to engage in physical activity and distract from negative perceptions of performing exercise. Common negative aspects of VR exergames should be addressed to increase uptake and continued engagement.

Keywords: Serious games, intrinsic motivation, virtual reality, exercise, video games, sedentary lifestyle, weight loss, behaviour, weight management

INTRODUCTION

There is a large body of evidence showing that regular and sustained participation in physical activity (PA) aids in the prevention and management of some cancers, diabetes, cardiovascular disease and dementia [1-5]. In light of this, country and age specific PA recommendations have been developed: for example, UK government recommendations are for at least 150 minutes per week of moderate to vigorous physical activity (MVPA) for adults and 60 minutes per day for children and adolescents aged 5-18 years [6]. However, global population levels of PA are insufficient [6-8]. TheUK has particularly low levels of PA compared with other European countries [9]. Objective measures of PA in 4,507 adults aged over 16 years showed only 6% of males and 4% of females met the recommended guidelines for PA [10]. Furthermore, 50% of males and 58% of females were classified as ‘inactive’ [10]. Levels of inactivity are particularly high among socioeconomically (SES) deprived groups [11, 12]. The US Department of Health & Human Services reported that less than 5% of American adults engage in 30 minutes of PA each day, and only a third reach the recommended PA levels in a week [13]. An increase in sedentary lifestyle and insufficient PA has also been observed in other countries such as Australia [14], India [15] and China [16]. Interventions to increase population levels of PA are urgently required.

Gaming is a recreational activity regularly performed by 2-3 billion people worldwide across SES groups and by males and females [17, 18]. The popularity and nature of gaming makes it a potential avenue for population health intervention [19]. A Limelight Network market research report (2018) found that gamers around the world spent an average 6 hours each week playing [20]. Games requiring bodily movement (‘exergames’) offer a potential to increase PA and reduce sitting time/replace sedentary screen time [21]. Early generation exergames such as Dance Dance Revolution released in 1998 and Nintendo’s Wii Fit (2007) (which sold over 22 million copies worldwide) and, more recently, Pokémon Go (downloaded over 800 million times) are examples of exergames which have had huge commercial success [22, 23]. Empirical studies of previous generation exergames have shown that they can achieve PA of at least moderate intensity and can increase energy expenditure up to 300% above resting levels [23]. In addition, a meta-analysis of 35 studies in young people found they achieved a similar level of activity to field-based sports, and enhanced reported enjoyment of, and intrinsic motivation for, PA [24]. Exergaming has also been positively associated with psychological well-being [25, 26]. Randomised controlled trials in children [27], pre-adolescents [28], adolescents [29, 30] and adults [31] found that exergames supported weight loss and increased fitness. However, trials have not been able to confirm exactly which psychological or social factors might lead to long-term engagement [21, 25, 26].

Virtual reality (VR) has the potential to enhance the impact of an exergaming intervention. The most prominent feature of VR is high quality virtual realism or immersion, coupled with body tracking where the person feels fully present/located in the virtual world [32, 33]. In exergames, presence is not always required, but in VR, full presence is required and as such, psychological processes may potentially differ and even influence performance or affective states of the players [33]. There is evidence from laboratory studies that immersive VR exergaming is more engaging than standard exercise, and may distract participants from exertion. For example, one study involving 88 university staff and students, found that although heart rate was higher in the VR versus a standard exercise condition, participants reported feeling less tired and had higher ratings of enjoyment in the VR condition [34]. VR is moving from a niche to a more affordable product, suggesting, for the first time, potential for the use of VR as a population health intervention. Ownership is increasing: Statista reported worldwide sales of VR headsets totalling 13.5 million units in 2017 and the sales are predicted to increase drastically by 2020 due to decreases in price [35].

VR exergames are a unique platform for PA intervention and not much have been reported about the experiences of players themselves. This review aimed to investigate which factors were reported to help or hinder engagement with VR exergames as reported by the players themselves in online VR marketplaces/platforms. This review was performed to learn more about their actual experiences and synthesize results in order to be mindful when building a new VR exergame used for PA. In line with intervention development frameworks, gathering the views of target users is crucial [32]. Some feedback can only be obtained from people who are using the technology in question, even though they may not be representative of all future users. Markets are fast changing and future oriented and the insights we gather from current users may benefit the development of the future VR PA interventions. The systems need to be well designed to be as effective as possible, and preferably with an involvement with the target population [36].

New data collection could be conducted with players of VR exergames, but we instead opted to take advantage of online reviews that have been spontaneously submitted. Using material submitted online has become increasingly common in research and we drew on examples in app research [37]. The approach is quick and cost-effective. Online reviews may not directly answer researchers’ questions and those submitting reviews may not be representative. However, online reviews may have greater validity than responses given in a research context.

METHODS

A search of the main gaming databases was conducted in July 2018. Steam, Viveport and Oculus were selected as the three main marketplaces for VR games and experiences. Steam is the most popular hub in the world for purchasing and downloading desktop and VR games [38]. At present, Steam supports HTC Vive, Oculus Rift and Windows Mixed Reality headsets [39, 40]. Viveport and Oculus support their respective VR headsets. All three marketplaces encourage users to leave reviews.

VR exergame search

The current review included games that were specifically marketed as being fitness-related. Games that related to PA/sport but did not involve movement to play (e.g. football management) were excluded. Each marketplace had slightly different game selection categories and/or filters options and these were applied in order to obtain a selection of VR exergames. The search strategies were as follows:

STEAM: In the ‘Virtual Reality’ category, ‘sort by Top Sellers’ was selected, and manually searched for fitness-related games.

We also visited the ‘Virtual Reality’ category, and selected ‘sort by What’s Being Experienced’ (i.e. hours played) and manually searched for any fitness-related games that were missed using the previous search.

VIVEPORT: We searched for apps in the ‘Health & Fitness or Sports’ genre, ordering by ‘Popularity’.

OCULUS: We searched the fitness-related games in the categories ‘Top-selling experiences for Rift’ and ‘Top Free experiences for Rift’.

Types of user reviews and sampling

Two researchers (NF and AF) extracted the most recent 10 positive and 10 negative reviews for each of the sampled VR games. The reviews were extracted into an Excel spreadsheet.

Steam and Oculus reviews require users to post either a positive or a negative review. Viveport allows reviewers to post reviews using a starring system, ranging from 1 to 5. For all three marketplaces, we selected the first ten reviews (chronologically most recent). This posed an issue of whether to include reviews with 3 stars (which would constitute as ‘neutral’ and not necessarily a ‘positive’ or a ‘negative’ review). We decided to include these because Steam and Oculus platforms in fact included reviews which would fall under a ‘neutral’ category if such option existed. For example, in Steam and Oculus some reviewers provided a breakdown and a list of ‘pros’, ‘neutrals’ and ‘cons’ in the single review, while others directly reported how many stars or categories they would assign if such options were available: “I could not give a positive review and there's no neutral ones”, and “I'm a bit torn on reviewing this [before listing both pros and cons and arguing it was a neutral review]”. It was merely the fact that the review could not be posted unless they have chosen either a positive or a negative category but in either of the categories, they have reported what would otherwise constitute a neutral review.

Data analysis

Thematic analysis was used as it provides a flexible approach to analysing qualitative data [41]. We chose thematic analysis over other diverse qualitative approaches because it helped us locate themes and patterns or “thematise meanings” within the body of data. Themes were organised in a coherent, organised and rich detail [41]. The theoretical position of thematic analysis in our study is concerned with a particular context and as such fell under a ‘contextualist’ method or ‘critical realism’. It reports on the reality and experiences of the VR exergames users but at the same time unravels the way in which individuals make meaning of their experiences.

RESULTS

The number of reviews extracted from each database is shown in Table 1. Thirty-six games were identified but seven of these had no associated reviews, leaving 29 games for inclusion. These produced a total of 498 reviews (260 positive, 238 negative and two neutral reviews, i.e. 3 stars for Viveport only). Table 2 gives details of the included games.

The VR exergames included in the analysis covered a wide variety of sport simulators (e.g. Racket Fury), as well as super hero (e.g. Echo Arena) or arcade style games in VR (e.g. Fruit Ninja). 85/498 (17%) of reviews had both, positive and negative comments in a single review. This was apparent from the content of the reviews, and reviewers often separated feedback into defined paragraphs with ‘pros’, ‘neutrals’ and ‘cons’ as subtitles in the one single review, as mentioned earlier. Approximately 70% of reviewers commented on the technological aspects of the games which included the settings and options in the games, the bugs, display functions such as the glitches and freezes, the overall flow of the game, the use of the controllers, and other potential issues (for example, the game requiring users to jump or spin while being potentially hazardous (e.g. cables, space requirement)).

Reviews varied in length from 5 to 880 words per single review. In terms of the context of this study, the word ‘workout’ was mentioned 112 times in all reviews, ‘sweat’ or ‘sweaty’ 61 times, ‘fitness’ 14 times, and ‘physical activity’ twice.

We identified 14 main themes for both positive and negative reviews, which we illustrate below along with supporting quotes and summarise in Table 3.

[Table 1 about here]

Table 1: Selection of VR exergames based on the marketplace

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Marketplace | Game types | Number of games identified |
| Steam | Top sellers | 12 |
| What’s being experienced (hours played) | 6 |
| Viveport | Health and Fitness/Sports genre (ordered by popularity) | 10 (7 had no reviews) |
| Oculus | Top selling experiences for Rift | 7 |
| Top free experiences for Rift | 1 |

[Table 2 about here]

Table 2: Final VR exergame selection and description of each VR exergame

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| VR Exergame | | Brief description  of the VR exergame by marketplace  (descriptions taken from or adopted from the marketplaces) |
| STEAM | | |
| 1 | Beat Saber | The goal is to make players almost dance while cutting the cubes flying toward them and avoiding obstacles using two sabers. Each cut is strongly supported by great sound and visual effects to emphasize the rhythm |
| 2 | Audioshield+C9 | The players need to ‘block the beats’ by punching the orbs flying toward them. Audioshield puts players at the point of impact for every hit in the music. Works with any song |
| 3 | Sprint Vector | Run, jump, climb, drift, and fly at extreme velocity as you race up to 8 players and battle obstacles in this frenetic VR adrenaline platformer |
| 4 | Hover Skate VR | Physics based hoverboard simulator for VR with over 250 skateboard tricks to learn and master |
| 5 | VR Super Sports | 8 sports games combined into one |
| 6 | Climbey | A VR-only climbing game! The goal is to climb to the finish as fast as you can, avoiding obstacles and trying not to fall along the way |
| 7 | Soundboxing | A VR music video kickboxing game where you create the beats! You can either punch to the music and compete to beat the best, or record your own challenge for others to beat—all set to your favourite music in a cool outdoor environment |
| 8 | BOXVRa | Rhythm-based boxing Inspired workouts. The only VR workout app with regularly updated workouts by professional fitness instructors |
| 9 | The Thrill of the Fight – VR Boxing | A room-scale VR boxing game. Face off in the virtual ring where you'll jab, dodge, and sweat your way to the top of the boxing world. Grab your gloves, step through the ropes, and become a champion |
| 10 | Racket: NX | Racquetball meets Breakout inside a giant pinball machine! Racket: Nx is a new kind of game that challenges the limits of what you can do with a racket and ball in VR |
| 11 | Racket Fury: Table Tennis VRa | Face 16 opponents in 4 distinctive cups and step into the most intense table tennis experience! Take on challenging rivals in the single-player campaign to climb the ladder of the Crown Galaxy! Get involved in heated exchanges with players from all over the world who, just like you, are hungry to win |
| 12 | Holopoint | An archery game. Fight your way through waves of responsive targets, samurai, and highly dangerous ninjas - all while drawing, nocking, and shooting your arrows as quickly as possible |
| 13 | Fruit Ninja VR | Step inside the Fruit Ninja universe and experience a slice of virtual reality like never before |
| 14 | Knockout League – Arcade VR Boxing | A single player arcade-style boxing game built from the ground up for virtual reality. Dodge flaming uppercuts, block sweeping tentacle attacks, and pummel your opponents using 1:1 tracking of your head and hands |
| 15 | Eleven: Table Tennis | The ultimate Table Tennis simulator. Play opponents in online multiplayer or practice against the advanced AI. With physics designed to be as real as ever achieved in a Table Tennis simulator, you will forget you are in VR |
| 16 | To the top | Play opponents in online multiplayer or practice against the advanced AI. With physics designed to be as real as ever achieved in a Table Tennis simulator, you will forget you are in VR |
| 17 | Fancy Skiing VR | The game's structure is based on real skiing that players use the handles just as ski poles to get power and lean left or right to control the direction, which brings players a strong immersion |
| 18 | Sparc | A unique physical sport only possible in virtual reality, in which players compete in fast-paced, full-body VR gameplay and connect in an online community |
| VIVEPORT | | |
| 19 | Arcade Saga | Allows you to take the role of a newly sentient being and battle for survival against A.I. Overlords determined to destroy you and your free-thinking. Through 3 different futuristic sports—Fracture, Smash and Bowshot—you'll harness your reactions and strategic thinking to shoot and dodge viruses, break firewall bricks and spin data-balls past the Overlords and their minions. You will need to use your reflexes, wits and changing strategies to survive |
| 20 | VR Cricket | A cricket game for VR with 2 bowling options i.e. Fast and Spin. Game also features the real pitch and 2x dimensions of the real pitch. Game features a stadium, sound effects and animations |
| 21 | Knockout Leaguea | A single player arcade style boxing game built from the ground up for virtual reality. Its intuitive gameplay involves moving and dodging with your body and 1:1 punch movement that lets you attack how you want without relying on buttons for main gameplay. Train up with various boxing drills to take on a crazy cast of characters with different fighting styles and gameplay in order to become the champion of the Knockout League |
| OCULUS | | |
| 22 | Eleven: Table Tennis VR | The ultimate table tennis simulator. Play opponents in online multiplayer or practice against the advanced AI. With physics designed to be as real as ever achieved in a Table Tennis simulator, you will forget you are in VR |
| 23 | The Climb | Scale huge heights and feel the exhilaration of extreme free solo climbing. Explore and enjoy the view or compete for the fastest times on leaderboards with Touch or gamepad controls |
| 24 | BoxVRa | See above |
| 25 | Knockout Leaguea | See above |
| 26 | Fruit Ninja VR | Fruit slicing game in VR. Step inside the Fruit Ninja universe and experience a slice of virtual reality like never before |
| 27 | Racket Fury: Table Tennis VRa | See above |
| 28 | Streetball VR | Arcade style basketball when you step into the street one on one with the top finest in basketball action and play in different streets with beautiful backgrounds in VR |
| 29 | Echo Arena | Echo VR is your gateway to Echo Arena and Echo Combat. You play as a futuristic battle-ready robot armed with an array of weapons and abilities as your team of three competes against the opposition in a zero-gravity clash of robotic glory as you glide, boost and punch your way to scoring goals in a breath-taking virtual arena |

a Where game repeats but in a different marketplace.

[Table 3 about here]

Table 3: Main themes for both positive and negative VR exergame reviews

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Themes | Description |
| Real-world feeling | Body movement akin to real-world sport/activities made games more appealing |
| Intuitive controls | Intuitive controls made games more playable and less frustrating, which was especially true for the less experienced players |
| Immersion | Immersion was important for sense of presence and overall enjoyment of the game |
| Music | Music greatly enhanced the overall experience of the games |
| Matching skill level | Gradual step-by-step acquisition of skill and skill-matched intensity levels highly impacted on playability |
| Social aspects | Sociable aspects of the games were favoured, but sometimes multiplayer games left players feeling lonely or stuck |
| Exertion and matching real-world exercise levels | VR exergaming provides a high level of exertion, equivalent to real world exercise |
| Appearance | The feeling of how you look when you play impacted on player’s enjoyment of the game |
| Graphicsa | Good graphics and display allowed players to play for longer periods of time |
| Bugsa | Bugs frustrated the players, but when they were fixed quickly, people were more likely to play on |
| Add-ons enhance gaming experience | Simple add-ons and tweaks had the potential to enhance the overall game experience |
| Motion sicknessa | Motion sickness made it difficult for players to engage |
| Developers | Responsive and present developers gained more players and praise |
| Price | Price influenced the overall perception of the VR exergames |

a Main themes of the negative reviews, although also present in positive reviews

**Body movement akin to real-world sport/activities made games more appealing**

People purchased and engaged with VR exergames for different reasons. Some people used VR exergames merely as entertainment, while others used them to build a skill, practice sport and replace real-world sport or exercise. Sometimes VR exergaming did not match the feeling of performing sport or PA in real-world, and this had to do with controllers, mechanics (i.e. the overall gameplay, sometimes interchangeably used as physics), physics (i.e. simulation or game effects appearing to be realistic), or display quality and graphics of the game. These themes are interconnected. Reviewers often disagreed about the same game:

*I’m a martial artist, I think this game is the closest to what we could get fighting in VR at the moment. If you would like a good work out, try playing ten rounds daily. It cannot replace actual boxing training but it will raise your confidence and fitness.*

*With all the good reviews, this must just not work with my system. The hit detection was horrible, couldn't block a thing, and it was constantly sticking me on top of my opponent.*

Matching the physical skill levels meant that some exergames offered different modes of playing. Transferring the same physics to the VR exergames as those experienced in real life sport or exercise was quite important for most players.

*The most important aspect of table tennis is the physics and [name of the game] certainly ticks that box. It provides one of the best VR table tennis physics I have experienced to date. I have played over 240 hours of VR table tennis and play regularly in real life so I have a good idea of how the game of table tennis plays. [name of the game] translates so well that I can play all the shots that I play in real life with the correct amount of spin, power and accuracy. It is so accurate in fact that I can use it to improve my real game.*

*It's designed for people who have never skated (it seems) whereby people that have will find it non-intuitive. Not sure if there's a middle ground but I hope you find it (or add in an option for "skater mode" [“skater mode” would be a difficulty and skill level for more experienced skaters]).*

**Intuitive controls made games more playable and less frustrating, which was especially true for the less experienced players**

Intuitive controllers affected playability and overall satisfaction with the game.

*Braking requires hitting both side buttons, which is weird and uncomfortable (I've always hated those side buttons). All the buttons are annoying to remember and I can't count the number of accidental screenshots I've taken.*

*The controls are incredibly simple, too: throw punches by pushing your hands out in front of your while holding the controllers; block by raising your hands in front of your face. There's no need for button presses, as [name of game] is entirely based on movement.*

**Immersion was important for sense of presence and overall enjoyment of the game**

Intuitive controllers had an effect on immersion, but immersion also depended on other factors such as the mechanics of the game. The overall “flow” of the exergame often related to immersion, but was interrupted by poorly designed controllers or bugs.

*Backstory is non-existent. If you're going for this style of game at least have a setup. Does wonders for immersion and gameplay. Trust me…[the name of an example game]* *made the game 10x better for me.*

*Especially when you complete a level and you’re at the peak. I usually sit there for 10 minutes taking in the view. The world is full of life, you can see boats and planes off in the distance. I also use wrist weights while playing, it enhances the immersion and its exercise.*

*The ball doesn't follow your hand and instead leaves several seconds after you throw. This and a few other issues related to lag. Unfortunately it kills the immersion completely.*

**Immersion was important for distraction from thinking about PA**

One of the key features of VR exergaming is immersion and immersion was reported as helping the players perform PA.

*It’s a great workout and time flies while you tell to yourself: just one more song!*

*I'm a nerd. I hate sports and physical activity with a passion.[…] I played until my body just couldn't go on any more. As I'm writing this, I'm a sweaty mess and my whole body is hurting. The cross platform play is awesome, players are super nice to each other and the gameplay mechanics just work and the inputs are responsive [..]. Now I need to go rest...*

*I also use wrist weights while playing, it enhances the immersion and its exercise.*

**Music greatly enhanced the overall experience of the games**

Reviewers explicitly mentioned music. Most reviews referred to music directly in terms of enhancing the experience of playing satisfaction, immersion, re-playability and presence:

*Music is excellent for the game's style. I love this soundtrack.*

*Not a big fan of the music so would appreciate some audio controls.*

*Even though the songs are far from the kind of music that I listen to, I cannot help but walk around having the melodies in my head constantly. Some songs I play because I like the music, others I play because the level is just really fun to play. And some because both of those reasons.*

Sometimes music hampered the enjoyment of the game entirely:

*[name of the game] is a music game where the gameplay doesn't match with the music. Not worth the price, especially now that [name of a competitor game] is out.*

**Gradual step-by-step acquisition of skill and skill-matched intensity levels highly impacted on playability**

Some gamers spent long periods of time learning the mechanics of the game and commented on the technical support present in the game when they were stuck:

*Great progression of levels keep the game interesting and require building new skills.*

*Good workout but overall, it jumps to ridiculously hard after 5 levels. I have been working on it for the last 2 days and I can't get to round 10 because you get hit twice and it starts you over. The levels don't even seem much different from 5-9.*

**Sociable aspects of the games were favoured, but sometimes multiplayer games left players feeling lonely or stuck**

Fun was also dependent on whether players could play with other people such as friends and family, but when players had no one to play against which defeated the gameplay.

*You & friends can even just hangout and chat & play in the skate park and not do races at all. Love the freedom.*

*This could be the best VR game so far. I love the game play. But the matchmaking wait is so bad - you have to wait and watch for 2.5 minutes between every game.*

*I live in Tokyo....my son is working in New Jersey...we met up in [name of the game] for over 2 hours and had a blast. As if he was next to me...we could actually grab hold each other’s hands to climb up the ledge.*

**VR exergaming provides a high level of exertion, equivalent to real world exercise**

As already illustrated in the previous examples, the players commented on the level of exertion and workout quality. Additionally, some reviewers felt worried about their headsets getting sweaty and sought advice about maintenance and cleaning:

*This game made me realise I am really out of shape.*

*This game is an amazing workout. It's great for working the legs and your core (some arms too, but not nearly as intense). Right now I used 2 games [within the game] for exercise.*

*I was sweating on my head mounted display (HMD) and just had to quit. Not only that, but I was tripping over my wired headset. If you have a wireless headset, then this game is perfect. If you don't, you'll have to setup your wires or just be very cognizant of this problem.*

**The feeling of how you look when you play impacted on player’s enjoyment of the game**

Some players wanted to look as cool to someone else when playing the game as they do inside the game itself. This was especially true for those games that offered super-hero qualities or exceptional skills:

*You shoot down holograms and dodge the projectiles. It is one of the few games where you actually look cool in the real world while you play it as you contort your body to dodge and shoot.*

*My wife thought I looked dumb shooting invisible arrows straight up at the ceiling while kneeling and swearing. I didn't. I felt like I looked awesome. You will be ducking, kneeling, spinning, nocking, shooting, nocking, shooting until you fall over.*

**Good graphics and display allowed players to play for longer periods of time**

Clear, solid graphics made players like the exergames more, but sometimes too much detail evoked discomfort.

*Graphics and models are well designed. Good amount of detail, but not so much that things are ever a pixelated aliased mess at a distance.*

*The graphics are terrible for a game this simple. Everything is shimmering and my eyes started to hurt soon after I started playing and made me uncomfortable.*

**Bugs frustrated the players, but when they were fixed quickly, people were more likely to play on**

Bug complaints were the most prevalent mechanics complaint across all reviews and for all games. VR technologies, hardware and software issues were all mentioned. Some games were experienced as smooth, others as unplayable.

*Amount of bugs is recent versions is insane. Glitches, freezes control issues. Happen exclusively in this game. I wish there was a way to revert everything to the previous version.*

*It’s kind of frustrating to play through the song over and over again and not get a chance to really practice the hard part before you have to restart the song again.*

*Within minutes of use, I ran into several bugs and had to restart the game several times before I could even try it. So my first 10-15 minutes are just troubleshooting.. fun..*

*All the bugs are possible to work around and this kind of game lives on community engagement anyway.*

*Annoying bugs. Love the games but I hate the "Your head is intersecting with an object. Please move it" screen. It just randomly pops out when I fall making it impossible to grab on to a grip to the one beneath it […] also, It keeps making me jump out of the middle of nowhere. So annoying.*

**Simple add-ons and tweaks had the potential to enhance the overall game experience**

Sometimes reviews on mechanics had to do with simple add-ons or tweaks which helped players track fitness related behaviours and PA.

*Hours logged do not necessarily reflect all time spent in the game.*

*Need only to add more boxers and rings. Please add a calorie counter.*

**Motion sickness made it difficult for players to engage**

Motion sickness was reported as problematic when playing certain VR exergames:

*I am sometimes susceptible to VR sim sickness from artificial locomotion, depending on the game. [the name of the game] didn't give me any problems.*

*I've got hundreds of hours in VR at this point, and no game has ever really made me sick the way [name of the game] has. I put on the comfort options in the game, but I still can't run more than one (maybe two) challenges before I have to leave the game.*

**Responsive and present developers gained more players and praise**

Many reviews have tips and feedback for developers from praise to critique. Sometimes the developers were addressed directly and feedback was given to them about their response, behaviour or their presence online, but sometimes the feedback was given to the developers more generally in terms of how they could improve the game mechanics or game controls:

*Hats of[f] to the developers for the immersive experience and environments! job well done ! The touch controllers and style of locomotion are a great pairing.*

*I have been unable to launch the game for a few months now. I am extremely disappointed with the services in effort to help my problem and think that the services to help problems such as mine need to be looked at further by the developers of the game.*

**Price influenced the overall perception of the VR exergames**

Reviewers commended or complained about the price. Some reviews described a greater degree of tolerance for glitches and bugs if the game price was low. Sometimes a low price meant that reviewers gave it a more balanced rating. The opposite was also true: reviewers expected more when the price was high:

*Not nearly enough content in the game to justify the current price.*

*I'll probably buy it again after they work out some of the bugs, or if the price comes down significantly.*

*For this small price, I give it a go!*

DISCUSSION

Principal findings

This study sought to learn from users’ reviews of VR exergames from the three most popular marketplaces, Steam, Viveport and Oculus. Thematic analysis revealed that VR can provide an immersive experience where the user feels fully present in the virtual environment and provides a distraction and alternative to conventional PA, while still providing exercise at an intensity equivalent to real world PA. However, poor game design can frustrate players and lead to non-use.

Players preferred games that were realistic (e.g. closely simulate real-world sport); games that are intuitive (in terms of the body movement and physics of the game, game mechanics and controls); games which provide gradual step-by-step increases in skill acquisition; games where there is either support (e.g. tutorial) or social support; and games where there is access to accessories or player options. Concordant with a 2011 review of the literature on exergames, which emphasised how exergames can help physical education courses and improve student’s physical and social outcomes, our current study also suggested exergames to be enjoyable technology that increase energy expenditure during play, motivate players to become more physically active, and promote social interaction [42]. We were not able to measure or discern player’s cognitive performance before and after playing VR exergames, but the aforementioned review also suggested exergaming (but not exclusively VR exergaming) to have the potential for positive cognitive effects such as problem solving, estimation, pattern recognition, memory and improved academic performance [42]. Music was a popular choice to increase fun, immersion and enjoyment of VR exergames. Players did not discuss weight loss but discussed fitness levels achieved as part of playing the VR exergames. Reviewers consistently reported that VR exergaming was providing a high level of exertion equivalent to real world exercise and that the immersion and enjoyment was a welcome distraction from the exertion. Discussions centred on playability and enjoyment of the VR exergames and the experience of playing them.

A portion of players did not feel they were getting value for money. The overall experience with the VR exergame was tied to the price of the game. Some games were judged as worth the price, and some games were acceptable and more enjoyable because they were offered at a discounted rate. More was expected from games with higher price points.

There were three themes in negative reviews: the first was around bugs that rendered games frustrating and sometimes unplayable. The quality of graphics had a particularly strong impact on perceived enjoyment. Reviewers disliked when games had overly complex controls and display functions that evoke motion sickness, which is a potential side effect in VR displays [43, 44].

These negative effects clash with VR’s potential to improve mood, visual-spatial skills, coordination, motivation and energy expenditure [34, 42] and as such careful consideration for the design features of the future exergames is paramount. What is particularly important is that the caloric expenditure, the end goal of the engagement with VR exergames, may be hampered by technological glitches and factors that can most likely only be modified by the designers of the games. Therefore, the first important factor is the design and the potential negative effects when designing a new VR exergame and taking user-feedback on board. In doing this, the designers are more likely to create a game which will flow and then also promote the state of “flow”, a state of absorption in the activity [45], which is a key factor in the attractiveness of exergames. Other important factors include balance of skill and the perceived challenge, clear goals and rules, fair feedback or guidance, a sense of personal control over the activity/game, loss of self-doubt or feelings of self-concern (loss of consciousness), transformation of time (losing sense of time and feeling absorbed), and autotelic experience (an activity undertaken for its own sake) [46]. The balance between making the game appealing to a wide variety of people when taking into account individual differences (e.g. age, disability status), may mean accepting that a great variety of choices are required, even within the same exergame to keep the game challenging, fun and novel [46]. Recently attempts have been made to maximize the individualisation using interactive deep reinforcement learning (iDRL), which allows the game to adapt to user preferences [47]. With the advances in the VR technology, the new generation headsets are promising a more intuitive experience by wearing lighter wireless gear [48]. This will especially influence the immersion and experience when playing active games, possibly influencing the speed of adaptation to the user and dynamic between the user and the technology. Personalisation and customisation have been studied in many contexts and have received various definition captures. Bloom (2000) defined it as a process which would change the system to increase personal relevance [49], either where this is system or person initiated. Some contexts described personalisation as “appropriate responsiveness” which is essentially doing the right thing at the right time- for the user, with the user [50]. In active games, the emphasis of personalisation is likely to concern several levels: i) accommodation of the individual differences (e.g. is someone visually impaired or do they have an injury?, are they prepared to train at higher training level than someone who wants to play at beginner level?), and with that ii) accommodating user goals (e.g. avoiding repetition, keeping interest) and then also making sure that some personalisation could happen on iii) the social or individual level where a player can express their identity (either through personalising themselves or the space in the game). Games could be thought of as a “prop” or “expressive equipment” used by the individual during their performance [49].

Limitations and future research

This study has a sufficiently large sample size [51, 52]. However, the user-submitted reviews may be biased because they could be from people who felt more strongly or passionately about the VR exergames, or who had something very particular to say. There were no demographic data about reviewers or their experience of playing VR games and as such we cannot draw any conclusions about the characteristics, motivations and overall VR experiences of reviewers. We also cannot infer the reviewer’s SES status. This may be one of the limitations, as well as possible avenues to explore in the future, but it is unclear whether people of differing SES would leave potentially different feedback. Research has shown that Pokémon Go affected the way people interacted, having to meet in person, as well as helping Nintendo’s economic position in the stock market, some of the ways in which exergame can change people’s social and economic behaviour [53].

Nor could we examine whether comments varied systematically by any individual differences between players. A study on affective and attentional states when running in a VR environment concluded that the effects of performing PA in a VR environment depend on individual difference factors (especially individual differences in presence and immersive tendencies) [54].

Looking ahead, it would be worth to explore other form-factors besides headset-only VR (ie. Virtusphere, Infinadeck, etc.) , which might present future research opportunities to compare platforms and or other training/exercise opportunities (e.g. healthcare, military, education, PTSD, etc.) [55,56]. Virtualsphere is especially designed locomotion platform where the user’s motion is collected as data and then replicated in the virtual environment [55]. Infinadeck is a 360-degree moving treadmill floor which allows for natural movement during a fully immersed VR gameplay, training or collaboration [57].

This study was an inductive thematic analysis with no a priori hypothesis or theory. It is difficult to draw conclusion with respect to whether these findings are transferable to all cultures or ages, and if these findings were an optimal reflection of the VR exergaming community. However, this relatively novel approach to thematic analysis allowed us to capture the views of a large number of users, and complements traditional qualitative interviewing approaches.

Conclusions

This thematic analysis indicates that VR exergames have good potential as a public health intervention, and gives specific advice on what a game should do (including the importance of price and building a relationship between developers and gaming community – issues often overlooked in a research or public health context). More research is necessary to determine which factors matter most across a wide range of exergame genres in the VR gaming space. It is not just the users, but also the developers and other scholars that will benefit from considerations of our research findings, but further investigations into factors liked by VR exergame engagement is necessary.

Acknowledgements

The vEngage study (https://vengagestudy.com/) was funded by the Medical Research Council (Grant number MR/R015430/1). We would also like to thank our adolescent steering committee who have helped shape the original idea for the study.

Conflicts of Interest

This research is sponsored by MRC industry partnership grant and leads to development of a VR game licensed by Six to Start. There is no legal, financial or commercial conflict with our industry partner company Six to Start.

References

1. UK Active. Turning the tide of inactivity. 2014. http://researchinstitute.ukactive.com/downloads/managed/Turning\_the\_tide\_of\_inactivity.pdf. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SGrNRZq
2. Reiner M, Niermann C, Jekauc D, Woll A. Long-term health benefits of physical activity – a systematic review of longitudinal studies. BMC Public Health 2013;13(1):813. PMID:24010994
3. Ekelund U, Ward HA, Norat T, Luan J, May AM, Weiderpass E, et al. Physical activity and all-cause mortality across levels of overall and abdominal adiposity in European men and women: the European Prospective Investigation into Cancer and Nutrition Study (EPIC). The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition 2015;101(3):613-21. PMID:25733647
4. Mueller N, Rojas-Rueda D, Cole-Hunter T, de Nazelle A, Dons E, Gerike R, et al. Health impact assessment of active transportation: A systematic review. Preventive medicine 2015;76:103-14. PMID:25900805
5. Sallis JF, Floyd MF, Rodriguez DA, Saelens BE. Role of built environments in physical activity, obesity, and cardiovascular disease. Circulation 2012;125(5):729-37. PMID:22311885
6. Chief Medical Officer. UK physical activity guidelines. Publications. no date. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/uk-physical-activity-guidelines. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SHn58vn
7. World Health Organisation. Prevalence of insufficient physical activity. no date. https://www.who.int/gho/ncd/risk\_factors/physical\_activity\_text/en/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SHufrAr
8. Thomson, K. UK physical activity guidelines. Sport England. 2011. https://www.nutrition.org.uk/attachments/504\_5.UK%20Guidelines%20for%20physical%20activity%20-%20principles%20and%20subtleties\_Kay%20Thomson.pdf. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SHzY9bq
9. Allender S, Foster C, Scarborough P, Rayner M. The burden of physical activity-related ill health in the UK. Journal of epidemiology and community health 2007;61(4):344-8. PMID:17372296
10. NHS Digital-Health Survey for England 2008: Physical activity and fitness. 2009. https://digital.nhs.uk/data-and-information/publications/statistical/health-survey-for-england/health-survey-for-england-2008-physical-activity-and-fitness. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SI9jwOY
11. Townsend P. Deprivation. Journal of Social Policy 2009;16(2):125-46. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1017/S0047279400020341
12. Kamphuis CB, Van Lenthe FJ, Giskes K, Huisman M, Brug J, Mackenbach JP. Socioeconomic status, environmental and individual factors, and sports participation. Medicine and science in sports and exercise 2008;40(1):71-81. PMID:18182936
13. HHS.gov. Facts and Statistics. Physical Activity. 2017. https://www.hhs.gov/fitness/resource-center/facts-and-statistics/index.html. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SINMgyC
14. Chau J, Chey T, Burks-Young S, Engelen L, Bauman A. Trends in prevalence of leisure time physical activity and inactivity: results from Australian National Health Surveys 1989 to 2011. Australian and New Zealand journal of public health 2017;41(6):617-24. PMID:28749561
15. Anjana RM, Pradeepa R, Das AK, Deepa M, Bhansali A, Joshi SR, et al. Physical activity and inactivity patterns in India - results from the ICMR-INDIAB study (Phase-1) [ICMR-INDIAB-5]. The international journal of behavioral nutrition and physical activity 2014;11(1):26. PMID:24571915
16. China NSO. 2018. http://data.stats.gov.cn/easyquery.htm?cn=C01. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SOCkXPc
17. UKIE. UK Video Games Fact Sheet October 2018. 2018. https://ukie.org.uk/research. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76SOH1i64
18. Renevey R. IAB games research shows games dominate. 2014. https://ukie.org.uk/news/2014/09/iab-games-research-shows-games-dominate. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TbXqwdq
19. Goodman W, McFerran E, Purves R, Redpath I, Beeken RJ. The Untapped Potential of the Gaming Community: Narrative Review. JMIR Serious Games 2018;6(3):e10161. PMID: 30274962
20. Limelight Networks. The state of online gaming 2018. 2018. https://www.limelight.com/resources/white-paper/state-of-online-gaming-2018/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TcxcH4M
21. Krause JM, Benavidez EA. Potential Influences of Exergaming on Self-efficacy for Physical Activity and Sport. Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance 2014;85(4):15-20. DOI: 10.1080/07303084.2014.884428
22. Nintendo.co. Top Selling Title Sales Units. 2018. https://www.nintendo.co.jp/ir/en/finance/software/3ds.html. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TeTDtAv
23. Pocketgamer.biz. Pokemon Go captures 800 million downloads. 2018. https://www.pocketgamer.biz/news/68209/pokemon-go-captures-800-million-downloads/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76Tg6R0wJ
24. Gao Z, Chen S, Pasco D, Pope Z. A meta-analysis of active video games on health outcomes among children and adolescents. Obesity reviews: an official journal of the International Association for the Study of Obesity 2015;16(9):783-94. PMID:25943852
25. Zeng N, Gao Z. Exergaming and obesity in youth: current perspectives. International journal of general medicine 2016;9:275-84. PMID:27536158
26. Sun H. Impact of exergames on physical activity and motivation in elementary school students: A follow-up study. Journal of Sport and Health Science 2013;2(3):138-45. DOI: 10.1016/j.jshs.2013.02.003
27. Lanningham-Foster L, Jensen TB, Foster RC, Redmond AB, Walker BA, Heinz D, et al. Energy expenditure of sedentary screen time compared with active screen time for children. Pediatrics 2006;118(6):e1831-5. PMID:17142504
28. Gao Y, Gerling KM, Mandryk RL, Stanley KG. Decreasing sedentary behaviours in pre-adolescents using casual exergames at school. Proceedings of the first ACM SIGCHI annual symposium on Computer-human interaction in play; 2014 Oct 19; Toronto, Ontario, Canada. ACM; 2014. DOI:10.1145/2658537.2658693
29. Staiano AE, Abraham AA, Calvert SL. Adolescent exergame play for weight loss and psychosocial improvement: a controlled physical activity intervention. Obesity (Silver Spring, Md). 2013;21(3):598-601. PMID:23592669
30. Staiano AE, Marker AM, Beyl RA, Hsia DS, Katzmarzyk PT, Newton RL. A randomized controlled trial of dance exergaming for exercise training in overweight and obese adolescent girls. Pediatric obesity 2017;12(2):120-8. PMID:26918815
31. Huang H-C, Wong M-K, Lu J, Huang W-F, Teng C-I. Can using exergames improve physical fitness? A 12-week randomized controlled trial. Comput Hum Behav 2017;70(C):310-6. DOI: 10.1016/j.chb.2016.12.086
32. Slater M W, M. A Framework for Immersive Virtual Environments (FIVE): Speculations on the Role of Presence in Virtual Environments. Presence Teleoperators and Virtual Environments 1997;6(6):603-16. DOI:10.1162/pres.1997.6.6.603
33. Witmer BG, Singer MJ. Measuring Presence in Virtual Environments: A Presence Questionnaire. Presence: Teleoperators and Virtual Environments 1998;7(3):225-40. DOI: 10.1162/105474698565686
34. Plante TG, Aldridge A, Bogden R, Hanelin C. Might virtual reality promote the mood benefits of exercise? Computers in Human Behavior 2003;19(4):495-509. DOI:10.1016/S0747-5632(02)00074-2
35. Statista.com. Virtual Reality (VR) - Statistics & Facts. 2018. https://www.statista.com/topics/2532/virtual-reality-vr/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TjvDfKu
36. DeSmet A, Thompson D, Baranowski T, Palmeira A, Verloigne M, De Bourdeaudhuij I. Is Participatory Design Associated with the Effectiveness of Serious Digital Games for Healthy Lifestyle Promotion? A Meta-Analysis. Journal of medical Internet research 2016;18(4):e94. PMID:27129447
37. Stawarz K, Cox AL, Blandford A. Don't forget your pill! Designing effective medication reminder apps that support users' daily routines. In: Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI ’14); 2014. New York, NY, USA: ACM; 2014. DOI:10.1145/2556288.2557079
38. Edwards C. Valve Lines Up Console Partners in Challenge to Microsoft, Sony. Bloombergcom/technology. 2013. https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2013-11-04/valve-lines-up-console-partners-in-challenge-to-microsoft-sony. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TkJOGMA
39. STEAM. Windows Mixed Reality for SteamVR. 2018. https://store.steampowered.com/app/719950/Windows\_Mixed\_Reality\_for\_SteamVR/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76TkL86yo
40. STEAM. Steam Support. 2018. https://help.steampowered.com/en/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/76Tl5DHxa
41. Braun V, Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology. 2006;3(2):77-101. DOI:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa
42. Staiano AE, Calvert SL. Exergames for Physical Education Courses: Physical, Social, and Cognitive Benefits. Child Development Perspectives 2011;5(2):93-8. PMID:22563349
43. Mazloumi Gavgani A, Walker FR, Hodgson DM, Nalivaiko E. A comparative study of cybersickness during exposure to virtual reality and “classic” motion sickness: are they different? Journal of Applied Physiology 2018;125(6):1670-80. PMID:30284516
44. Munafo J, Diedrick M, Stoffregen TA. The virtual reality head-mounted display Oculus Rift induces motion sickness and is sexist in its effects. Experimental Brain Research 2017;235(3):889-901. DOI:10.1007/s00221-016-4846-7
45. Csikszentmihalyi M. Beyond boredom and anxiety. Jossey-Bass: San Francisco, CA. 1975. ISBN: 9780787951405
46. Sinclair J, Hingston P, Masek M. Considerations for the design of exergames. Proceedings of the 5th international conference on Computer graphics and interactive techniques in Australia and Southeast Asia (GRAPHITE ’07); 2007 Dec 01-04; Perth, Australia. New York, USA: ACM; 2007. DOI:10.1145/1321261.1321313
47. Dobrovsky A BU, Hofmann M. Improving Adaptive Gameplay in Serious Games Through Interactive Deep Reinforcement Learning. Cognitive Infocommunications, Theory and Applications. Springer International Publishing 2018. 26:411-32. DOI:10.1007/978-3-319-95996-2\_19
48. Engaget. 2018. Oculus Predicts a VR future that includes ultra-thin headsets. https://www.engadget.com/2018/09/26/oculus-predicts-ultra-thin-vr-headsets/?guccounter=1&guce\_referrer\_us=aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuZ29vZ2xlLmNvbS8&guce\_referrer\_cs=QrYmOSa4ZCFBRHd29HDS9Q. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/77a4EOu79
49. Blom J. Personalisation – A Taxonomy. Proceeding of the CHI EA '00 Extended Abstracts on Human Factors in Computing Systems; 2000 April 1-6: 313-314. New York: ACM; 2000. DOI: 10.1145/633292.633483
50. Stiles WB, Horvath AO. Appropriate responsiveness as a contribution to therapist effects. In L. Castonguay C, Hill CE, editors. How and why are some therapists better than others?: Understanding therapist effects. Washington, DC, US: American Psychological; 2017. p. 71-84.
51. Fugard AJB, Potts HWW. Supporting thinking on sample sizes for thematic analyses: a quantitative tool. International Journal of Social Research Methodology 2015;18(6):669-84. DOI:10.1080/13645579.2015.1005453
52. Malterud K, Siersma VD, Guassora AD. Sample Size in Qualitative Interview Studies: Guided by Information Power. Qualitative Health Research 2016. 26(13), 1753–1760. PMID:26613970
53. Tickle G. 2016. An Examination of the Potential Socioeconomic Impact of Pokémon Go. https://laughingsquid.com/an-examination-of-the-potential-socioeconomic-impact-of-pokemon-go/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/77efuSCNW
54. Neumann DL, Moffitt RL, Thomas PR, Loveday K, Watling DP, Lombard CL, et al. A systematic review of the application of interactive virtual reality to sport. Virtual Reality 2018;22(3):183-98. DOI:10.1007/s10055-017-0320-5
55. Virtualspere, Inc. 2013. Virtual Sphere. http://www.virtusphere.com/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/77a5FrSmX
56. Metsis V, Smith KS, Gobert D. Integration of virtual reality with an omnidirectional treadmill system for multi-directional balance skills intervention. Proceedings of the International Symposium on Wearable Robotics and Rehabilitation (WeRob); 2017 Nov 5-8; Houston, USA: IEEE;2018. DOI: 10.1109/WEROB.2017.8383831
57. Infinadeck. n.d. Infinadeck Features. https://www.infinadeck.com/. Archived at: http://www.webcitation.org/77egmgFOO

Abbreviations

Artificial intelligence: AI

Head mounted display: HMD

Interactive deep reinforcement learning: iDRL

Moderate-to-vigorous physical activity: MVPA

Socio-economic status: SES

Physical activity: PA

Virtual reality: VR