**Transcript 15**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Interviewer name** | **XXXX** |
| **Sub-contractor organisation** | **ARU** |
| **Interview date** | **23 December 2020** |
| **Duration of interview audio recording** | **42 mins 53 secs** |
| **Face-to-face or virtual interview** | **Virtual** |
| **Interview participant** | |
| * **Code** | **P15** |
| * **Participant name** | **XXXX** |
| * **Organisation name** | **XXXX** |
| * **Gender** | **Female** |
| * **Stakeholder category** | **Development authority/planners/arch/engrs** |
| * **Country** | **Pakistan** |

INTERVIEWER: So, let me start. Basically, I will just go through a checklist with you first. You have signed the consent form?

RESPONDENT: Yes

INTERVIEWER: Through this interview we would request you to share your experience and expertise as someone who is working in the energy sector… no, but related urban sector as well as your views and opinions on gender equity in energy access.

RESPONDENT: Sure

INTERVIEWER: This interview is being recorded, you don’t have any issues with it right? Sorry the recorded interview would be transcribed for analysis and a copy of the transcript will be shared with you for your approval. All the information that we obtain serves the sole purpose of this study and will be seen only by the research team. Your name and any other identifying features will not be used anywhere, except reports or publications related to the study.

RESPONDENT: Ok.

INTERVIEWER: Roughly it will take us an hour. So let’s start.

RESPONDENT: Yes.

**PART 1**

INTERVIEWER: So can you briefly start by telling a bit about your current role and the organization that you work for.

RESPONDENT: Okay, so currently I’m working as a XXXX. This XXXX is responsible for planning and design of investment projects in xxx, so ranging from couple of large cities to intermediate cities to small size cities as well. So, we have a range ofcities for which we are doing planning, long-term planning and then identifying investment areas where the city is need of improvement of services.

INTERVIEWER: Right and can you tell me a bit about your background and how and why you got into this line of work.

RESPONDENT: Sure, basically I’m a Civil Engineer and while I was doing my under-grad, I had this submission that I won’t go for further studies, but then I started working. I started in a XXXXwhere we used to design xxx. While working there, I realized there is a lot of room available in urban services. Civil Engineers and planners are you know not focusing on long-term planning. So, I switched towards that side and then I went for my Doctorate from xxxx; so there I am just like more than two decades and now that I’m working in the services sector, urban services sector and water sanitation and solid waste management.

INTERVIEWER: Very nice and have you ever been involved with energy issues?

RESPONDENT: Domestic Issues or overall youre asking about the?

INTERVIEWER: Professionally have you ever worked with energy related…

RESPONDENT: Yes definitely, definitely because you know for the last few years when the whole country was going through that energy crisis. We had those long episodes of no electricity available at the organizational you know set up so we had to make certain arrangements, how to you know work effectively during eight to ten hours of our day, office timings and everything; so, it was quite difficult. We had sometimes battery down, we had temporary UPS system and everyone is you know scheduling according to when the electricity will be available and when it would not be available.

INTERVIEWER: Right. Have you worked on any energy related project? Or…

RESPONDENT: Yes absolutely. Because my main sector is services, energy is involved in every project as I am working on long-term projects. The XXXXis 25 years, even 50 years, so we always have to plan that how will it run. And the problems with energy you have in front of you, and you can observe how long this jas been going on. For example, when we do the planning for water supply systems, we have our complete infrastructure. We have to consider energy from the point of view of installing pumping stations or filteration plants, how will we meet the energy.

As I shared with you, even in our office we face the challenge of no electricity. This is specifically critical for the plants because there is a whole lot of population and service area depending on your service and then there is no light and no water also. So we have to plan what the alternate options will be. Two things that we have worked on quite a bit: xxxx. So there has been a lot of discussion on waste and energy in different cities. In large cities, we try to explore this avenue in long term, so that your waste is also disposed and you also get the energy by-product.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. Very nice. Excellent. Have you done any specific work on energy access in this?

RESPONDENT: Energy access for urban. This is a little easy for us because we are in the government sector so any request from the department goes as a formal request that execution phase of any project, this is our required demand for energy supply. And when the project is operational, the demand will be X. so it is a proper procedure, in which you have to send a request as an applicant. Then it is approved and you get a connection, the meter is installed and you are good to go.

INTERVIEWER: Right. Okay. Besides this, like you said that you have no direct link to energy access, but have you ever worked on an electrification project or program? Do you have any consideration for that in your projects?

RESPONDENT: Absolutely, it will always be there.

INTERVIEWER: How will it happen, can you please tell us?

RESPONDENT: So we do it like this. Electrical engineers in our team calculate the total requirement for the overall site designed, that what is the electricity requirement you need to meet for running an activity, or facility or implementing a project. This will include a complete calculation of how many transformers are required or grid energy and then you need to think of alternate solutions like generators will be required so all these calculations are completed first.

INTERVIEWER: This is for your project…

RESPONDENT: Yes, for the project.

INTERVIEWER: In addition to this, prior to the interview, you briefly mentioned about connection for electrical work in urban planning. How does that work, and which stage does the integration happen in? please elaborate on this.

RESPONDENT: when we are working in urban planning or development or growth, there will be study that it will be long term. We see the past trends of the cities development and then estimate that in the next 5, 10 or 15 years, which direction will it grow in. And that will also be different for example Area A will become more residential, housing societies will be developed and there will be some commercial activity. Area B will probably attract industrial set up, right. Area C may be public services, public spaces for recreational activities. When we are planning the city like this, we will calculate the overall requirement, right? What are the domestic requirements for household connections or electricit consumption? Industrial energy requirement will be calculated completely differently and the energy sources would also be different – they will not always be electrical, sometimes they are fuel fed hybrid solutions as well. So we indicate accordingly that which area will be energy intensive and where will be the demand in the city, and if that demand will be domestic or not. And we do this growth factor for every sector, we calculate the demand for water and transportation and for the electricity as well.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. In your work, which are the policies that are shaping the output, developing the work at national level and provincial level?

RESPONDENT: In Pakistan, there are some policies that are promulgated on national level. And if they don’t exist at provincial level, even then they are binding on us as they are at national level. For example, we have a lot of interaction with regards environmental regulations, so our environmental policy exists at national level. Then different provinces have devised their own, so here we can check it easily. If we are working in Punjab, we will look at the Punjab environment policy. If we are working in Sindh, then we will work according to Sindh policy. And overall you have the national policy as well. Like this, we have a separate policy for drinking water, climate change and you know how the sustainable development goals are connected to this, so we need to give all of these things consideration in our projects.

INTERVIEWER: Right, so do you see any challenges in this?

RESPONDENT: No, because my work is more towards to technical side of the projects so yes, I would say there are different sides. One is the regulatory side of implementation, the other is technical also. So there are regulatory challenges of course but technically also you can consider that we have a capacity gap, so you will not find the people everywhere who can understand all these things and apply them.

INTERVIEWER: Do you see any challenges besides this…

RESPONDENT: I think there are no challenges technologically, things are there for certain time of… you know when it is being used…and technology is advancing globally. So there are no technological challenges, like the capacity challenges that are there.

INTERVIEWER: Let’s go to part two, which is understanding of the issues.

**PART 2**

INTERVIEWER: So the first question is that what does equitable energy access mean to you?

RESPONDENT: Okay, equitable.. I think the definition is that if someone is getting what they require, it is equitable, okay. So for some people a lesser amount would be sufficient, and for some people you have to make much more effort to bring them as far as the rest of the people.

If you are asking in the local scenario, then equitable for example, we have established that electricity is a need right, it is not a luxury. So everyone’s need is equal, whether you are libing in a large city, or small city or in a rural area. So the person in the large city also need to power the lights and use the fan, and the person in the rural area also has to power the lights and uses the fan. So when you are supplying electricity and you say that you will supply the city for 18 hours and the rural area for 6 hours, then this is not equitable. From this, I establish that we are not giving equitable service.

INTERVIEWER: Right and what does gender equity in energy access mean to you?

RESPONDENT: I think with gender we assume that maybe in developing countries, there will be no gender equity. I don’t think there is any problem like this. When it comes to services, maybe yes, a few… like if you go in some offices, you feel the difference in access to information. Women’s access to information is slightly less or their access to services is less. But I don’t think electricity comes in that sector, I don’t think so.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, so do you think it should be a priority for policies and interventions to look for gender equity?

RESPONDENT: For electricity?

INTERVIEWER: Yes.

RESPONDENT: Oh! If you suggest so, because I am sharing things from my personal experience.

INTERVIEWER: Yes, we want the response from your personal experience exactly.

RESPONDENT: My personal experience in my personal capacity as well as my professional capacity has been that I have never felt that there has been a gender issue in my work.

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Tell us, how is demand determined in your sector? Whether it is energy or water, how is this demand calculated? Does your organization collect statistics or does any surveys or do you rely on government statistics?

RESPONDENT: Both things happen. Our own project engineers do their estimates and calculations and then when we submit this to the department for energy requirement, they do their own diligence on it to ensure that our working on the requirement has not been over estimated or under estimated. So there is a confirmation on both sides.

INTERVIEWER: And do you have any idea on what basis this is done, and what are the parameters considered? Is gender considered when determining this?

RESPONDENT: Since our projects are in the urban sector and focused on services, our maximum effots are to ensure that we improve the access to service for our vulnerable population. So obviously gender is already covered because uptill now, we have seen that poor people of the society and families which are led by women face problems in access to service. So we specifically make it a point to cover them, so that our services here gradually become equitable. So electricity is also covered in this.

INTERVIEWER: Can you give an example how you are doing this?

RESPONDENT: we always have surveys. We start with the feasibility studies and surveys and data collection, so we have to identify the areas specifically. We go on ground and then calculate existing baseline level of service, data is collected and then we have to link it that at the end of our project, how much will we have increased this level.

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Very nice. How equitable is energy access at community and household level in terms of gender do you think? This is your opinion.

RESPONDENT: According to gender I would say it is equitable.

INTERVIEWER: Can you please elaborate this?

RESPONDENT: Let me give you 2-3 examples. As I mentioned, if you look at the domestic level or commercial level or industrial level, in all of these three units, if they are owned by a female, she would be given equal priority to avail the service. So personally, I know that the house I live in is owned by a female, since day 1, the electricity connection is in her name. she never faces any problem that she will not get electricity because she is a female or something. Similarly, a very close friend of mine, who runs a commercial activity, a boutique, she has never had any problem that she is not getting electricity at her shop. Like this, if a women owns an industry or something as long as you complete your paperwork, you will not face any problem in getting an electricity connection.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, tell us how does gender effect the way energy is used in households?

RESPONDENT: Sorry. Could you repeat that question?

INTERVIEWER: How does gender effect the way energy is used inside homes?

RESPONDENT: Oh, I think this is a very important question. Inside homes, maybe because I am this obsessive, compulsive that close the light, why is the fan on, electricity shouldn’t be wasted type, I think all of these components are more in the minds of females. So I have seen many people doing this energy conservation. Females are good at realizing if something is being wasted, they have better management skills.

And second, if you are the one who has to pay the bill. And in Pakistan you know electricity is quite expensive, so you would go for energy conservation. When you are a female and you get the bill, then you will always opt for energy conservation. I know this, I have installed solar panels in my own home. And the reason for that is primarily – oh, not only solar panels, I have installed a smart meter as well so as long as energy is being produced and not used at my property, it is being sent to the grid. It is good from awareness point of view and for taking initiative that people are going in that direction.

INTERVIEWER: Very nice. Can you tell us about the responsibility allocation between males and females with regards household chores, based on your opinion and experience?

RESPONDENT: I don’t think we can apply any universal aspect on this and I can’t give a sweeping statement that women are doing household chores and men are working outside the home, it is no more like that. So both are working outside and both are working inside the home as well. Around me, there are many people who are really supportive towards their female housemothers, they help them out in the chores as well.

If you allow, I would also like to mention 1-2 more things. I have seen and maybe you have also seen that when you are trying to give women empowerment.. you can see that females are driving cars in our bigger cities, larger cities and also motorbikes, which is very encouraging. It is good to see that this is our society and we are moving beyond those so called taboos that a girl is riding a bike. We have moved beyond these.

INTERVIEWER: Absolutely. Excellent … okay, do men and women use energy differently. Do you think?

RESPONDENT: No, I don’t think so. As long as it’s a service and you’re paying for it, then I think, people are careful about how they use it.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, there is a specific question here. How does gender relate to energy access in specific domain challenges such as clean cooking?

RESPONDENT: Hmm. Like you are talking about clean energy?

INTERVIEWER: Yes, because cooking is part of sustainable development goal 7, basically to do with affordable and clean technologies. And UN also looks at the cooking technologies. Do you think gender has a specific role in that?

RESPONDENT: Like I said, technologically… nothing stops us in terms of technology, okay. Now the issue is of access to technology right, so if you have access to those gadgets and apparatuses are present, and if you have to choose within a range of options, which one will you choose? So in our developing countries, the first decision making will be if you have access to the demand right, so do you have those kinds of stoves, or cooking range for cooking?

Then the next question comes since we are again a developing country so where do we stand economically. So if it is a gas stove, is gas coming or is it a coal based stove, or is it electrical so what is the thing that is most insured for you as a service?

And then how cheap is it? So these things will always come in decision making, and to move forward, we are only bound by these two parameters and there is no reason that we are lagging behind in anything.

INTERVIEWER: does gender play any role in this?

RESPONDENT: It should. I remember one of our elders who used to cook on coal. She used to have a bad time coughing and the ill health she faced. As long as they have decision power that which stove they want to buy and 2-3 different options are available to them, then they would always go for the best.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. So the next question is that do different groups of women benefit from access to energy differently for example does energy use or access differ among older and younger women, Income groups, uhm where they based in the community or their religious, ethnic and cultural groups.

RESPONDENT: Oh of course! Even if the last ones are not there, religious, cultural differences are not there, the first few factors you mentioned are definitely yes.

INTERVIEWER: Meaning based on age, income and where they are based in the community you have already differentiated. Would you like to add something to this?

RESPONDENT: See, like when you have a comfort zone for something… if you are cooking on a cooking range or electric cooker, and somehow I know I have to go for a gas cylinder stove, then I will be uncomfortable as I don’t know how it works and I have to adjust accordingly. So this will affect my decision making. This links with age in terms of how long I have been cooking lke this or using this. Rest, I don’t think there is culturally any thing, if I belong to a rural village in Punjab, then I will for sure have to use a clay stove.

INTERVIEWER: And from the context of energy access, meaning is energy access different for them?

RESPONDENT: From the access point of view, it is the same thing that if the infrastructure is present or not. If the infrastructure is present it does not make a difference.

INTERVIEWER: okay. What key energy… Okay, you don’t have any direct link with this because you don’t provide energy, you accommodate it. Okay, then tell us, when new energy infrastructure and technology are provided what in your view are the differences between men and women in terms of who benefits?

RESPONDENT: Overall, I think in the service sector, specially, when you are giving service, then you are providing service for an entire area, an entire settlement, or a city or a rural settlement. It is not dirven by how many people are here and how many women here own houses so this way the sector is not discriminated at all.

INTERVIEWER: Right. So for example your work related to water, when you are providing access to water, there is no consideration like this?

RESPONDENT: That will always be positive in the sense that we will look at those areas where femalses need to travel 2km or more to collect water. That would be a priority that in this area, women need to make a lot of effort to go and bring water so they should be supplied with water first.

INTERVIEWER: So actually you consider the most vulnerable for this like you said. Ok. So then please answer this question as well, does it matter what the infrastructure is and how it is provided?

RESPONDENT: Please repeat this.

INTERVIEWER: does it matter what the infrastructure is and how it is provided? In terms of men and women.

RESPONDENT: Yes, for our service definitely.

INTERVIEWER: do men and women participate equally in energy access and technologies and purchase.

RESPONDENT: I have seen so. If you have any doubt that women are not vocal, then let me tell you they are very vocal. As long as they’re benefitting, they are very good at you now speaking out.

INTERVIEWER: And specically focusing on financial decisions, do you think men and women are equal in decision making?

RESPONDENT: Financial decisions again for the same services, like I mentioned if its for cooling, then obviously if they get more comfort then they will say I need this thing. If they are financially dependent then they will ask in a sense that I need this, but please see how we can manage this and then it is prioritized.

INTERVIEWER: so is energy access different between urban and rural context?

RESPONDENT: as I said right at the start, that area specific there is no equity.

INTERVIEWER: can you elaborate this a bit please.

RESPONDENT: We experienced this specifically during the energy crisis, we were promising people living in the cities a certain time during which electricity would be available. In comparison, rural is not at all equitable. Recently, there have been 1-2 policy changes and I would say the large cities are now sort of equitable but that is based on paying for your service. So if the DISCOs have 80% or better rate of electricity charges collection in an reas, then there will be less loadshedding there. So I think this is equitable service, right. As long as you’re paying for the service you have the right to get that service so this applies in several places.

INTERVIEWER: do you consider any difference in gender equity in energy access from urban and rural point of view?

RESPONDENT: I think this is the same thing that this is universal.

**PART 3**

INTERVIEWER: Okay, let’s move to part 3 which is about policies and intervention. To what exent does gender equity factor in on your own work in energy access. Like we discussed, do you consider it in your own projects?

RESPONDENT: in our services, specially water sanitation and solid waste management, we see which areas of the cities have vulnerable population, or where the access to service is difficult, then we prioritize those first. And in prioritizing them, our 2-3 main considerations are females, so gender specific. Occassionaly there are minorities and poorer people in the society from urban slums or something like that who we target so that we can provide equitable service. So for us, the entire scope in the area that we have to work is that access to service should be equitable.

INTERVIEWER: Right. Please give some examples of any project that you have done like this. Your own example.

RESPONDENT: We can take the example of 1 or 2 projects. For example there is an area, where we did a study regarding the water supply. The area will get 18 hours of water supply and the slum area next to it will get 8 hours of supply. So it is apparent that the infrastructure provided to both and then the capacity to pay of both areas is different. So we have to manage that, how do we give them better service and also subsisdize their inability to pay and we need to design the project accordingly.

INTERVIEWER: and how effective do you think your efforts are towards gender equity?

RESPONDENT: I think we are moving more and more towards gender empowerment and equity. We are considering these things from every angle so that is promising.

INTERVIEWER: and thinking beyond your specific your work do you think energy access polices in your country or region should be gender sensitive.

RESPONDENT: if I thought they were gender biased, I would have said yes. I don’t feel them to be gender biased myself, but still, if there is any side missing, it should be covered.

INTERVIEWER: and do you think there are any policy gaps against women at local, international level?

RESPONDENT: I don’t think so. International I can’t confirm.

INTERVIEWER: Yes, please talk about local.

RESPONDENT: But, yes, locally I don’t think so.

INTERVIEWER: There are no policy gaps? Okay, do you think there are any social policies that have an impact on energy equity?

RESPONDENT: I think a lot of work is going into this at the moment. Like we have 1-2 departments like women welfare, social welfare – they follow up these things quite aggressively. When any policy is being devised, they definitely consider the gender aspect so I think they are doing a fine job and things are happening.

INTERVIEWER: Any other policy you think affects energy access, it doesn’t have to be an energy policy, it can be any other social policy…

RESPONDENT: No, nothing comes to my mind.

INTERVIEWER: Okay, you have already indicated this, but I want to ask this again. Imagine for a second, there are no financial or policy contsraints. So, what in your view will be the best practice in achieving gender equity in energy access? Or energy use?

RESPONDENT: That is exactly what I am saying to you, I don’t think there is such a thing, such a situation. However, if we feel that there is something like this, so like I told you about my projects, that you should set a target and then subsidize the financial cost to provide support. For example, if you receive an application… let’s assume a scenario that you receive an application for an electricity and the property is owned by or the applicant is a female, so you can score or rank her better than someone elese, so you can adjust this like this.

**PART 4**

INTERVIEWER: Okay, this is the last section. First question is how balanced is gender representation is various decision making bodies, in governance structures?

RESPONDENT: In comparison to what, men? Obviously, men are a part of gender but we have broken this as well, we don’t only have two genders. Transgenders are also part of this and there are people who would not like to claim any gender so our community is well aware. But I was asking for a reference that are you talking about local context in comparison with developed countries or what?

INTERVIEWER: No, if our energy departments or divisions, make the representation 50-50 within our governance structure, what do you think about it? Tell us about your department, what is the female’s ratio there?

RESPONDENT: 40% in our department, very good percentage of females who are professionals. Even in decision making, for so many decisions, my boss would rely on me, that you do it, it is ok. So I think we have an empowering environment as well as an encouraging one, and professionalism with these things is much better. Even if you look in governance representatives, Pakistan is never bad in percentages, whether women are coming into the electoral representatives on quota or whatever. We are probably the best, we have at least 33% women for sure. So if you are looking at policy from the legislature to the government house and then the rest.

I myself teach in couple of institutions where government sector, the government officers are groomed. I’ve been seeing consistent rise in women who are coming in, so if I look at this, eventually they are going into decision making areas. They will go in department office and they will be getting things done. So women participation and decision making is improving quite a lot for us.

INTERVIEWER: This is your own experience in urban planning?

RESPONDENT: No, I am telling you overall. The government officers I told you about, that I train, they come in through a competitive process. And in that, in the last 10 years - I have been teaching since the last ten years – I have seen a gradual increase or sort of disproportional increase in women. They are coming into decision making positions so number of men has decreased, as there are more than 50% of females.

INTERVIEWER: which classes do you take for government officers?

RESPONDENT: I am talking about xxxx

INTERVIEWER: okay, what do you think about the energy sector? What is the ration of women in energy sector?

RESPONDENT: All of my previous colleagues who have worked in the sector, I think they are all in their jobs and if I consider seniority, they are all on quite senior positions.

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Do you have any idea about energy acces finance? There is one question here related to finance.

RESPONDENT: Not sure. Not sure.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, fine. Is gender reflected in energy policies in Pakistan? Does gender play a role in Pakistan’s Alternative and Renewable Energy policy or any other planning policy?

RESPONDENT: Role play is from the start. We consider them as our project is designed from participatory approach and we ensure right there that how many women should participate in the project. This comes in play at the time of designing. And when we do social service, we cover the number of male headed households and female headed households so gender has to be accommodated.

**PART 5**

INTERVIEWER: Ok. We are at the end. Any other comments you would like to add?

RESPONDENT: No, thank you so much. Thank you for considering me for participation in this survey. I hope it was helpful for you.